



Barbican Estate Residents Consultation Committee

Date: MONDAY, 5 JUNE 2023
Time: 6.30 pm
Venue: COMMITTEE ROOMS, 2ND FLOOR, WEST WING, GUILDHALL

3. MINUTES

Minutes of the meeting of 6 March 2023.

For Decision
(Pages 3 - 8)

8. WINDOW CLEANING CONTRACT

Appendix 3 – price per block.

For Information
(Pages 9 - 10)

14. WORKING PARTY UPDATES

Updates of the Asset Maintenance and Underfloor Heating Working Parties.

For Information
(Pages 11 - 16)

Item received too late for circulation in conjunction with the agenda.

Ian Thomas CBE
Town Clerk and Chief Executive

This page is intentionally left blank

BARBICAN ESTATE RESIDENTS CONSULTATION COMMITTEE **Monday, 6 March 2023**

Minutes of the meeting held at Guildhall at 6.30 pm

Members:

Sandra Jenner - Chair	Deputy Mark Bostock - Frobisher Crescent
Jim Durcan - Deputy Chair	Miranda Quinney - John Trundle Court
Alderman Christopher Makin – Deputy Chair	Tim Hollaway - Lambert Jones Mews
Adam Hogg - Chair, Barbican Association	David Lawrence - Lauderdale Tower (REMOTE)
Graham Wallace- Andrewes House	Monique Long - Mountjoy House
Fiona Lean - Ben Jonson House (REMOTE)	David Graves - Seddon House
Andrew Tong - Brandon Mews	Sandy Wilson - Shakespeare Tower
Andy Hope – Breton House	Guy Nisbett – Speed House
John Taysum – Bryer Court	Rodney Jagelman - Thomas More House
Gordon Griffiths - Bunyan Court	Mary Bonar - Wallside
Alan Budgen - Cromwell Tower	Petre Reid - Willoughby House
Helen Hudson – Defoe (REMOTE)	Dave Taylor – Gilbert House

Officers:

Graeme Low	- City Surveyor's Dept.
Stephanie Robertson	- City Surveyor's Dept.
Barry Ashton	- Community and Children's Services Dept.
Paul Murtagh	- Community and Children's Services Dept.
Jason Hayes	- Community and Children's Services Dept.
Anne Mason	- Community and Children's Services Dept.
Rosalind Ugwu	- Community and Children's Services Dept.
Helen Davinson	- Community and Children's Services Dept.
Matthew Stickley	- Town Clerk's Dept.

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Jane Smith, who was represented by David Graves.

It was noted that James Ball of Brandon Mews had stood down from the committee and had been replaced by Andrew Tong.

It was noted that Fiona Lean, Helen Hudson, and David Lawrence had joined the meeting remotely.

2. MEMBERS DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

There were no declarations of interest.

3. MINUTES

The committee noted that residents of Lauderdale Tower were supportive of the comments of Cromwell Tower residents regarding proposals for its sprinkler system.

RESOLVED – That the minutes of the meeting held on 30 November 2022 be approved, subject to an amendment that the statement that the ‘Asset Management Working Party was steering the programme’ be amended to read that the ‘Asset Management Working Party was waiting to receive the detail of the programme’ resulting from the Stock Condition Survey.

4. ACTION TRACKER

The committee received the Actions Tracker and requested that the start date within the tracker be updated when items were added to the tracker and not amended in future and that the online meeting held on 16 November 2022 as part of the Savills’ Stock Condition Survey was also attended by the Asset Maintenance Working Party.

The committee noted that the Brandon Mews Canopy item, which had been due for an update, had been omitted in the agenda. The committee requested that the Action Tracker and the Agenda Plan be aligned for future meetings.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted.

5. 2022/23 ELECTRICITY PRICE FORECAST UPDATE AND METER QUERY

The committee received a report of the City Surveyor which presented the view of estimated electricity costs for City of London Barbican Estate Office housing sites. The committee discussed changes made to the original forecast due to the onboarding of the Power Purchase Agreement, together with adjustments made by the supplier through the application of an incorrect charge.

The committee raised concerns and expressed dissatisfaction regarding metering, standing charges, and invoice issues, and discussed the dispute resolution process, proposed completion timelines and the delays to the reconciliation process. Officers confirmed that the reconciliation of 2021/22 and 2022/23 charges would be completed by 31 March 2023.

RESOLVED – that the report be noted, i.e. -

- The benefit of the PPA from 1st January 2023.
- That, due to the benefits provided as a result of the PPA and the traded position, the EBDS commencing April 2023 may not be applicable as prices are under the threshold and there is a higher cap than under the previous government support scheme.
- That the consumption and costs are currently validated via a contract with Team Energy Auditing Ltd. and via Sigma, the City’s current energy monitoring software.

- That Total Energies are lodging a dispute with Elexon (the National Grid) regarding estimated data for Speed House.
- The continued support with site regarding available supply capacity.

6. REPAIRS AND MAINTENANCE UPDATE

The committee received a report of the Interim Executive Director of Community and Children’s Services, which provided an update on repairs and maintenance.

The committee discussed the risk of duplicating works and the importance of prospective works being thoroughly surveyed in advance of them.

The committee raised concerns on the process of the flawed survey which had not assessed the topmost exposed windows, as was intended, resulting in further delays to the tender process and letting of a contract to undertake the work on a programmed basis. Officers confirmed that the earliest date that a programmed approach could now begin would be September 2023. Officers apologised for the delay and said that lessons would be learnt.

It was confirmed that residents would not be charged for both the original flawed survey and the corrective survey. The committee further discussed which party would be responsible for paying for the surveys undertaken, the lack of coordination of repairs works, and the overlapping survey arranged for the estate, about which the committee noted its dissatisfaction.

The committee discussed the burden of standard minimum call out rates charged by contractors and requested that charges be negotiated, and it was suggested that a summary of the completed survey be circulated to the committee.

RESOLVED – that the report be noted.

7. REPAIRS AND MAINTENANCE - RETENDER TIMELINE

The committee received a report of the Interim Executive Director of Community and Children’s Services, which provided an estimated timeline for the re-tender of the Repairs and Maintenance contract.

The committee discussed the prospect of hosting a working party meeting to discuss what should be considered as part of the retender of the Repairs and Maintenance contract and raised concerns about the lack of quality works undertaken as part of the current contract. It was agreed that officers would confirm the number of members they would request for such a working party and that the Barbican Estate Residents Consultation Committee would nominate representatives in response outside of the meeting.

RESOLVED: that the report be noted.

8. WORKING PARTY UPDATES

The committee received several updates:

- 8.1 **Gardens Advisory**
- 8.2 **Service Level Agreement**
- 8.3 **Asset Maintenance**
- 8.4 **Background Underfloor Heating**
- 8.5 **Service Charge**

9. **FIRE SAFETY UPDATE**

The committee received a report of the Interim Executive Director, Community and Children's Services, which information on how the City of London Corporation was working to ensure that its homes on the Barbican Estate were compliant with current health and safety legislation, best practice, and regulatory standards relating to fire safety.

The committee praised the quality of the works undertaken but raised concerns regarding the project management of the works.

RESOLVED – that the report be noted.

10. **SAVILLES STOCK CONDITION SURVEY - ORAL UPDATE ON THE EARLY PROGRAMME**

The committee received an update from Community and Children's Services Department staff.

It was reported that a programme of work was being compiled and would be considered at the Asset Maintenance Working Party. There was a discussion around the availability of staff to take forward such a programme, in terms of both capacity and capability. It was agreed that a revised governance structure should be considered to improve the management of the programme. It was suggested that a formal Programme Management model was required.

11. **BLAKE TOWER – ORAL UPDATE**

The committee received an update from Community and Children's Services Department staff.

12. **BARBICAN HIGHWALK: PLANNED MAINTENANCE TO THE PUBLIC REALM - ORAL UPDATE**

13. **UPDATE REPORT**

The committee received the update report.

The committee expressed concerns regarding the report presented showing redecoration works were erroneously shown as. It was noted that the status of the redecorations would be revisited and updated in the report.

Officers accepted a proposal that residents be invited to join officers in reviewing the work undertaken given concerns about the quality of previous works.

RESOLVED: that the report be noted.

14. **PROGRESS OF SALES AND LETTINGS**

The committee received a report of the Interim Executive Director of Community and Children's Services, advised of the sales and lettings approved by officers since the last meeting.

RESOLVED – that the report be noted.

15. **QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

The committee discussed the cleanliness of vents around the building and the risks of fire damage when left dirty. It was noted that such cleaning works were scheduled on request.

A question was asked regarding delays on a project regarding lifts. Officers responded that there had not been any delays but that the specification of works would shortly be finalised.

16. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT**

There was no urgent business.

The meeting ended at 20:21.

Chairman

Contact Officer: matthew.stickley@cityoflondon.gov.uk

This page is intentionally left blank

Agenda Item 8

Appendix 3

Window cleaning contract price per block 2023/24

Block	New contract 23/24 prices	Current contract 22/23 Actual costs
ANDREWES HOUSE	£16,842.96	8,445.50
BEN JONSON HOUSE	£25,661.00	20,780.21
BRANDON MEWS	£6,838.20	5,896.40
BRETON HOUSE	£12,400.40	6,701.62
BRYER COURT	£6,241.96	9,039.39
BUNYAN COURT	£10,248.60	3,948.26
CROMWELL TOWER	£10,196.40	19,364.73
DEFOE HOUSE	£15,231.96	10,816.10
FROBISHER CRESCENT	£11,118.60	4,675.52
GILBERT HOUSE	£7,526.70	7,509.48
JOHN TRUNDLE CT	£17,176.00	8,052.32
LAMBERT JONES	£1,044.00	311.72
LAUDERDALE TOWER	£10,290.03	17,660.77
MOUNTJOY HOUSE	£5,481.00	3,353.38
SEDDON	£6,504.12	7,302.60
SHAKESPEARE TWR	£10,206.84	17,660.77
SPEED HOUSE	£9,750.96	11,547.32
THOMAS MORE HSE	£12,875.40	9,854.00
THE POSTERN	£1,044.00	415.61
WALLSIDE	£522.00	415.61
WILLOUGHBY HOUSE	£12,663.00	9,261.53
TOTAL	£209,864.13	£183,012.84

This page is intentionally left blank

Minutes of Asset Maintenance Working Party 17 April 2023 Virtual on Teams

Attendee		Organisation
Tam Pollard	TM	Chair - Resident
Mike Saunders	MS	CoL Housing Property Services
Jason Hayes	JH	CoL Housing Property Services
David Downing	DD	CoL Housing Property Services
Christopher Makin	CM	Resident, Alderman
Fiona Lean	FL	Resident
Henry Irwig	HI	Resident
Matt Dendy	MD	Resident
Randall Anderson	RA	Resident CC
Tim Cox	TC	Resident
James Durcan	JD	Resident Deputy Chair of the RCC
Helen Hudson	HH	Resident Observer for Service Charge WP
Ted Reilly	TR	Resident Minute taker

Apologies: Margarita Chiclana
Rosalind Ugwu

Item	Key discussion & action points	Who
1	<p>Introduction</p> <p>David Downing was Introduced to the new members of the WP. David will be planning and coordinating the Implementation of the Savills Stock Condition Survey</p>	
2	<p>Review of Preceding minutes.</p> <p>Margarita was thanked for the minutes of the previous meeting. There were no suggested changes to the minutes. JH submitted some changes after the meeting . They will be distributed later.</p> <p>It was agreed that minutes could be briefer with actions identified.</p> <p>TR agreed to use a City template for these minutes as a trial.</p>	TR
3	<p>Savills Stock Condition Survey (SSCS)</p> <p>All work that might arise from the SSCS would pass through the City's normal gateway process, and then the section 20 Notice system. TP requested more clarity on the purpose and implications of the Section 20 notice.</p> <p>JH Confirmed that under current regulations these works did not attract VAT.</p> <p>All the identified works would be audited to determine their necessity. This would be done in five year segments, on a whole estate basis, but there would be specific consideration for each block. This audit would most likely be carried out by expert consultants.</p> <p>JH undertook to devise a mechanism to ensure full consultation, both by members of the AMWP and other residents in this audit.</p> <p>DD presented the Barbican Forward Programme detailed on an EXCEL Workbook. (Attached) The programme showed all works for each block</p>	JH

Item	Key discussion & action points	Who
	<p>broken down by year into 46 work streams: 25 M&E and 21 fabrics.</p> <p>DD agreed to provide clarity on the allocation of costs between residents (Section 20) and landlord liability.</p> <p>Savills Stock Condition Survey (SSCS) continued</p> <p>It was agreed that the SSCS Report, in its present form, could cause alarm among residents, as it suggests a scale of work and costs that may be well above anything actually required. DD agreed to investigate the possibility of providing more detail on the 46 work streams that gives a more accurate picture of what is involved, before the Report is circulated to all residents.</p>	<p>DD</p> <p>DD</p> <p>All</p>
<p>4</p>	<p>Windows</p> <p>Work on the 7th floor northern flats has commenced, which should be completed by the end of April.</p> <p>It was agreed that the window repairs had not gone well.</p> <p>Lessons learnt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Better communications between repairs team and projects team would have made access easier. • More frequent inspection, for example at the time of redecorations would have reduced costs. <p style="text-align: center;">More frequent inspection of the windows is called for, rather than relying on the contractor to report on the condition of the frames during the seven year external redecorations cycle. Had this been done in the interim, it may have highlighted potential damage and decay earlier, and may have avoided the high cost of repairs/replacement now being experienced by Residents.</p>	<p>JH/MS</p>
<p>5</p>	<p>Repairs System</p> <p>It was not clear:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • what reports CIVICA was able to produce • how real time updating was progressing. • how trends in repairs were identified • how CIVICA and KEYSTONE related to each other <p>JH agreed to provide an update.</p>	<p>JH</p>
<p>6</p>	<p>Fire Safety</p> <p>Fire Signage</p> <p>Members of the WP had all seen the Barbican Fire Sign Strategy report (Attached). JH undertook to arrange for physical examples of the signs to be available for members of the WP to inspect.</p> <p>Fire Doors</p> <p>Still in the design and procurement stage. It was likely to be around two years before this stage of the project is complete. JH undertook to provide a more exact timing.</p>	<p>JH</p> <p>JH</p>
<p>7</p>	<p>Garchey</p> <p>The working party found it difficult to understand the complications of the impact of surface drainage on the Garchey. TR undertook to work with MS to produce a comprehensible analysis of the impact of surface drainage on potential Garchey removal.</p> <p>TR reported that the Barbican Centre Renewal Team were very keen to see the removal of the Garchey bay from Beech Street.</p>	<p>TR/MS</p>

Item	Key discussion & action points	Who
8	<p>Tower Block Lifts</p> <p>Consultants had opened an active dialogue with representatives of each of the three towers. Good progress was being made</p>	
9	<p>AOB</p> <p>Resident members of the WP reminded officers that there was an undertaking to include resident representation in the selection of the Repairs and Maintenance contractor.</p>	
10	<p>Next Meeting</p> <p>19 June 2023</p>	

This page is intentionally left blank

Underfloor Heating Working Party RCC June 2023 Report

Current work

The UHWP is working, with financial support from the City's Climate Action Team (CAT) on the following **building interventions**.

- **Individual Controls**

The UHWP has been working on providing individual controls for our heating for some time. It now seems likely that with potential funding from the City we will be able to carry out an experiment into its technical and economic feasibility. Our resident engineers are working with Schneider, a large firm of electrical engineers to design a control and metering system. We have identified a small group of flats that can be separated from the rest of the estate both technically and commercially, with a willing group of residents. The major problem yet to be overcome relates to the commercial implementation, which frustrates this project.

- **Soffit insulation**

We hope to carry out some trials to determine the effectiveness of insulating the soffits. The Barbican's resident engineers are working with CAT on designs and pricing. We have already had promising meetings with members of the heritage team within City Planners, and the building control officer. Subject to costings we will trial two flats together two control flats during the next heating season to determine the viability of this intervention.

- **Barrel Vaulted Flat insulation**

Interventions here are less technically simple. Again, Barbican's resident engineers are working with CAT to devise solutions.

- **Draughts**

We are looking at eliminating draughts in the common parts of the staircase blocks.

- **Internal wall insulation**

We are hoping to be able to provide designs for unobtrusive internal wall insulation that residents or their contractors can install themselves.

- **Double glazing**

Similarly, we are looking at a double-glazing system that can be fitted by residents to our existing window frames.

Smart interventions

In addition to the building interventions identified above we are working on the following smart Interventions. These are interventions that require no changes to our buildings. We are working on these with CAT's consultants Ramboll. This work is being funded by the GLA.

- **Use of weather forecasts**

Our heating is essentially controlled by night-time temperatures, with no thought for next day's weather. A smarter system might increase the heating load when colder weather is forecast and reduce the load for warmer weather. It could also avoid switch-ons for short periods, which are costly and ineffective.

- **Better distribution of load over the day**

Most of our heating comes on in the night, reflecting the fact that the Barbican is just one enormous storage heater and that electricity costs less at night than during the day. The day/night rate differential appears to be small, but these rates are based on historic use, and a move to more daytime power would significantly shift this differential. There's a balance to be found here.

- **Modelling**

To assist in all the above interventions both building and smart Ramboll are building a thermal model of a typical terrace block.

Seasonal Turn Off

The Underfloor Heating Working Party (UHWP) worked with BEO officers to implement the seasonal switch-off protocol at the end of April. This protocol was introduced to ensure that the timing of the switch off was objective and ensured that unnecessary heating at £5,100 per hour was avoided.

The widespread publication of this protocol, including the weekly bulletin, has reduced the number of pressure calls from residents.