



Appendix 3

Recommendations Summary Table, Responses to original Governance Review proposals

This page is intentionally left blank

Appendix 3a - Governance Review Recommendations: Summary Table

	Summarised Recommendation
General Principles	
1.	Number of Committees: creation of any sub-committee or working party be subject to the submission of a business case to the Policy & Resources Committee, outlining the justification, resourcing requirements, life expectancy / sunseting arrangements, and clear terms of reference
2.	Greater control over Terms of Reference: annual cycle of the review of Terms of Reference be revised to provide more time for review. Changes to require written submissions making the case for changes.
3.	Limits on numbers of Committees considering items: other than in exceptional circumstances, all reports be subject to approval by a maximum of one 'corporate' committee, one 'service' or 'institutional' committee, and one relevant sub-committee (together with the Court of Common Council if the matter is of significance enough to breach the thresholds specified by Standing Orders)
4.	Sub-Committees: sub-committees to be given greater decision-making powers
5.	Sequencing: a more fixed committee cycle, set several years ahead and with firmer rules on meeting dates
6.	Delegated Authority arrangements: if the Committee is aware of an imminent report which cannot await the next meeting, there should be a greater use of e-mail to provide sight of such items to Committee Members and seek comments, so as to inform the Chair and Deputy Chair's final view via the consultation arrangements (and the subsequent decision)
7.	Agenda and 'information' items: committees move to a three-tiered arrangement for reports: For Decision, For Discussion (i.e. those information items where debate should be focused), and For Information (i.e. those which are simply to be noted or received in accordance with requirements and where there is to be no discussion at the meeting unless prior notice is provided or the leave of the committee is sought). For information items should also be removed from the primary agenda pack and created as a supplementary agenda
8.	Workplans: forward agenda plans be implemented as a matter of course for every Grand Committee
9.	Minutes and reports: committee minutes to be streamlined where possible, although still capturing the balance of discussion where appropriate. Court minutes to remain in their current format.
10.	Scheme of Delegations: introduction of standardised reporting on actions taken under enhanced delegations, once / if implemented

11.	Standing Orders: a thorough review be undertaken
12.	Term limits: individual committees to be asked to review introduction of term limits
13.	Multiple memberships: limit on memberships be decreased from 8 to 6; however, the existing practice whereby this limit be waived when a vacancy is re-advertised should be continued
14.	Chair and Deputy Chair arrangements: for outgoing Chairs, removal of the automatic right to Deputy Chairmanship as currently conferred by SO30(3)(a). (The individual remains eligible to serve as Deputy Chair but by election only)
15.	Reference Sub-Committees: all standing Reference Sub-Committees be abolished
16.	Committee size: all non-Ward committees be asked to consider their compositions with a view to reducing numbers
17.	Ward Committees: with the exception of Markets Committee, all Ward Committees to retain this status
18.	Lead Members: Use of lead Members to be encouraged
19.	Governance & Nominations: such a committee should not be established, but instead a central skills and experience register be created, which would be available for Members to review in advance of any committee election. All committees also be asked to provide the Court with an indication of any particular skills, expertise, or background where expressions of interest from applicants would be particularly welcome, informed by such skills audits as deemed appropriate by the relevant committee.
Corporate Committees	
Policy & Resources	
20.	Review of ex-officio membership, although avoiding reducing the number of Members elected directly by the Court
21.	Current arrangement whereby there are three Deputy Chairs, should be dispensed with and the Committee should revert to having one designated Deputy Chair (although not to be seen as confirmation of successor until the final year of that term, as present). A greater use of Lead Members to be employed.
22.	Resource Allocation Sub-Committee: retain as is, but with greater power to act
23.	Capital Buildings Board: to replace Capital Buildings Committee with continuation of existing composition, and ability to establish small dedicated task and finish groups as it deems appropriate
24.	Public Relations Sub-Committee: change of name to Communications Sub-Committee

25.	Civic Affairs Sub-Committee: a new committee replacing HWP, Members' Privileges Sub, Outside Bodies Sub, Ceremonials WP, MFAWP, and Benefices Sub-Committee within this
26.	Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee: combining the Corporate Asset Sub-Committee with Project Sub-Committee as a joint Sub-Committee of Policy & Resources and Finance. Consideration also given to merging with the Procurement Sub-Committee
27.	Equity, Diversity & Inclusion Sub-Committee: a new committee replacing MDWP and TRT, possibly as a joint Sub-Committee of Establishment and Policy & Resources
28.	Culture Mile Working Party: to be abolished, with the Culture Committee absorbing its remit
29.	All Sub-Committees to be chaired by the Policy Chair directly or their nominee
Finance Committee	
30.	Virtual access to meetings for officers and the public
31.	Corporate Asset Sub-Committee: merger with Projects Sub-Committee to form joint Sub-Committee
32.	Digital Services Sub-Committee: to become a standalone service committee with additional responsibility for information governance
33.	Finance Grants Oversight and Performance: to be abolished, with annual reporting of Benefits-in-Kind and the Central Grant Programme being taken to the Finance Committee
34.	Procurement: consideration be given to merger with Projects Sub and Corporate Asset Sub Committees
Investment Committee	
35.	Abolishment of Investment Committee
36.	Property Investment Board and Financial Investment Board to continue as joint Sub-Committees of Policy & Resources, Finance and the Bridge House Estates Board, with each nominating representatives and a number of places reserved for direct election by the Court
Pensions Committee	
37.	Creation of a new body to have responsibility for the management, administration, and investments of the City's Pension Fund

Capital Buildings Committee	
38.	To cease as a Grand Committee and become a sub-committee of Policy & Resources, with delegated powers to act
39.	Small number of joint meetings of (or briefings to) the Policy & Resources Committee, Capital Buildings Sub-Committee, Projects & Operational Property Sub-Committee, Bridge House Estates Board, and Property Investment Board be held (with Chairs of other Committees invited as relevant or appropriate), at which the City Surveyor and Chamberlain shall be asked to present overarching analyses of the City Corporation's activities across all property-related workstreams
Establishment Committee	
40.	Consider changing name to reflect Corporate Services functions
Service Committees	
Markets Committee	
41.	To be changes from a Ward to a non-Ward committee
42.	Reduction in membership to a maximum of 15 Members, all to be elected directly from the Court, although any Members with tenancies at any of the markets be ineligible from serving
43.	Future of the committee be subject to review upon delivery of the new Markets site
Culture, Heritage & Libraries Committee	
44.	Consider Benefices Sub-Committee being included in agglomerated sub-committee of Policy & Resources (Civic Affairs Sub-Committee)
Community & Children's Services Committee	
45.	Move housing functions into standalone committee incorporating both the housing-related responsibilities of this committee together with those of the Barbican Residential Committee
Barbican Residential Committee	
46.	Establish a dedicated Consultation Group where representatives of all key stakeholders can meet regularly to discuss and help monitor ongoing and emerging developments across the Estate
47.	Similar arrangements to be established across the other Corporation Estates

48.	Formal remit of the committee to be relocated to a new Housing Committee, with meetings arranged such as to provide dedicated scrutiny for Barbican matters
49.	Newly constituted Committee asked to present formal proposals relating to resident involvement in service charge
Housing Committee	
50.	New committee be established absorbing both the housing responsibilities of Community & Children's Services Committee (and its Housing Management and Almshouses Sub-Committee) and the remit of the Barbican Residential Committee
51.	The new committee to meet on a monthly basis, with agendas arranged such as to allow for consideration of Barbican Residential business and current Housing Management business on an alternate meeting basis
52.	Membership of 12-15 and ensuring sufficient representation at meetings by Members of Wards within which relevant housing estates are located
Statutory Bodies and Others	
Crime & Disorder Scrutiny Committee	
53.	Be required to resume activity and meet on at least an annual basis
54.	A report proposing refreshed arrangements – both in respect of the Crime & Disorder Scrutiny Committee and the Safer City Partnership Strategy Group – to be submitted
Freedom Applications Committee	
55.	To be become a Sub-Committee of Policy & Resources
Education and Cultural Institutions	
Independent Schools	
56.	School Boards be asked to review and propose revised Board composition and appointment arrangements which they feel would best meet with their requirements in providing strategic oversight moving forwards
57.	Clerking responsibility to move to the Boards, with a joint Clerk for both the Boys' and Girls' Schools
58.	Replication of the voluntary application of rules based upon Local Government regulations (as required for all current Grand Committees) to be dispensed with
Guildhall School of Music & Drama	

59.	Board of Governors be asked to review and propose a revised Board composition which it feels would best meet with the conservatoire's requirements, possibly including the disapplication of Local Government-based regulations around access to meetings
Open Spaces	
60.	Existing consultative bodies continue to operate but cease to be maintained by the Committee & Member Services Section; instead, being operated on a more informal basis administered by the local service area
61.	Wanstead Park Working Party to be abolished
62.	Epping Forest Management Plan Steering Group should be dissolved for the time-being (noting it may be re-established on request if and when it is required)

Appendix 3b – Lisvane Governance Review Recommendations: Summary Table and Proposed Responses

	Summarised Recommendation	Para. Ref. number	Accepted?
Opening Comments			
1.	Ward Structure – no change	49	Yes
2.	COA/COCO relationship – no change	54	Yes
3.	Livery/Common Hall relationship – no change	55	Yes
4.	Departmental business plans – share and coordinate across departments	108	Yes
5.	Establish Chief Operating Officer post	110	Yes - new post already appointed to.
6.	Number of Common Councillors to remain unchanged for now	122	Yes
7.	Increased engagement with employers in electoral process	127	Yes - already in progress.
8.	More diversity amongst Members in outward facing activities	139	Yes
9.	Improved professional diversity training for Members and Committee appointments conditional upon compliance	140	Partial - diversity training not to be mandatory but available and accessible to all Members upon election.

Standing Orders (Court Proceedings)			
10.	Housekeeping of Standing Orders	147	Yes - all of the below to be considered in a general housekeeping exercise.
11.	Amend SO 10 – allowing open and recorded ballots	149	
12.	Amend SO 12.5 to require Court permission to withdraw motion	151	
13.	Various SO changes associated with questions at Court	152-156	
14.	Repeal SO 26 - setting TORs	157	
15.	Amend SO 28 – refer to joint meetings	158	
16.	Amend SO29.6, 30.7, 30.8 – allow for open and recorded ballots	159	
17.	Establish general quorum provision for Committees, Sub-Committees and joint meetings	160 & 161	
18.	Record names of Members voting in divisions in Committee	162	
19.	Allow for a single Member to call for Divisions/recorded votes	163	
20.	Immediate move to paperless	168	
21.	Virtual access to meetings for officers and the public	174	Yes - continuation of existing streaming arrangements in interests of transparency already agreed.

Competitiveness			
22.	Competitiveness Committee principles - TORs, membership, structures	189 & 192	Yes - although not a grand committee, instead an Advisory Board reporting to P&R.
23.	Abolish Hospitality Working Party; Competitiveness Committee to take on HWP functions	191	No - HWP to be merged to create new Civic Affairs Sub-Committee, but CAB views on strategic use of hospitality to be welcomed.
24.	P&R to absorb PRED's public relations responsibilities	193	No - a P&R Sub-Committee to continue to exist focusing on public relations issues.
25.	Enhanced officer support to CPR	194	Yes - new post of Executive Director, Private Secretary to Chair of Policy & Resources appointed.
26.	CPR title to be changed to 'Chair of Policy'	199	No - to be reviewed at a later date.
27.	Appraisal process – keep under review	215	N/A
28.	Corporation to ensure personal finances do not become inhibition to seeking Mayoralty	224	N/A - support arrangements already in place.

Committees (see appendix F for structure)			
29.	Committee reports – shorter in length, clearly identified decision	238	Yes
30.	Streamline minutes	239	Partial - some modest streamlining but only where inspection regimes / regulatory requirements permit; no change to Court minutes.
31.	Cancel meetings with little substantive business	240	Yes
32.	Revisit TORs of all Committees to improve clarity and reduce overlap	242	Yes
33.	Avoid allowing establishing Sub-Committees to become the norm - make these the exception	243	Yes (proposals for new bodies subject to approval of business case)
34.	Repeal SO27(1)(a) – no general Committee should have power to establish a Sub-Committee	244	Yes (proposals for new bodies subject to approval of business case)
35.	Informal Member Briefings for Committee Members to update on key issues faced by officers	246	Yes, where appropriate
36.	Member Briefings by Committees to update the Court on key issues	247	Yes, where appropriate
37.	Periodic training for Chairs	248	Yes (to be made available as required)
38.	Appraisal for Chairs	249	Yes (light-touch)
39.	No re-advertising for Committee vacancies - vacancies to remain until somebody expresses an interest	250	No - vacancies to continue to be advertised in appropriate manner.
40.	Green impact assessment with every policy or project proposal for Committee	251	N/A - already being implemented.
41.	Assign climate issues to a lead Committee	252	N/A - already implemented.
42.	Establish Governance & Nominations Committee	256	No
43.	Discontinue distinction between Grand and Service Committees	266	N/A

44.	Committees should have no more than 15 Members, (optimum size between 12 and 15)	269	Partial - moving to reduce committee membership where possible but adapting this number according to the needs of the individual committee.
45.	Abolition of Ward Committee structure - amend SO23 and 24 to reflect	271 -272	No – Ward Committees to be retained where appropriate.
46.	Service limitations - limit of service on 2 Committees, excluding membership of institution Boards, with this being 4 for those who have ex officio membership roles	273 – 275	No (partial) – reduce existing limitation from 8 to 6, but continue allowances for this to be waived if a vacancy has been open for a period of time.
47.	Service on outside bodies - no change	276	Yes.
48.	All Chairmanship terms to be four years	277	No - varying terms adopted for specific purposes to be retained.
49.	Chair ending a term of office should not be eligible to re-join that Committee during the successor's term of office, including amending SO 30.3a	278	No – instead, outgoing chairs should be subject to election (if wishing to serve as Deputy Chair) but otherwise no limitations unless expressly sought by individual committees.
50.	Service length limits / bar on re-joining - 8 years maximum service with 4 years to pass before re-joining (excluding ex-officio roles), including amendment of SO 24	280	No
51.	Terms of reference review should be separated from appointment of committees, with any amendment to ToRs (including a request to establish a Sub-Committee) to be considered by the Court only following a recommendation by the Governance and Nominations Committee.	282	Partial - agreed but proposals (including the establishment of a Grand Committee or Sub-Committee or changes to the terms of reference of a Grand Committee or Sub-Committee) to continue via P&R.
52.	There should be no bar, formal or by convention, to an Alderman being Chair of any Committee.	284	No change to existing arrangements
53.	P&R - various changes to membership arrangements / composition (including ex-officios, removal of residential requirement, number of deputy chairs)	290 – 296	Committee to be asked to review its ex-officio arrangements Reversion to having a single Deputy Chair.

			Use of lead Members endorsed. Arrangements for consistency of Chairing (i.e. CPR or their nominee)
54.	P&R Sub-Committee - various recommendations as to abolition / mergers	297	Partial – several mergers proposed
55.	Investment Committee to be absorbed into the Finance Committee (FIB aspects)	298	Partial – IC to be abolished, joint meetings of relevant committees to replace and enhance investment strategy development and monitoring process. PIB and FIB to become joint sub-committees of P&R and Finance (and BHE Board if appropriate), allowing for greater co-ordination and transparency across the three funds and a more coherent overall approach.
56.	Finance Sub-Committees - various recommendations as to abolition / mergers	298	Partial - transfer of Digital Services to become a Grand Committee; merger of Corporate Asset Sub-Committee (and potentially Procurement Sub-Committee) with Projects Sub-Committee to create a new joint sub-committee for Operational Property, Projects, and Procurement; abolition of Finance and Grants Oversight Sub-Committee.
57.	Social Investment Board – to be abolished / folded into new BHE Committee	299	Yes - already implemented.
58.	Creation of a new Property Committee to bring together all the City's property functions	300-303	No
59.	Audit and Risk Management Committee to take on the responsibilities of the Efficiency and Performance Sub-Committee	305	No
60.	Planning & Transportation Committee – reduced membership, introduction of panels with service rules, protocol changes	306 – 317	Being pursued separately.
61.	PHES - no change	318	Yes

62.	Markets Committee – to be abolished	319	No - instead to cease being a Ward Committee, with commensurate reduction in size to 12-15 Members. Review of continued operation to take place once new consolidated Markets Site delivered.
63.	Crime and Disorder Scrutiny Committee - no change	323	Yes - although requires review of composition and commencement of annual meeting cycle.
64.	Culture Heritage & Libraries – name to be simplified to “Culture Committee” and Keats House Consultative Committee abolished.	324	No – retain Consultative Committee (NB – it is also proposed to remove responsibility for the LMA and establish a separate Board for that).
65.	Education Board - no change	330	Yes
66.	CCS - no change	331-332	Partial - removal of housing function to create new Housing Committee.
67.	Gresham (City Side) - no change	333	Yes
68.	Establishment Committee – to be abolished, responsibilities absorbed by new Governance & Nominations Committee	339	No – to be retained, prospective name change to “Corporate Services Committee”; proposed joint new Inclusion Sub-Committee (with P&R, replacing two existing Working Parties).
69.	Open Spaces & City Gardens – all current related committees to be merged into one, Wanstead Park Working Party to be abolished and name to be simplified to ‘Open Spaces Committee’	345 – 351	No – grand committees to be retained, opportunity to devolve consultative committees to local areas and remove from formal structures to be pursued. (Although Wanstead Park WP to be abolished due to lack of requirement).
70.	Barbican Residential Committee – to be abolished	356	Yes - with creation of new Housing Committee with dedicated regular meetings for BRC matters.
71.	Creation of a Bridge House Estates Committee, replacing City Bridge Trust Committee	372	Yes - already implemented.
72.	Licensing Committee – no change	374	Yes.
73.	Health & Wellbeing Board / Health & Social Care Scrutiny Committee – no change	375	Yes – although changes to HWB likely to be required in due course pending changes to legislation.
74.	Local Govt Pensions Board – no change.		Yes – noting that a separate Pensions Committee is also now required to meet regulatory expectations around pensions.

75.	Move of various functions to new Governance & Nominations Committee, allowing abolition / merger of other committees/subs (including digital services, diversity, Standing Orders, Member training, senior appointments etc.)	377	No - various areas continuing in remit of current committees or diverted to other appropriate committees.
76.	Reference Sub-Committees to be abolished	378 – 380	Yes.
77.	Review / recalibration of delegations to officers and introduction of regular reviews	381 -385	Yes – review underway.
Standards			
78.	To establish an independent panel (with requisite changes to SOs as set out)	425 & 428	Yes - broadly agreed to, with a variation approved by the Court in January 2021 (see report for further) establishing an independent panel to manage complaints and appeals, operating a three-stage process.
79.	Present arrangements to remain in place until new Independent Panel has been recruited; thereafter, Standards Committee and Standards Appeals Committee to be abolished.	435-436	Yes - independent panel now recruited and Standards Committee and Standards Appeals Committee abolished.
80.	The whole of the Register of Interests should be available on dedicated pages on the website.	438	Yes - to be implemented as soon as practicable.
81.	Training on standards and conduct matters should be mandatory, and without which no Member should be appointed to a Committee.	441	No - not mandatory but made available and accessible to all upon election.

Institutions (Schools, PAB, BCB, GSMD)			
82.	Disapplication of Local Govt. rules where applicable.	542	Yes.
83.	Schools: dissolve current Boards and agree governance Schemes for each, establishing new Boards / compositions / arrangements	467 – 469	No (partial) - review of composition with reduction in the number of Common Council representatives (with suitable financial control / veto powers worked into the terms of reference).
84.	GSMD Board: to no longer be a Corporation Committee, new arrangements for appointment and composition.	484	No (partial) - review of composition with reduction in the number of Common Council representatives (with suitable financial control / veto powers worked into the terms of reference).
81.	Barbican Centre Board: to no longer be a Corporation Committee; new arrangements for appointment and composition.	492	No - no change.
82.	Police Authority Board: direct appointment by the Court to continue, but with changes to composition, service restrictions, appointment and policies for employment to the CoLP	509 – 511 & 520	No - no change.
83.	Minor changes to management and procedural arrangements for all of the above (e.g., HR, legal, audit & risk, finance, procurement, conflicts of interest etc).	521 - 544	Under separate review.

This page is intentionally left blank