



Barbican Residential Committee

Date: MONDAY, 14 MARCH 2016
Time: 11.30 am
Venue: COMMITTEE ROOMS, 2ND FLOOR, WEST WING, GUILDHALL

Members:

Gareth Moore (Chairman)	Jeremy Mayhew
Ann Holmes (Deputy Chairman)	Deputy Joyce Nash
Randall Anderson	Graham Packham
Alex Bain-Stewart	Chris Punter
Deputy John Barker	Stephen Quilter
Chris Boden	Angela Starling
David Bradshaw	Deputy John Tomlinson
Deputy Billy Dove	Philip Woodhouse
Deputy Stanley Ginsburg	Dhruv Patel (Ex-Officio Member)
Michael Hudson	
Vivienne Littlechild	
Professor John Lumley	

** indicates non-resident Members*

Enquiries: Julie Mayer
tel.no.: 020 7332 1410
Julie.Mayer@cityoflondon.gov.uk

Lunch will be served in Guildhall Club at 1PM
NB: Part of this meeting could be the subject of audio or video recording

John Barradell
Town Clerk and Chief Executive

AGENDA

1. **APOLOGIES**
2. **MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**
3. **MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING**
To approve the public minutes and summaries of the meetings held on:
 - 14 December 2015
 - 14 January 2016 (Special Meeting)

For Decision
(Pages 1 - 8)
4. **'YOU SAID; WE DID' ACTIONS UPDATE REPORT**
Report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

For Information
(Pages 9 - 10)
5. **UPDATE REPORT**
Report of the Director of Community and Children's Services

For Information
(Pages 11 - 16)
6. **PROGRESS OF SALES AND LETTINGS**
Report of the Director of Community and Children's Services

For Information
(Pages 17 - 20)
7. **SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENTS QUARTERLY REVIEW**
Report of the Director of Community and Children's Services

For Information
(Pages 21 - 38)
8. **SERVICE BASED REVIEW - GENERATING INCOME FOR CAR PARKING AND BAGGAGE STORES FOR 2017/18**
Report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

For Decision
(Pages 39 - 52)
9. **CAR PARK CHARGING**
Report of the Director of Community and Children's Services

For Decision
(Pages 53 - 62)

10. **DRAFT MINUTES OF THE BARBICAN ESTATE RESIDENTS CONSULTATION COMMITTEE (RCC)**

To receive the draft minutes of the RCC Meeting held on 29th February 2016

For Information
(Pages 63 - 68)

11. **QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

12. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT**

For Decision

13. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

MOTION – That under Section 100(A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following item(s) on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part 1 of the Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

For Decision

14. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**

To approve the non-public minutes of the meetings held on:

- 14 December 2015
- 14 January 2016 (Special Meeting)

For Decision
(Pages 69 - 72)

15. **ARREARS UPDATE**

Report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

For Information
(Pages 73 - 82)

16. **NON-PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

17. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**

This page is intentionally left blank

BARBICAN RESIDENTIAL COMMITTEE

Monday, 14 December 2015

Minutes of the meeting of the Barbican Residential Committee held at Guildhall on Monday, 14 December 2015 at 11.30 am

Present

Members:

Gareth Moore (Chairman)	Professor John Lumley
Ann Holmes (Deputy Chairman)	Jeremy Mayhew
Randall Anderson	Deputy Joyce Nash
Alex Bain-Stewart	Graham Packham
Deputy John Barker	Stephen Quilter
Chris Boden	Angela Starling
David Bradshaw	Philip Woodhouse
Deputy Billy Dove	Dhruv Patel (Ex-Officio Member)
Deputy Stanley Ginsburg	
Michael Hudson	
Vivienne Littlechild	

In Attendance

Officers:

Julie Mayer	- Town Clerk's Department
Mark Jarvis	- Chamberlain's Department
Ade Adetosoye	- Director of Community and Children's Services
David Padfield	- Community and Children's Services
Michael Bennett	- Community and Children's Services
Helen Davinson	- Community and Children's Services
Mike Kettle	- Community and Children's Services
Anne Mason	- Community and Children's Services
Mike Saunders	- Community and Children's Services
Alan Bennetts	- Comptroller and City Solicitor's Department

1. **APOLOGIES**

Apologies were received from Chris Punter and Deputy John Tomlinson.

2. **MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**

There were no declarations.

3. **MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING**

The Minutes and non-public summary of the Meeting held on 14th September 2015 were approved.

4. **"YOU SAID: WE DID" - ACTIONS LIST OCTOBER 2015**

The Committee received its Outstanding Actions list and noted a drafting error under Bicycle storage as follows:

Chamberlains have confirmed (not confirmed reviewed) that if the payback period for bicycle stores is under 10 years, with a strong case for delivering a better service, then this is something that could be considered.

5. **UPDATE REPORT**

The Committee received the update report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

6. **TERMS OF REFERENCE AND FREQUENCY OF MEETINGS OF THE BARBICAN RESIDENTIAL COMMITTEE**

The Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk in respect of the Terms of Reference and frequency of the Barbican Residential Committee's meetings.

RESOLVED, that –

1. The Terms of Reference of the Barbican Residential Committee be approved for submission to the Annual Court of Common Council in April 2016.
2. The frequency of meetings remain at 4 times a year, approximately 2 weeks after the Barbican Estate Residents Consultation Committee (RCC)

7. **SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENTS QUARTERLY REVIEW**

The Committee received report of the Director of Community and Children's Services, which updated Members on the review of the estate-wide implementation of Service Level Agreements (SLAs) and Key Performance Measures (KPI's) for the quarter July-September 2015.

RESOLVED – that, the report be noted.

8. **PROGRESS OF SALES AND LETTINGS**

The Committee received a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services, which advised Members of the sales and lettings that had been approved by officers since the last meeting. There was a request that the sale price of completed sales be included in future reports.

RESOLVED – that, the report be noted.

9. **SERVICE CHARGE EXPENDITURE AND INCOME ACCOUNT - LATEST APPROVED BUDGET 2015/16 AND ORIGINAL BUDGET 2016/17**

The Committee considered a joint report of the Chamberlain and the Director of Community and Children's Services, which set out the latest approved budget for 2015/16 and the original 2016/17 budget for revenue expenditure, to be included within the service charge in respect of dwellings.

Members raised a number of queries in respect of cyclical repairs and charges, specifically in that they would increase as the building ages. Officers advised that item 12 on today's agenda (Asset Maintenance Plan) sought to respond to these queries and present a longer term, strategic solution.

Members also asked if the layout of future reports could be revised to include the original budget, alongside the latest approved budget, rather than showing it in a separate table or appendices. Members noted that the format for the budget reports had been approved across the City of London Corporation, following consultation with Members. However, the Chamberlain's representative would take this suggestion back to the Financial Services Director and the Chairman of the Finance Committee and seek to produce a bespoke format for reporting to the Barbican Residential Committee (BRC).

RESOLVED, that:-

1. The provisional 2016/17 Revenue Budget be approved for submission to the Finance Committee, subject to future reports being in the format suggested above.
2. The Chamberlain be authorised to review these budgets to allow for further implications arising from departmental reorganisations and other reviews and corporate projects.

10. **REVENUE AND CAPITAL BUDGETS - LATEST APPROVED BUDGET 2015/16 AND ORIGINAL 2016/17 - EXCLUDING DWELLINGS SERVICE CHARGE INCOME AND EXPENDITURE**

The Committee considered a joint report of the Chamberlain and the Director of Community and Children's Services, which sought approval to the provisional revenue budget for 2016/17 and approval of the draft capital budget.

Members asked if the format could be revised, in accordance with the request made under Agenda item 9. Members also asked for further information in respect of the methodology behind the change in capital charging and the Chamberlain's officer agreed to circulate this after the meeting.

Following further queries about the increase in capital charges due to revaluation of the flats and baggage stores, and particularly as there was an error in the report, whereby '*renovation*' should have said '*revaluation*', it was moved by Mr Bain-Stewart, seconded by Mr Boden and subsequently agreed to defer this report to a Special Meeting of the Barbican Residential Committee. The Town Clerk agreed to arrange a Special Meeting in the middle/latter part of January and the Chamberlain undertook to produce an updated report as soon as possible.

DEFERRED.

11. **CONCRETE TESTING AND REPAIRS**

The Committee considered an Issue Report of the Director of Community and Children's Services in respect of Concrete Testing and Repairs at the Barbican Estate, which would also be presented to the Projects Sub Committee in January 2016. The report sought to alter the budget structure, as the previous report had not been explicit about the provision for some of the repair budget to be drawn down prior to the 'Options Appraisal' at the next Gateway.

Members were reminded that the budget structure could not be altered without Committee approval.

In response to more general queries about the concrete works, Members were reminded that the matter was now with the Comptroller and City Solicitor in order to determine the final position. There was some concern expressed about the length of time it was taking to reach a conclusion, particularly as some residents had raised queries about the condition of the concrete on the estate some time ago. Furthermore, some leaseholders (i.e. the Roof Committee for Andrewes House) felt that they had paid for unsatisfactory repairs previously and would not want to see a repetition.

RESOLVED, that - the formal alteration of the budget approved at the previous Gateway (from £310,000 to £600,000) be approved. (*This will be broken down into two budgets, testing at £262,167 and repairs at £337,833*).

12. **ASSET MAINTENANCE PLAN**

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services, which provided Members with an update on the work of the Asset Maintenance Working Party. Members noted that an audit and gap analysis of all the assets on the Barbican Estate had been carried out and condition surveys would be produced for those components in the gap analysis.

At the Barbican Estate Residents Consultation Committee (RCC) on 30th November 2015, Members noted that the Working Party had expressed a wish to retain their group, with its specific skills set, to ensure progress beyond the gap analysis.

Some Members of the Barbican Residential Committee reminded officers that they had been previously asked for this work to be undertaken and welcomed it. However, they also stressed that it must have a strategic outlook and reflect the Barbican Estate's unique position. Alongside this work, Members felt it would be helpful to have a report on the breakdown of the various assets; i.e. parts, fixtures, ground rent and maintenance and the respective liabilities under landlord and tenant law.

RESOLVED, that:

1. The report be noted
2. Condition Surveys be carried out for those assets which form part of the gap analysis, in order that the Asset Maintenance Plan be developed.

13. **CAR PARKING CHARGING**

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services which sought approval of the charging policy for car parking, on the Barbican Estate, for another year.

Members expressed the following concerns about this report:

- It represented a fundamental change in policy; i.e. from the previous RPI linked charging structure.
- It may cause residents to park elsewhere.
- There are already a large number of empty bays.
- Cheaper parking is available at London Wall.

In response to a query about an urgent decision taken to lease 35 bays, Members noted that this had not gone ahead as planning permission had been refused. However, Members were reminded that officers had been tasked with exploring and developing commercial opportunities for unused car park areas and would continue to do so.

In concluding, Members agreed to defer this report to March, when a further report on income generation in respect of car parking and baggage stores had been scheduled.

DEFERRED.

14. ANNUAL REVIEW OF RECOGNISED TENANT ASSOCIATIONS (RTAS) 2015

The Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk in respect of the Annual Review of RTAs. The Town Clerk was pleased to advise that all the House Groups which had applied had achieved their RTA status and retained their status from last year.

At the time of despatching the agenda, Ben Jonson House Group had not held a quorate Annual General Meeting but this had taken place successful on 9th December 2015 and the House Group would be exercising 'opt-in' Membership. This latest information therefore confirmed their RTA status.

Members noted the significance of achieving RTA status and supported officers in encouraging all house groups to apply.

RESOLVED, that – formal recognition of the House Groups and Barbican Association, as set out in the report, be confirmed, until the next Annual Review in 2016.

15. BARBICAN ESTATE RESIDENTS CONSULTATION COMMITTEE (RCC)- DRAFT MINUTES

The Committee received the draft minutes of the RCC Meeting of 30th November 2015.

16. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

In response to a question about short term lets, the Estate Officer Manager reminded members of the process and various stages for raising and dealing with issues raised.

In response to a query raised at the recent RCC meeting in respect of charging points for electrical vehicles, the Estate Officer Manager advised that there would be further information in the next resident's bulletin and future "You Said; We Did".

17. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT

There were no items.

18. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED – that under Section 100 (A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part 1 of Schedule 12(A) of the Local Government Act.

Item No	Para No(s)
19	3
20 - 21	1, 3
22 - 23	22, 23

19. NON-PUBLIC MINUTES

The non-public minutes of the meeting held on 14th September 2015 were approved.

20. ARREARS UPDATE

The Committee received a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services

21. WRITE OFF APPROVAL

The Committee considered and approved a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

22. NON-PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

There were no questions.

23. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED

As this would be the last meeting of Mr David Padfield, the Interim Assistant Director for Barbican Property Services, the Chairman asked Members to join him in extending thanks for his hard work over the past 5 months. Members noted that a new appointment had been made and would take up their post in the New Year.

The meeting ended at 1.35 pm

Chairman

BARBICAN RESIDENTIAL COMMITTEE

Thursday, 14 January 2016

Minutes of the meeting of the Barbican Residential Committee held at Guildhall
on Thursday, 14 January 2016 at 9.45 am

Present

Members:

Gareth Moore (Chairman)	Professor John Lumley
Ann Holmes (Deputy Chairman)	Jeremy Mayhew
Randall Anderson	Deputy Joyce Nash
Deputy John Barker	Stephen Quilter
Chris Boden	Angela Starling
David Bradshaw	Deputy John Tomlinson
Deputy Billy Dove	Philip Woodhouse
Michael Hudson	
Vivienne Littlechild	

In Attendance

Officers:

Julie Mayer	- Town Clerk's Department
Mark Jarvis	- Chamberlain's Department
Michael Bennett	- Community and Children's Services
Helen Davinson	- Community and Children's Services
Anne Mason	- Community and Children's Services
David Padfield	- Community and Children's Services
Paul Murtagh	- Community and Children's Services

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from Alex Bain-Stewart; Deputy Stanley Ginsburg; Graham Packham and Chris Punter.

2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

There were no declarations.

Before commencing the business on the agenda, the Town Clerk reminded Members that this Special Meeting of the Barbican Residential Committee would be constituted in the same way as an ordinary Committee Meeting; i.e. the same Terms of Reference and Standing Orders would apply and therefore only non-resident Members were eligible to vote.

3. **REVENUE AND CAPITAL BUDGETS - LATEST APPROVED BUDGET - 2015/16 AND ORIGINAL 2016/17 - EXCLUDING DWELLINGS SERVICE CHARGE INCOME AND EXPENDITURE**

The Committee considered a joint report of the Chamberlain and the Director of Community and Children's Services in respect of the Revenue and Capital Budgets. This report had been deferred from the last meeting of the Barbican Residential Committee on 14th December 2015, following queries from Members in respect of capital charges.

The revised report sought to address these queries and Members noted that the accounts were produced in accordance with CIPFA Guidelines, whereby the treatment of capital charges created a deficit. The Head of Financial Services explained that all budget reports were presented to Service Committees in the same format. However, Members' comments were duly noted and would be passed to the Chamberlain for further consideration.

In concluding, Members were pleased that the presentation of the figures in this revised report had progressed to a more understandable format. The Head of Financial Services invited Members to contact him directly, should they have further queries.

RESOLVED – that,

1. The Provisional 2016/17 Revenue Budget be approved for submission to the Finance Committee.
2. The Draft Capital Budget be approved.
3. The Chamberlain be authorised to revise these budgets to allow for further implications arising from departmental reorganisations and other reviews arising from corporate projects.

4. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

RESOLVED – that, the public be excluded from item 5 by virtue of paragraphs 1,2 and 3 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

5. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT, WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**

The Chairman agreed to the admission of one item of business and Members subsequently considered and approved a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

The meeting ended at time 10:05 am

Chairman

Agenda Item 4

“You Said; We Did” - Action List – February 2016

Actions from December 2015 BRC & other outstanding issues (updates appear in italics)

Issue	Source	Officer	Action Escalation
Bicycle storage			
<i>Chamberlains have confirmed that if the payback period for bicycle stores is under 10 years with a strong case for delivering a better service then this is something that could be considered. This project is on hold pending the outcome of the Service Based Review for Car Parks/Stores.</i>	June 2015 BRC	Mark Jarvis Barry Ashton	
Reporting Noise Nuisance at night			
<i>Contact telephone numbers to be provided in email bulletin.</i>	Sept 2015 BRC	Helen Davinson	Completed
Residential Rent Review			
<i>Following a number of issues raised regarding the Barbican Rental Strategy a briefing/update session will be held for members in January 2016 on a draft report prior to it being presented to BRC in March 2016.</i>	Sept 2015 BRC	Anne Mason	Completed
Electric Vehicle Charging			
<i>The possibility of providing charging points for electric vehicles in the car parks is being progressed as a City Project led by the Department of the Built Environment in conjunction with City Procurement. It is anticipated that the procurement process will conclude in April and a company to progress the works announced. Updates have and will continue to be provided in the resident bulletins.</i>	Dec 2015 BRC	Barry Ashton	
	Contact: Michael Bennett, Barbican Estate Manager – 020 7029 3923 – barbican.estate@cityoflondon.gov.uk		

This page is intentionally left blank

Committee:	Date:
Barbican Residential Committee	14 March 2016
Subject: Update Report	
Report of: Director of Community and Children's Services	Public For information
<p><u>Executive Summary</u></p> <p>Barbican Estate Office – see appendix 1</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Agenda Plan <p>Property Services – see appendix 2</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Redecorations 3. Beech Gardens Podium Works 4. Asset Maintenance Plan 5. Public lift availability 6. Upgrade of the Barbican Television Network 7. Concrete Works 8. Background Underfloor Heating <p>Recommendations that the contents of this report are noted.</p>	

Background

This report updates members on issues raised by the Residents' Consultation Committee and the Barbican Residential Committee at their meetings in November/December 2015. This report also provides updates on other issues on the estate.

Barbican Estate Office Issues

1. Agenda Plan

The table below includes a list of pending committee reports:

Residents' Consultation Committee & Barbican Residential Committee

Report Title	Officer	RCC Meeting Date	BRC Meeting Date
"You Said; We Did" Actions (Separate list for RCC & BRC)	Michael Bennett	6 June	13 June
SLA Review	Michael Bennett		
Parcel Tracking System Review	Barry Ashton		
Working Party Review – Minutes of Background Underfloor Heating Working Party (RCC Only)	Mike Saunders		
Working Party Review – Minutes of Gardens Advisory Group & Review of Terms of Reference (RCC Only)	Helen Davinson		
Progress of Sales & Lettings	Anne Mason		
Update Report: (Separate list for RCC & BRC) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agenda Plan 2016 • Property Services Update • City Surveyors Update (RCC Only)	Michael Bennett		
Arrears Report (BRC Only)	Anne Mason		
"You Said; We Did" Actions (Separate list for RCC & BRC)	Michael Bennett	5 Sept	19 Sept
SLA Review	Michael Bennett		
2015/16 Revenue Outturn (Excluding the Residential	Anne Mason/Chamberlains		

Service Charge Account)			
2015/16 Revenue Outturn for the Residential Service Charge Account including Reconciliation between the closed accounts and amount to be charged to long leaseholders	Chamberlains		
Relationship of BRC Outturn Report to Service Charge Schedules – RCC Only	Anne Mason		
Progress of Sales & Lettings	Anne Mason		
Update Report: (Separate list for RCC & BRC) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agenda Plan 2016 • Property Services Update • City Surveyors Update (RCC Only)	Michael Bennett		
Arrears Report (BRC Only)	Anne Mason		
“You Said; We Did” Actions (Separate list for RCC & BRC)	Michael Bennett	28 Nov	12 Dec
SLA Review	Michael Bennett		
Car Park Charging	Barry Ashton		
Service Charge Expenditure & Income Account - Latest Approved Budget 2016/17 & Original Budget 2017/18	Chamberlains		
Revenue & Capital Budgets - Latest Approved Budget 2016/17 and Original 2017/18 - Excluding dwellings service charge income & expenditure	Chamberlains		
Annual Review of RTAs	Town Clerks		
Progress of Sales & Lettings	Anne Mason		

Update Report: (Separate list for RCC & BRC) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agenda Plan 2016 • Property Services Update • City Surveyors Update (RCC Only) 	Michael Bennett		
Arrears Report (BRC Only)	Anne Mason		

Background Papers:

Minutes of the Barbican Residential Committee 14 December 2015.
Minutes of Residents' Consultation Committee 30 November 2015.

Contact: Michael Bennett, Barbican Estate Manager
Tel: 020 7029 3923
E:mail: barbican.estate@cityoflondon.gov.uk

3. Redecorations

2016/17-2019/20 Programme

We are currently completing Section 20 consultation and answering a number of observations. Condition surveys are currently being carried out for the blocks due in 2016/17 and the results will be fed back to the relevant Housegroups. Future blocks will be surveyed as and when they are due.

4. Beech Gardens Podium Works

The final account for the Podium works is progressing well. The ‘Lessons Learnt’ report will be prepared and submitted to your Committee for information.

5. Public Lift Availability

Availability of the public lifts under the control of Property Services is detailed below:

Lift	From April 2014 to March 2015	From April 2015 to December 2015
Turret (Thomas More)	98.72%	99.55%
Gilbert House	99.68%	99.82%

6. Upgrade of the Barbican Television Network

We are agreeing a Practical Completion date with the installer (VFM) for the fibre installation. Once agreed, the Working Party will meet to monitor begin monitoring the KPI’s in respect of the license agreement.

7. Concrete Works

Current position (as at 10.2.15)

- Surveys completed to Ben Jonson House (with the exception of the area above Golden Lane which requires a planned road closure)
- Surveys completed to recessed areas in Lauderdale Tower
- Surveys completed to John Trundle Court, Bryer Court, Bunyan Court and Defoe House
- Surveys completed to Andrewes House and Breton House Car Parks
- Surveys to Speed House 80% complete
- Surveys to Frobisher Crescent 50% complete

Remaining blocks and car parks to be completed during February/March 2016.

8. Background Underfloor Heating

A productive meeting took place with Westminster Council and the Working Party. At the last Working Party meeting it was agreed that discussions would take place with National Grid who have expressed an interest to discuss some opportunities at the Barbican Estate

The Working Party is also progressing well with a Technical solution for the heating controls (Cylco) with a deadline of September 2016 in readiness for the new heating season

Working Party meeting dates are currently being agreed for 2016.

Agenda Item 6

Committee:	Date:
Residents' Consultation Committee	29 February 2016
Barbican Residential Committee	14 March 2016
Subject:	Public
Progress of Sales and Lettings	
Report of:	
Director of Community and Children's Services	
Report author:	For Information
Anne Mason - Revenues Manager	

Main Report

BACKGROUND

1. The acceptance of surrenders of tenancies and the sale and letting of flats are dealt with under delegated authority and in accordance with Standing Orders 77a and 77b.

SURRENDERS

2.

Case No	Type	Floor	Rent Per Annum	Tenancy commenced/ expired	Reason for Surrender	Date of Surrender
1	1A	31	£33,210	25/12/2013 24/12/2016	Tenant moving	01/02/2016

RIGHT TO BUY SALES

3.

	2 February 2016	27 October 2015
Sales Completed	1079	1079
Total Market Value	£94,546,908.01	£94,546,908.01
Total Discount	£29,539,064.26	£29,539,064.26
NET PRICE	£65,007,843.75	£65,007,843.75

OPEN MARKET SALES

4.

	2 February 2016	27 October 2015
Sales Completed	838	838
Market Value	£136,288,771.97	£136,288,771.97

5. Fifteen exchanges of sold flats have taken place with the sum of £720,254 being paid to the City of London.
6. The freeholds of 14 flats in Wallside have been sold with the sum of £35,000 being paid to the City of London.
7. A 999 year lease has been completed with the sum of £43,200 being paid to the City of London.

APPROVED SALES

8.

CASE	Block	Floor	Type	Price	Remarks as at 2 February 2016
1	Andrewes House	5	20 1 bed	£840,000	Proceeding

APPROVED LETTINGS

9.

CASE	Block	Floor	Type	Annual Rent	Remarks as at 2 February 2016
1	Speed House	6	21 2 bed	£24,300	Completed 1 February

COMPLETED SALES

10. No sales have completed since the last report.

SALES PER BLOCK

11.

BLOCK	TOTAL NO. OF FLATS IN EACH BLOCK	TOTAL NO. SOLD IN EACH BLOCK	NET PRICE £	% NO. OF FLATS SOLD IN EACH BLOCK
ANDREWES HOUSE	192	183	15,808,760.00	95.31
BEN JONSON HOUSE	204	195	14,132,454.83	95.59
BRANDON MEWS	26	24	1,057,460.00	92.31
BRETON HOUSE	111	106	7,201,712.50	95.50
BRYER COURT	56	55	2,307,338.50	98.21
BUNYAN COURT	69	66	4,693,780.00	95.65
DEFOE HOUSE	178	170	14,644,782.50	95.51
GILBERT HOUSE	88	87	11,046,452.50	98.86
JOHN TRUNDLE COURT	133	131	4,467,527.50	98.50
LAMBERT JONES MEWS	8	8	1,400,000.00	100.00
MOUNTJOY HOUSE	64	63	5,925,723.50	98.44
THE POSTERN/WALLSIDE	12	8	2,499,630.00	66.67
SEDDON HOUSE	76	74	7,675,677.50	97.37
SPEED HOUSE	114	104	8,933,148.50	91.23
THOMAS MORE HOUSE	166	162	13,668,455.00	97.59
WILLOUGHBY HOUSE	148	145	13,542,670.50	97.97
TERRACE BLOCK TOTAL	1645 (1645)	1581 (1581)	129,005,573.33 (129,005,573.33)	96.11 (96.11)
CROMWELL TOWER	112	100	21,700,801.00	89.29
LAUDERDALE TOWER	117	113	22,703,779.63	96.58
SHAKESPEARE TOWER	116	109	25,225,415.76	93.97
TOWER BLOCK TOTAL	345 (345)	322 (322)	69,629,996.39 (69,629,996.39)	93.33 (93.33)
ESTATE TOTAL	1990 (1990)	1903 (1903)	198,635,569.72 (198,635,569.72)	95.63 (95.63)

The freeholds of 14 Flats in Wallside have been sold. The net price achieved for the purchase of the original leasehold interest and the subsequent freehold interest is £3,459,500. The figures in brackets are as stated at your last meeting.

This page is intentionally left blank

Committee(s)	Dated:
Residents' Consultation Committee Barbican Residential Committee	29 February 2016 14 March 2016
Subject: Service Level Agreements Quarterly Review October – December 2015	Public
Report of: Director of Community and Children's Services Report author: Michael Bennett – Barbican Estate Manager	For Information

Summary

This report, which is for noting, updates Members on the review of the estate wide implementation of Service Level Agreements (SLAs) and Key Performance Measures (KPIs) for the quarter October – December 2015. This report details comments from the House Officers and the Resident Working Party and an ongoing action plan for each of the SLAs.

Recommendation

Members are asked to:

- Note the report.

Main Report

Background

1. This report covers the review of the quarter for October – December 2015 following the estate-wide implementation of the SLAs and KPIs with comments from the House Officers and the resident Working Party as well as an ongoing action plan for each of the service areas.

Current Position

2. All of the agreed six weekly block inspections have been completed in the quarter October – December.
3. House Officers, Resident Services Manager and the Barbican Estate Manager attended the recent SLA Working Party review meeting in January to review the SLAs and KPIs.

4. New comments from the residents Working Party (Tim Macer, Randall Anderson, Jane Smith, David Graves, Robert Barker, Gianetta Corley, Graham Wallace, Fiona Talbot), House Officers, surveys, House Group meetings, RCC and resident general comments/complaints are incorporated into the October – December comments.
5. Actions identified following each quarterly review have been implemented where appropriate and comments are included in the action plans in Appendices 1 to 6.
6. The KPIs are included in Appendix 7. The action plans monitor and show the progress made from each of the quarterly reviews together with all of the comments and responses/actions from the House Officers and resident working party.
7. All of the unresolved issues from the previous quarterly reviews to September 2015 have been carried forward to this current quarterly review. The House Officers as residents' champions determine whether the issue has been dealt with and completed.
8. All of the resolved issues to September 2015 have been filed as completed by the House Officers in conjunction with the resident working party. Once comments are completed, they will be removed and filed.

Proposals

9. The Barbican Estate Office will continue to action and review the comments from the House Officers and Resident Working Parties related to the Customer Care, Supervision and Management, Estate Management, Property Maintenance, Major Works and Open Spaces SLAs.
10. The review of the SLAs and KPIs for the quarter January to March 2016 will take place in April and details of this review will be presented at the June committees.

Conclusion

11. The reviews will continue on a quarterly basis with the Resident SLA working party and actions will be identified and implemented where appropriate, to improve services.

Appendices

- Appendices 1- 6 - SLA Action plans
- Appendix 7 – Key Performance Indicators

Background Papers

Quarterly reports to committee from 2005

Michael Bennett - Barbican Estate Manager

T: 020 7029 3923

E: Michael.bennett@cityoflondon.gov.uk

APPENDIX 1

SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT REVIEW- CUSTOMER CARE, SUPERVISION AND MANAGEMENT 2015

	<u>Quarter</u>	<u>Source</u>	<u>COMMENT/QUERY</u>	<u>RESPONSE/ACTION</u>	<u>COMPLETED</u>
202	Oct - Dec 2015	RCC Qs	A resident has queried the reason for the re-charge for the investigation into water penetration.	This particular instance was reviewed and charge found to be valid. Standard charge principle remains the same, as the investigation into the cause of the water penetration must be done. Info on re-charges are to be included in the reviewed RIP booklet.	✓
201	Oct- Dec 2015	BEO	New Director, Paul Murtagh commenced in January.	Information only.	✓
200	Oct-Dec 2015	ES	Following complaints, contractor letters now have the Barbican logo on it so that residents know it is a genuine letter.	Information only.	✓
199	Oct-Dec 2015	ES	Car Park Box to be trialed as a "Communications Point" so that residents who are not online can remain informed.	Currently proposing that Bunyan Box be the trial area.	
Page 23	July-Sept 2015	HO	Residents private alterations causing a nuisance to other residents. A periodic issue.	First stage review of the Alterations Pack has been carried out with the SLA Working Party. The second stage invited nominated representatives from the House Groups to comment in January. Currently finalising draft of Residents Information Pack.	
	July-Sept 2015	HO	Issue with residents disagreeing with technical advice from BEO and CoL. What is the next step? Procedure review?	If there is disagreement, Residents should follow the complaints procedure.	✓
	July-Sept 2015	SURV	Email broadcast. Please don't use attachments. Put info into the body of the email for smartphones.	BEO to ensure no "word" docs are set out - PDFs only	✓
	July-Sept 2015	HO	Sub letting and holiday lets. 2nd letter about to go to all addresses	Letter to all leaseholders October with update on September committee report and reasons why it is not a good idea to carry out short term holiday lettings	✓
	July-Sept 2015	Residents	Good feedback received about the new BEO online newsletter	For comment only	✓
	Apr-June 2015	HO	Better communications to residents needed by PS about planned work such as scaffolding and balcony work	Scaffolding information is getting to the HOs, but balcony works are still not being communicated. HO advise that the information regarding notifications from Property Services about scaffolding has been largely incorrect, e.g. wrong flat numbers/staircases etc. Still ongoing as not improved - to be highlighted again to PS.	

APPENDIX 1

SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT REVIEW- CUSTOMER CARE, SUPERVISION AND MANAGEMENT 2015

189	Jan - Mar 15	RCC	BEO review of communications – following RCC comments at their AGM - BEO are prioritising the following areas of communications for 2015/16 – quarterly bulletins via the email broadcast, SLA, RIP & Alterations handbooks & welcome packs, increasing resident awareness/usage of email broadcasts, car park offices/lobby desks as sources of information for residents, quarterly messages/updates via leaseholder letters, website.	Ongoing - part of the Comms Plan. Quarterly bulletins (Autumn/Winter). Draft SLA/RIP/Alterations booklets to be presented to SLA WP as 1st stage review & then to nominated resident representatives as 2nd stage review. Quarterly leaseholder letters (summer & Autumn regarding lease enforcement & short term holiday lets). Water Pen letters also to be reviewed. Website been reviewed and is now live.	
187	Jan - Mar 15	AGM	It was requested that BEO send a letter out to all absentee landlords to arrange emergency key access for their properties. This is very useful with cases of water penetration investigations.	This is to be reviewed as part of the Comms Plan, and letters sent out by the BEO.	
183	Oct - Dec 2014	RCC	Formal Q&A Annual Residents' meeting - BEO reviewing	To be given further thought - part of the Comms Plan	
Page 24	Oct-Dec 2013	HO	PS are looking to use all the resident data to improve the service eg. sending water penetration letters to absentee landlords	Work is progressing with the data processing. The introduction of Oracle in 2015 may help with this. Ongoing.	
			Completed Actions - House Officers as residents' champions determine whether the issue has been dealt with and completed satisfactorily		
			SLA Service Level Agreement	LS Leasehold Services	
			GAG Gardens Advisory Group	PS Property Services	
			CPA Car Park Attendant	LL/SC Landlord/Service Charge cost	
			LP Lobby Porter	DCCS Department of Children & Community Services	
			ES Estate Services	COG Core Operational Group	
			BAC Barbican Centre	BOG Barbican Operational Group	
			OS Open Spaces	ESM Estate Service Management	
				BOUG Barbican Occupiers Users Group	
			Source of comments		
			HO House Officers	COM Complaint	
			RCC Residents Consultation Committee	SURV Survey	
			RCC ? RCC Pre Committee Question	HGM House Group Meeting	

APPENDIX 1
SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT REVIEW- CUSTOMER CARE, SUPERVISION AND MANAGEMENT 2015

			RC Residents General Comments	AGM House Group Annual General Meeting	
--	--	--	-------------------------------	--	--

APPENDIX 2
SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT REVIEW - ESTATE MANAGEMENT 2015

	<u>Quarter</u>	<u>Source</u>	<u>COMMENT/QUERY</u>	<u>RESPONSE/ACTION</u>	<u>COMPLETED</u>
181	Oct - Dec 15	RCC Qs	Security of residents. What measures are taken with regard to staff recruitment?	All staff undergo DBS checks.	✓
180	Oct - Dec 15	RCC Qs	Fire Escape Strategy for car parks with regard to shutters and signage.	There has been no change to the strategy. Should residents need advice, in the first instance they should contact their House Officer	✓
179	Oct-Dec 15	HO	Extra resources have been deployed to remove moss and other slip hazards from path & podium walk ways.	Comment only	✓
178	Oct-Dec 15	HO	New Window Cleaning contract has started well. No drop in the levels of service as reflected in the KPI's.	Comment only	✓
177	July-Sept 15	SLA	Beech Street tunnel Garchey bay - cleanliness has deteriorated.	Cleaning Manager reviewing cleaning schedules. * New signage to be installed in this area (not to dump builders waste) to be monitored by H.O.s	
	Jan-Mar 15	HO	Cover staff working in Lobbies or non regular block cleaners.	House Officers should be informed in both instances to be aware of any issues arising. Continue to monitor with Security Manager & Cleaning Manager to ensure good communication. Uniform & ID being reviewed for all Lobby Concierge temporary staff cover.	

APPENDIX 3

SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT REVIEW - PROPERTY MAINTENANCE 2015

	<u>Quarter</u>	<u>Source</u>	<u>COMMENT/QUERY</u>	<u>RESPONSE/ACTION</u>	<u>COMPLETED</u>
192	Oct - Dec 2015	Res	Comments received with regard to main contractor's workmanship in terms of making good/bigger picture. This can be haphazard.		
191	Jul-Sept 2015	SURV	Issue with Repairs Contact Centre communicating with some residents. Little follow up with residents.	Any specific issues are now raised directly with PS	✓
190	Jul-Sept 2015	Res	Issues with damage to building by VFM contractors, e.g. carpet traps in Gilbert House, ceiling tiles in Frobisher Crescent	All repairs raised once installation programme has finished, and recharged back to VFM.	✓
189	Jul-Sept 2015	House Group	Results of the water testing, can these be disclosed to the House Group?	Property Services in the process of sending the last water testing results to the House Group.	
185	Jan - Mar 2015	HO	With regard to planned maintenance on the tower tanks, an inspection of the internal drains under the tanks to be added to maintenance, as these can get blocked.	Property Services confirmed that this will be added to future planned maintenance.	✓
145	Oct-Dec 2011	HO	Water penetration procedure - the letters to update residents on the cause of a leak seem to be being sent out sporadically. Letters not being sent out could lead to complaints and problems caused by residents making late insurance claims.	Reviewed and letters updated. Further monitoring following changes. A note is now added to the repairs system once a letter has been sent to a resident. This appears to have slipped again. PS to be reminded. Ongoing monitoring by HOs. There is still an issue with letters not been sent out, and not being shared in the appropriate (shared) directory which is now being done.	✓

Page 27

APPENDIX 4
SLA AGREEMENT REVIEW - MAJOR WORKS 2015

	<u>Quarter</u>	<u>Source</u>	<u>COMMENT/QUERY</u>	<u>RESPONSE/ACTION</u>	<u>COMPLETED</u>
136	Oct - Dec 2015	RCC Qs	Redecoration costs for Frobisher. Query about when work was last carried out and condition survey at time of development.	City Surveyors do not have a copy of the condition survey. Raised at January BOUG - Barbican Centre to look into.	
135	Oct-Dec 2015	PS	Concrete Survey for the rest of estate has now commenced.	Information only	✓
134	Oct-Dec 2015	PS	Redecs Project now commencing 2016/17:Lauderdale Tower External and Shakespeare Tower External	Information only	✓
133	Jul-Sept 2015	BEO	PS are liaising with the TV consultants & contractor as to the start date of the KPIs for the new Barbican TV network to begin to be monitored (which will be the handover date).	More information and updates needed from VFM.	
132	Jul-Sept 2015	RCC	The Contract award for the works to the Frobisher Crescent west gable end is being progressed.	The works have started.	✓
130	April- June 2015	HO	Frobisher Crescent redecoration work has commenced	Positive feedback received during the resident walkabout in October. Some delays in project due to poor weather. Communication with the BEO/Barbican Centre has been good throughout the project (e.g. with regard to access issues).Project complete.	✓
128	April - June 2015	HO	Cromwell Tower external redecoration nearing final stages.	Resident walkabout being arranged and satisfaction survey out next month. Satisfaction survey going out late October. Most issues were to do with access, and will form part of the lessons learnt review of the project. Residents and contractors to cooperate with each other with regard to access issues. Project complete.	✓

Page 28

APPENDIX 5
SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT REVIEW - OPEN SPACES 2015

	<u>Quarter</u>	<u>Source</u>	<u>COMMENT/QUERY</u>	<u>RESPONSE/ACTION</u>	<u>COMPLETED</u>
163	Oct-Dec 15	RES	Positive comments received about removal of wisteria in Speed Gardens and suitable replacement choice of Trachelospermum jasminoides (evergreen)	For comment only	
162	Oct - Dec 15	BEO	Barbican Lakeside path (Speed House side) - path is to be lifted and relayed with root barrier due to root growth of wisteria	For comment only	
161	July-Sept 15	SLA	Planter removal on Lauderdale Place a concern for Seddon and Lauderdale residents	This decision was taken by the BEO following discussion by the GAG. The BEO will review the possibility of installation of large concrete planters for 2016/17 (subject to funding).	
160	July-Sept 15	SLA	Lake appears to have more litter present.	Passed on to City Gardens Manager. Contributing factor School bins are were not being regulary emptied - this is now being done on a daily basis	
159	July-Sept 15	SURV	"New gardening approach is lovely."	For comment only	✓
158	July-Sept 15	SURV	Is there sufficient investment in the large private gardens?	Being reviewed by the GAG in the first instance.	
157	Jul-Sept 15	SURV	Speed Lawn - new wildflower bed summer 2015 not a great success.	GAG have already discussed - will be rethought with OS plans presented to next GAG meeting	
156	Jul-Sept 15	BEO	Planting to be cut back	Planting (shrubbery) around Breton & Ben Jonson to be cut back in order to reduce abuse of the area.	
150	Oct - Dec 14	RCC	BEO reviewing drainage problems in Thomas More Garden	Drainage engineer to review the areas. Awaiting update from independent drainage specialist. Cleaners to sweep away water from pathway until further solution becomes available.	
127	Jul - Sep 12	HO	Various difficult to access areas (eg Thomas More Hanging Gardens, The Postern, Sculpture Court) - problems with safety equipment currently being reviewed.	Thomas More Hanging Gardens - quote from contractor. Listed Building Consent application rejected by Planning Department currently being reviewed again. (Update) following the previous application being rejected by Planning a new application is being put in. Works completed.	✓

APPENDIX 5
SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT REVIEW - OPEN SPACES 2015

--	--	--	--	--	--

APPENDIX 6 SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT :LANDLORDS COMMENTS

	<u>Quarter</u>	<u>Source</u>	<u>COMMENT/QUERY</u>	<u>RESPONSE/ACTION</u>	<u>COMPLETED</u>
26	Oct - Dec 2015	RCC Qs	Podium maintenance - issues with drainage causing leaks	Additional monies approved for drainage in 2015/16 for the cyclical programme. Longer term strategy for leaks through podium being reviewed.	
24	Oct - Dec 2015	RCC Qs	Frobisher Crescent lifts - to provide KPIs for the specific lifts	Current lift contract only includes KPIs for planned maintenance not reactive repairs. Barbican Centre looking to get performance reports incorporated into this current contract and for new contract (due 2017) to have KPIs for both planned maintenance and reactive repairs.	
24	Oct-Dec 2015	PS	The amount of podium tiling repairs has increased and the new stair tile edges are being completed.	Information only. White paint to be reviewed.	
23	Oct- Dec 2015	BEO	Beech Gardens Fountain Survey to be sent out in 2016.	Actions to follow from the responses.	
22	July - Sept 2015	SLA	Vent shafts in Beech Street tunnel - grills require cleaning.	BEO to raise at next BOUG.	
21	July-Sept 2015	HO	Signage Review - should the Bylaws for the Public Highwalk be more prominent than they are now?	Additional vinyl signs now purchased - no cycling, no skateboarding and dogs to be on a lead.	
20	July-Sept 2015	COM	Comment that dog mess is far more prevalent on the podium.	HOs note that in their view, this has not got worse in recent months. Dogs appear to be more evident however (possibly due to local developments that do allow pets). HOs will continue to monitor as will Cleaners.	
19	July-Sept 2015	SURV	The podium is in a greater state of disrepair than it used to be	Possibly due to BG project? And the increase in the tiling works may also have contributed to this comment on the survey.	✓

APPENDIX 6
SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT :LANDLORDS COMMENTS

Appendix 7. Barbican KPIs 2015-16

Title of Indicator	TARGET 2014/15	TARGET 2015/16	OCT-DEC 2104	JAN-MAR 2015		APR-JUN 2015	JULY-SEPT 2015	OCT-DEC 2105	JAN-MAR 2016	PROGRESS AGAINST TARGET	SUMMARY	Actual 2015/16
Customer Care												
Answer all letters satisfactorily with a full reply within 10 working days	100%	100%	94%	97%		100%	96%	100%		☺	45/45	
Answer all emails to public email addresses within 1 day and a full reply to requests for information within 10 days	100%	100%	94%	100%		100%	96%	100%		☺	39/39	
To resolve written complaints satisfactorily within 14 days	100%	100%	100%	100%		100%	100%	100%		☺	2 complaints received. 1 about a repair and 1 about contractors being on JTC ramp.	
Repairs & Maintenance												
% 'Urgent' repairs (complete within 24 hours)	95%	95%	97%	97%		99%	99%	99%		☺		
% 'Intermediate' repairs (complete within 3 working days)	95%	95%	98%	99%		99%	97%	99%		☺		
% 'Non-urgent' repairs (complete within 5 working days)	95%	95%	99%	99%		99%	98%	100%		☺		

Title of Indicator	TARGET 2014/15	TARGET 2015/16	OCT - DEC 2104	JAN - MAR 2015		APR - JUN 2015	JULY - SEPT 2015	OCT - DEC 2105	JAN - MAR 2016	PROGRESS AGAINST TARGET	SUMMARY	Actual 2015/16
% 'Low priority' repairs (complete within 20 working days)	95%	95%	100%	100%		95%	96%	99%		☺		
Availability % of Barbican lifts	99%	99%	Tower lifts 98.98%	Tower lifts 99.03%		Tower lifts 98.49%	Tower Lifts 98.76%	Tower Lifts 97.45%		☹	This low figure is as a result of a possible glitch in the lift company's upgraded elevator monitoring system (2 x lifts were shown to be out of service, but upon lift engineers arrival they were in service)	
			Terrace lifts 97.96%	Terrace lifts 99.25%		Terrace lifts 99.54%	Terrace Lifts 99.17%	Terrace Lifts 98.89%		☹	Missed the KPI target by 0.11%	
Percentage of communal light bulbs - percentage meeting 5 working days target	90%	90%	96%	96%		90%	96%	94%		☺	312 out of 332 lights met the KPI	%
Background heating - percentage serviced within target. Total loss 24hrs/ Partial loss 3 working days	Total 90% Partial 90%	Total 90% Partial 90%	Total 95% Partial 100%	Total 88% Partial 98%		N/A	N/A	Total 100% Partial 100%		☺		Total % Partial %

Title of Indicator	TARGET 2014/15	TARGET 2015/16	OCT - DEC 2104	JAN - MAR 2015		APR - JUN 2015	JULY - SEPT 2015	OCT - DEC 2105	JAN - MAR 2016	PROGRES S AGAINST TARGET	SUMMARY	Actual 2015/16
Communal locks & closures - percentage of repeat orders raised within 5 working days of original order	0%	0%	0%	0%		0%	0%	0%		☺		0%
Replacement of lift car light bulbs - percentage meeting 5 working days target	90%	90%	100%	93%		100%	100%	100%		☺	21 out of 21 lights met the KPI	
Estate Management												
House Officer 6-weekly joint inspections with House Group representatives monitoring block cleaning - good and very good standard	90%	90%	92%	89%		93%	98%	100%		☺	40/40	
House Officer 6-weekly joint inspections with House Group representatives monitoring communal window cleaning - good and very good standard	80%	80%	87%	76%		87%	98%	95%		☺	36/38	

Title of Indicator	TARGET 2014/15	TARGET 2015/16	OCT - DEC 2104	JAN - MAR 2015		APR - JUN 2015	JULY - SEPT 2015	OCT - DEC 2105	JAN - MAR 2016	PROGRES S AGAINST TARGET	SUMMARY	Actual 2015/16
% Overall Resident satisfaction of completed Major Works Projects (£50k+)	90%	90%	n/a	Breton 66% Ben Jonson 86%		NA	N/A	75%		☹️	Frobisher Crescent external redecorations - 3 out of 4 respondants satisfied with works	

This page is intentionally left blank

Agenda Item 8

Committee:	Date:
Residents' Consultation Committee (information) Barbican Residential Committee (decision)	29 February 2016 14 March 2016
Subject: Service Based Review Proposals – Department of Community & Children's Services	Public
Report of: Director of Community and Children's Services Report Author: Barry Ashton – Car Park and Security Manager	For Decision

Summary

1. The Service Based Review aims to deliver sustainable savings and/or increased income in order to balance City Fund and City's Cash over the medium term. The proposals put forward by Chief Officers were approved by the Policy & Resources Committee included a total of £844K for the Department of Community & Children's Services towards this overall target.
2. The Barbican Residential Committee (BRC) approved the 3 year budget reduction plan of generating income for 2017/18 of £124,000 for car parking and £30,000 for baggage stores as part of the City's Service Based Review in 2014.

Recommendation

3. It is recommended that options 1, 2, 3 and 4 as set out in paragraph 10 are progressed. The completion of the Blake Tower residential development in late 2016 is likely to generate additional car parking income for 2017/18. Procurement of either 100 or 200 additional stores or possibly other storage options should satisfy current and future demand and lead to additional income for 2017/18. Market testing of the car parks for alternative uses such as a consolidation centre and storage (and the relevant planning process) could begin in the Spring of 2016.
4. The December BRC did not approve a 5% increase for car parking and a revised report is being presented at the same time as this Service Based Review options report. The recommendation of the car parking charging report is for an increase based on RPI (income for 2016/17) and the next report will be presented to BRC in December 2016 in the normal manner for the 2017/18 charges.
5. It is recommended that an updated Service Based Review report be presented to September/December 2016 BRC to review progress with the options and if there is anticipated to be a shortfall in achieving the 2017/18 budget plan then option 5 (change in car parking charging policy) and option 6 (reduction in staff costs) would need to be considered. Furthermore, a Strategic Audit of the car parks by Chamberlains Internal Audit may inform future car park strategy.

Main Report

Background

6. The Service Based Review was initiated in 2013 in response to forecast City Fund deficits over the medium term which were due primarily to large reductions in government funding, and the expectation of future grant reductions for the foreseeable future. City's Cash was subsequently included as deficits are also being forecast for this fund over the medium term.
7. The aim of the review is to deliver significant and sustainable savings and/or increased income in order to balance the two funds over the medium term. The overall target has been set at £20m by the Policy and Resources Committee.

Current Position

8. Officers have been reviewing a number of options to achieve the budget plan for 2017/18 and following a meeting with the Planning Officers in December 2015, there are now three options to take forward:
 - utilising car park space for alternative uses
 - reviewing the car parking charges
 - reducing costs

Options

9. This report provides a number of options for officers to progress in 2016 to achieve the budget plan (please also refer to the Appendix):
 - The completion of the Blake Tower residential development in late 2016 is likely to generate additional car parking income of circa £20k per annum(pa) (option 1)
 - Additional stores/storage space to meet demand and generate income of between £40k pa and £80k pa with the possibility of further income depending on demand and funding (option 2)
 - Potential for alternative uses of the car parks by market testing for a consolidation centre (parcel delivery centre) and/or storage (options 3 and 4)
 - A change in the charging policy to reflect obtaining best value from the car parks and not just the current Retail Price Index (RPI) which has been the basis for charges over the last 5 years (option 5)
 - Reduction in costs by reducing staff costs (option 6)

Proposals

10. A summary of the recommendations are detailed in the table below:-

Option Number	Option	Recommendation	Potential Income
1	Residential Car Parking - Blake Tower development of 76 flats	Progress with new leaseholders	£20k
2	Additional residential stores/storage space	Procure 100/200 or more new stores 16/17	£40k-£80k
3	Consolidation Centre (parcel delivery centre)	Progress with previous interested parties and marketing letting agents	£50k-£60k
4	Storage Company Facilities	Progress with previous interested parties and marketing letting agents	£70k-£110k
5	Change in Car Park Charging Policy	Review charging policy, for example, charges based on 5% increase rather than RPI in December 2016 in conjunction with Strategic Audit of the Car Park Account	£48,796
6	Reduction in costs by reducing staff costs	Review in December 2016 in conjunction with City audit of the Car Park Account	£70k-£140k
Required Additional Income			£154k

Corporate & Strategic Implications

11. The options in this report have been put forward following the City's Service Based Review and forms part of the Departmental Business Plan. These options have been developed in conjunction with the Planning and Parking Policies within the local Plan and the London Planning Policy
12. Officers have considered other options including marketing to potential external users and neighbouring developments for commercial parking but the City's Planning Officers have advised that this would be contrary to Condition 7 of the Planning and Parking Policies within the Local Plan.
13. City Transportation have also confirmed that commercial car parking would be contrary to policies to restrain commuting to the City by car and the Policy DM16.6 in the Local Plan does not permit new public car parks or the temporary

use of vacant spaces. Therefore, the City's Planning function would oppose planning permission being granted for commercial car parking so these options are not being explored further by officers.

14. Members will be aware that the City of London Operational Property Review completed last year has confirmed that there is currently an overall underutilisation of Car Park spaces provided by the City of London across various car parks it provides in the Central London area. A new strand of work is now commencing covering Municipal car parks operated by the Director of Built Environment, Markets (Smithfield), Barbican Estate Residential Car Parking and Barbican Centre car park. This cross-cutting workstream will consider the improved management of short term car spaces, matching demand to supply across all car parks by maximising lettings to third parties (possibly through additional services & tariff arrangements). The detailed evaluation of the options developed for the Barbican Residential Car Parking will be considered for synergies within this overall car parks workstream.

Conclusion

15. The Service Based Review requires that we achieve £154,000 additional income in 2017/18 for the Car Parking and Baggage Store Account. If members approve officers progressing options one to four in this report we will be in a position to provide an update report in December 2016. If it is anticipated that there will be a shortfall in achieving the 2017/18 budget plan then options 5 and 6 would need to be considered.

16. The City has a duty to achieve a reasonable return from its assets having regard to market levels and any net surplus generated benefits the City Fund.

Implications/Consultees

17. The Chamberlain, City Surveyors, Chief Planning Officer and Comptroller & City Solicitor have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

Background Papers:

- Car Park Strategy Stage One report 2009
- Barbican Estate Car Park Efficiency Strategy Working Party report 2011
- Car Park Charging Policy report 2016
- Baggage Store Charging Policy report 2014
- Revenue and Capital Budgets – Latest Approved Budget 2013/14 and Original Budget 2014/15.
- Service Based Review Proposals – Department of Community & Children's Services 2014

Contact:

Barry Ashton – Car Park and Security Manager

020 7029 7920

barry.ashton@cityoflondon.gov.uk

Appendix

Option 1 - Residential Car Parking - Blake Tower development of 76 flats

Issue	Comment	Action
Location	Bunyan Car Park (nearest car park) which will provide out of hours concierge services (19.00 to 07.00) to Blake Tower residents	
Usage	Residential Car Parking	
Occupancy	15 to 60 bays (60 have been reserved via City Surveyors, but forecast is based on Frobisher Crescent with a 20% take up)	Estate agents to detail facilities & BEO Welcome Pack to offer car parking services to new residents (residents will take individual licences from the Barbican Estate Office)
Potential Income	Circa £20k pa to £75k pa	Review occupancy /position August 2016 for 17/18 budgets
Approx. cost	Normal Officer time	
Timescales	Anticipated completion of property October 2016 with full occupancy of Blake Tower expected December 2016 with potential income for 17/18	
Likely outcome	Circa £20k pa income for 17/18 (based on Frobisher Crescent with a 20% take up)	

Pros	Cons
Car Parking only	Not guaranteed number of bays
No cost - facilities already in place	Not guaranteed period of time
Sufficient space within current Bunyan Car Park (Occupancy at 35% 135 vacant bays) Would also look to occupy void areas.	
As additional Barbican Estate residents	
The successful waterproofing of the above Podium/Walkway in Beech Gardens will prevent any further water penetration into Bunyan Car Park	

Option 2 - Additional Residential Stores

1. A reconciliation of the current waiting list for stores in conjunction with the recent resident survey has been carried out. There were 440 respondents to the survey with a high demand for standard, large and other possibly larger stores. There is currently a waiting list of over 260 residents for a store. An option to generate income and satisfy demand would be to utilise the car parks void areas/vacant bays with further stores/storage space.
2. The option is to build as many stores as possible and to future proof demand. If there was still availability then the other possibility would be to offer some of the stores to other City residents within walking distance, subject to planning permission. The new charges for any proposed new sized stores would be subject to BRC approval.

	Comment	Action
Location	Void areas or vacant bays within the car parks especially Bunyan/Breton Car Parks	
Usage	Residential stores	
Occupancy	Approx. 65 to 130 bays for an additional 100 or 200 storage units. The resident's survey has shown a demand for varying types of storage.	
Potential Income	Circa £40k pa to £80k pa – plus subject to funding.	Reconciliation of the current store waiting list completed January 2016. Resident survey January 2016 shows a demand for various types of residential storage particularly larger stores.
Approx. cost	Circa £100k to £200k TBC dependant on varying options to procure/build the storage	
Timescales	Anticipated completion of procurement/development late 2016/early 2017 with potential income for 17/18	
Likely outcome	Circa £40k pa to £80k pa – plus subject to funding.	

Pros	Cons
Currently no availability of stores for residents	May not be considered best value for the car parks
There are currently over 260 residents on the waiting list for a store	Any new sized stores would require new rates to be approved by BRC
Utilising car parks for residential services i.e. further storage	Listing and Planning Applications. The Planning Officer has confirmed that a change of use for some of the car park bays to residential storage would be acceptable subject to the necessary planning application (Pro & Con)
Possibility of funding from BRC non-service charge underspend 2015/16 for carry forward works in 2016/17. Payback period anticipated to be less than 3 years	Dependant on funding from DCCS underspends. Approval by Chamberlains would require a business case, a bid for capital and fulfil the payback criteria to receive priority funding. Procurement would be carried out via the City's Gateway process in Spring 2016
Sufficient space with current occupancy (Nov.15):- Bunyan - 35% and 135 vacant bays Breton - 47% and 125 vacant bays Would also look to occupy void areas.	The options to be progressed need to be prioritised to ensure no more than the current vacant bays are utilised (plus allocated temporary car parking bays and any potential Cultural Hub implications)
As additional Barbican Estate residents	

3. Due to increased online deliveries the BEO are also reviewing storage facilities for residents' parcels for the Estate Concierge service in the car parks. This review will be carried out in conjunction with the option of further residential storage and subject to a planning application. These facilities would be charged to the service charge account.

Option 3 - Consolidation Centre (parcel delivery centre)

Issue	Comment	Action
Location	Bunyan or Breton Car Park and relocating current residents parking/facilities to designated areas of these car parks	
Usage	Consolidation centre for parcel deliveries for city residents and commercial companies (based on previous discussions with interested parties)	Progress discussions with interested parties and with marketing letting agents
Occupancy	30 to over 50 bays (based on discussions with interested parties)	
Potential Income	Circa £50k pa to £60k pa (based on previous discussions with interested parties)	Review position August 2016 for 17/18 budgets

Approx. cost	Circa £10,000 per car park (TBC & dependant on car park) to possibly relocate existing transportable stores, bicycle cages and any other modifications (TBC). Marketing letting costs	
Timescales		Marketing Spring 2016
Likely outcome	Possible income for 17/18 dependant on market testing & issues highlighted in 'con's' below	

Pros	Cons
Low cost – stores/facilities & possibly any potential additional security arrangements to be installed by Consolidation centre company	Breton House Car Park suffers from severe water penetration, but the use of over 100 metres of drip trays prevents damage to vehicles parked within bays. Multiple water staining & stalactites in car park. However the successful waterproofing of the above Podium/Walkway will prevent any further water penetration into the Bunyan Car Park.
Sufficient space with current occupancy (Nov.15):- Breton - 47% and 125 vacant bays Bunyan - 35% and 135 vacant bays Would also look to occupy void areas.	Opening hours, delivery times, noise of deliveries & operations could disturb and disrupt residents. Would need to consult with residents, Environmental Health & Highways
Guaranteed number of bays	Fire safety & security would need to be reviewed
Guaranteed period of time	Management of contract (liaison, monitoring, complaints etc.)
City Transportation have confirmed that they would support the productive re-use of the car parks for a well-designed and managed Consolidation Centre. The City's Planning Officer has confirmed that the potential use of the car parks for a Consolidation Centre would be acceptable, particularly if it allowed for the final delivery stage of journeys to be made by electric vehicles. London Plan policy 6.14 requires boroughs to identify sites for Consolidation Centres.	Listing and Planning Applications. A permanent planning application would be submitted for the maximum area and the maximum number of bays for any potential future demand (including potential temporary usage). These facilities would not find favour with residents and there would be objections The options to be progressed need to be prioritised to ensure no more than the current vacant bays are utilised (plus allocated temporary car parking bays)

Original Officer/Member Working Party agreed to review all income options (& cost saving options as a last resort)	External signage
	Residents not favourable to non-residents within car parks (viewed by some residents as their car parks not as a City asset)

Option 4 - Storage Company Facilities

Issue	Comment	Action
Location	Bunyan or Breton Car Park and relocating current residents parking/facilities to designated areas of these car parks	
Usage	Storage facilities for other city residents and commercial companies (based on previous discussions with interested party)	Discussions on hold due to other potential Barbican Estate development projects. Progress with marketing letting agents
Occupancy	50 to 100 Bays 100 bays is based on previous discussions with interested party)	
Potential Income	Circa £70k pa to £110k pa (based on previous discussions with other storage companies and market agents)	Review position August 2016 for 17/18 budgets
Approx. cost	Circa £20,000 per car park (TBC & dependant on car park) to relocate existing transportable stores, bicycle cages and any other modifications (TBC). Marketing letting costs	
Timescales		Marketing Spring 2016
Likely outcome	Possible income for 17/18 dependant on market testing & issues highlighted in 'con's' below	

Pros	Cons
Low cost – stores/facilities & possibly any potential additional security arrangements to be installed by company	Breton House Car Park suffers from severe water penetration, but the use of over 100 metres of drip trays prevents damage to vehicles parked within bays. Multiple water staining & stalactites in car park. The successful waterproofing of the above Podium/Walkway in Beech Gardens prevents any further water penetration into Bunyan Car Park.
Sufficient space with current occupancy (Nov.15):- Bunyan - 35% and 135 vacant bays Breton - 47% and 125 vacant bays Would also look to occupy void areas.	Opening hours, delivery times, noise of deliveries & operations could disturb and disrupt residents. Would need to consult with residents, Environmental Health & Highways
Guaranteed number of bays	Fire safety & security would need to be reviewed
Guaranteed period of time	Management of contract (liaison, monitoring, complaints etc.)
Can include cost to have car park returned to useable bays at end of contract	External signage
City Transportation have confirmed that they would support the productive re-use of the car parks for a well-designed and managed storage facility. The City's Planning Officer have confirmed that the potential use of the car parks for a storage facility would be acceptable.	Listing and Planning Applications. A permanent planning application would be submitted for the maximum area and the maximum number of bays for any potential future demand (including potential temporary usage). These facilities would not find favour with residents and there would be objections
Could utilise stores for our residents	Residents not favourable to non-residents within car parks (viewed by some residents as their car parks not as a City asset)
Original Officer/Member Working Party agreed to review all income options (& cost saving options as a last resort)	The options to be progressed need to be prioritised to ensure no more than the current vacant bays are utilised (plus allocated temporary car parking bays)

Option 5 - Change in Car Park Charging Policy

4. For a number of years up until 2009 BRC did not approve any changes in car parking charges. However, since 2009 car parking charges have been reviewed based on the increase in RPI which has varied between 0% and 5.2%. In 2014 the RPI increase was 2.3%.

5. Over the last 10 years the number of let residential bays has reduced by between 1% and 5% per annum demonstrating that price has not necessarily been a factor in the gradual decrease in occupancy. A comparison of local car parking charges also shows that the rates for the Barbican Estate are lower than elsewhere. All of this information is presented in the accompanying report to the BRC. The annual report in December had recommended a change in charging from the increase in RPI to 5% for 2016/17.
6. In December 2015 BRC did not approve the above change in charging so the revised report will be represented at the same time as this Service Based Review options report. The recommendation of the car parking charging report is based on RPI and that the next report will be presented to BRC in December 2016 in the normal manner for the 2017/18 charges. There remains the potential to move away from RPI as a basis for reviewing car park charges.
7. A Strategic Audit of the Car Parks by Chamberlains Internal Audit has been commissioned which will inform future car park strategy. There is a risk of reputational damage to the City by continuing to manage the Car Park Account in deficit. The Original Budget for 2016-17 shows net expenditure, after capital charges, by the City on Car Parking is expected to be £237,000.

Issue	Comment	Action
Location	Car Parks	
Usage	Residential Car Parking	
Occupancy	67%	
Potential Income	£48,796 for a full financial year based on a change in charging policy (for example 5% increase) and current occupancy	Review occupancy/position August 2016 for 17/18 budgets
Approx. cost	Normal Officer time	
Timescales	Proposing that car park charging report would be presented to BRC again in December 2016 to obtain approval for future charges to apply to the full accounting year 2017/18. Potential income for 17/18 subject to BRC approval	
Likely outcome	£8,855 for the period July 2016 to March 2017 based on no change in charging (RPI) and BRC approval. Income for 2017/18 dependant on BRC approval in December 2016	

Pros	Cons
Members approval of options 1 to 4 would help to determine whether option 5 needs to be progressed to achieve 17/18 Service Based Review budget plan	Change of recent car park charging policy
Strategic Audit of the Car Park Account may determine whether option 5 needs to be progressed	Occupancy may reduce at times of charges higher than RPI
	Residents may choose to park elsewhere

Option 6 - Reduction in costs by reducing staff costs

8. An original officer/Member Working Party from 2009 and Committee report agreed that in future all income options were to be reviewed and cost saving options pursued as a last resort. If the Service Based Review's budget plan is not achieved after all of the income options have been explored and the recommendations of the Strategic Audit of the Car Park Account are analysed there would be the possibility of reviewing the reduction in costs option. The highest cost to the Car Park Account is staff costs (which includes salary, uniforms, pension, National Insurance, overtime and superannuation) and there are a number of options.

Issue	Comment
Location	Car Parks
Usage	Concierge Staff
Occupancy	67%
Potential Income/savings	The Concierge service at one of the car park offices could be provided for 12 hours (with services for the other 12 hours provided at one of the neighbouring car park offices) – this option would reduce costs by circa £70k pa. Alternatively the Concierge service at one of the car park offices could cease (with services provided at one of the neighbouring car park offices) – this option would reduce costs by circa £140k pa.
Approx. cost	Potential redundancy costs depending on recruitment position
Timescales	Review in December 2016 report in conjunction with Strategic Audit of the Car Park Account and if all other options have been explored and/or members do not recommend other options to generate the required income and there is a forecasted shortfall in achieving the budget plan
Likely outcome	As above

Pros	Cons
These options could help achieve the budget plan if all other options have been explored and or members do not recommend other options to generate the required income	These options would be the 'last resort' and would not find favour with residents
Strategic Audit of the Car Park Account may determine whether option 6 needs to be progressed	

Other options

9. Officers have considered other options including marketing to potential external users and neighbouring developments for commercial parking but the City's Planning Officer has advised that this would be contrary to Condition 7 of the Planning and Parking Policies within the Local Plan.

10. City Transportation has also confirmed that commercial car parking would be contrary to policies to restrain commuting to the City by car and Policy DM16.6 in the Local Plan does not permit new public car parks or the temporary use of vacant spaces. Therefore, the City's Planning Officer would oppose planning permission being granted for commercial car parking so these options are not being explored further by officers.

This page is intentionally left blank

Committee:	Date:
Residents' Consultation Committee (for information)	29 February 2016
Barbican Residential Committee (for decision)	14 March 2016
Subject:	Public
Car Park Charging	
Report of:	
Director of Community and Children's Services	
Report author:	For Information/ Decision
Barry Ashton – Car Park and Security Manager	

Summary

1. This report, which is for decision, seeks to extend the current charging policy for car parking on the Estate for a further nine months from June 2016 to March 2017.
2. Fees have been reviewed between 2009 and 2014 in relation to the annual increase in the Retail Price Index (RPI) published by the Office of National Statistics in the last available month before committee.
3. It is proposed to extend this charging policy for car parking for a further nine months from June 2016 to March 2017 and to review the policy again in December 2016.
4. This report also includes an analysis of local demand, utilisation, comparisons, income generation and a review of temporary car parking.

Recommendation

5. That all car parking licence fees are to be subject to review from 24 June 2016 to allow appropriate notice to be given to car park users. The increase to be calculated by reference to the increase in RPI published by the Office for National Statistics between December 2014 (257.5) and December 2015 (260.6). The RPI published in December 2015 showed a year on year increase of 1.2%.
6. At current levels of occupancy these measures should increase car park revenue for the period of 24 June 2016 to 24 March 2017 by an estimated £8,855. The charging policy to be reviewed again in December 2016 in order to be in line with the City of London's full financial year.
7. That Temporary Car Parking becomes a cashless system, with payments to be made by Direct Debit, Credit/Debit Cards and Online payments.

Main Report

Background

8. Car parking charges were increased only once during the period 1997 to 2008. In 2008 the Car Park Charging report outlined a number of measures which could potentially reduce costs or increase income to the City Fund. The Barbican Residential Committee approved a 2 year Car Parking Charging Policy from 2008/2009 and the Barbican Estate Office was instructed to achieve additional income from the Barbican Estate Car Parks.
9. In 2011 the Barbican Residential Committee approved an annual review of the car park charges due to the highlighted financial pressures on the Barbican Estate Car Parks and on the City Fund.
10. The Barbican Residential Committee in 2014 resolved that the fees for car parking would be subject to an increase for that year; with the increase to be calculated by reference to the increase in RPI.
11. The method of utilising the RPI as a basis for reviewing car parking charges has been accepted by residents and this method of calculation has resulted in the following increases:

June 2010	June 2011	June 2012	June 2013	March 2014	March 2015
4.9%	nil	5.2 %	2.6%	2.4%	2.3%

12. The City's Service Based Review in 2014 detailed a 3 year budget reduction plan of generating income for 2017/18 of £124,000 for car parking and £30,000 for baggage stores which was approved by the Barbican Residential Committee.
 13. In December 2015 a report based on an increase in car park charges of 5% and not the RPI increase was recommended, was not approved by the Barbican Residential Committee. This report has been represented and should be read in conjunction with the Service Based Review report, which is also being presented at this committee.
- Car Park Charging**
14. If RPI uplift is the basis for reviewing car park charges for 2016/17 the increased income would be an estimated £8,855.
 15. There are currently 1508 car bays within the Barbican Estate's car parks. The below table details the current car bay letting figures and by applying the published December 2015 RPI increase of 1.2%, the following car parking charges will apply.

Licence Type	Number of Users	Current Rate	New Rate
Residential Car Bay	682	£1,210	£1,225
Daily Car Parking	7,800	£9.89	£10.00
Commercial Car Bay - excludes other contracts (inc. VAT)	10	£5,314	£5,378
Residential Motorcycle Bay	26	£226	£229
Bicycle Lockers	100	£85	£86

Car Park Occupancy

16. The current car park occupancy rate is included in Appendix 1, with the overall occupancy rate at 67%.
17. The letting of residential car bays has continued to decrease, since 2006, regardless of price change. The history for the Barbican Estate Car Parking Bay usage is shown in Appendix 2.

Car Parking Charges Comparisons

18. Charges for other car parks both public and private in the City of London are included in Appendix 3, together with the level of service provided. In this context it should be noted that although the Barbican Estate's current charges for residential parking of £1,210 p.a. are higher than those of the other City of London Corporation car parks listed (£740- £1,050 p.a.) these alternative car parks are offered on a first come first served basis and in terms of the service offered some are unmanned or only manned at specific times. Charges for car parks which offer similar services to the Barbican Estate are considerably higher (£1,524 - £4,000 p.a.) than those on the Barbican Estate.

Income Generation

19. The Barbican Estate car parks continue to run at a loss and are subsidised by the City Fund, which is against City of London policy for best value for assets. A strategic audit of the car park's income, expenditure and financial viability will be included into our Departmental Audit Plan. Savings in the Barbican Estate car parks are part of the City's Service Based Review targets, with an options report also being presented to this committee, highlighting a way forward for a strategy for the car park account.
20. The financial position for 2015/16 has been helped by Deutsche Bank retaining 24 commercial bays, which are let at market value rates. However, they have surrendered 34 bays over the last two years.

21. The City of London Corporation's policy for the car parks is to balance the objectives of providing well managed and secure parking facilities on the one hand with seeking to fulfil its continuing obligation to obtain value for money in the use of City Fund resources.
22. Officers have been exploring a number of options and opportunities for unused car park areas following the Barbican Residential Committee's approval of the Service Based Review of additional income targets of £124,000 for the financial year 2017/18 for the car parks. These are outlined in the Service Based Review Report.
23. If RPI is the basis for reviewing car park charges for 2016/17 the increased income would be ££8,855. The charging policy will be reviewed again in nine months' time (charges based on 5% increase rather than RPI, in conjunction with a City audit of the Car Park Account).

Temporary Car Parking

24. The Chamberlains Internal Audit Section recommended that Temporary Car Parking become a cashless system, with payments made by Direct Debit, Credit/Debit Cards and Online payments only. Payment for both temporary and permanent parking with cash is resource intensive (in terms of officers' time to issue, record, reconcile and bank the cash) and for that reason it is not at all cost effective when compared with cashless payment systems. The audit recommended that cash payments should be discouraged for Permanent Car Parking and not accepted at all for Temporary Car Parking.
 - Over a 12 month period the Barbican Estate Reception received 101 payments for Temporary Car Parking – less than 9 a month.
 - The total amount of cash/cheque payments received for Temporary Car Parking over this same 12 month period was £1,771 – less than £150 a month.
25. The overall car park income for the Barbican Estate is £1.4 million; however Temporary Car Parking contributes only £70k (5%). Many companies (TfL Buses & Dartford Crossing) have adopted a cashless approach for short term/low level payments and it is recommended that the Barbican Estate does the same.
26. It is also recommended that the Barbican Estate Office investigates further the phasing out of the old carbon paper ticket system in favour of the automated PayByPhone system.
27. The Barbican Estate Office provides the following to assist residents with PayByPhone:-
 - Leaflets
 - Posters/Flyers
 - Website
 - Stickers

- Letters
- Newsletters
- Email Broadcast
- Concierge Training (including how to assist a resident)

28. PayByPhone have confirmed that the marketing detailed above has increased payments to over 50% via this method, with the need to speak to a person now extremely low. The following table provides an analysis of transactions:

Transaction Method	Usage between Apr15 and Sep15
Mobile Web/App	71.43%
IVR (Interactive Voice Response)	25.78%
SMS	1.88%
Customer Services	0.91%

29. The Barbican Estate Office will continue to monitor and review the marketing of the automated PayByPhone system as it looks to phase out the carbon paper ticket system.

Financial Implications

30. As the car park charging review has been delayed it will not be in line with the City of London's full Financial Year and for only nine months up to March 2017. It is anticipated that a review of the Barbican Estate's car park account by a City audit will inform future car park charging strategy in conjunction with the on-going Service Based Review.

31. The Original Budget for 2016-17 shows net expenditure, after capital charges, by the City on Car Parking is expected to be £237,000.

32. Due to an increase in City of London salary, National Insurance and a return to a full complement of concierge staff (including Pensions), financial year 2016/17 will see an increase in staff costs by £29,000.

Consultees

33. The Chamberlain, Town Clerks, Comptroller & City Solicitor and City Surveyor have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

Conclusion

34. The City has a duty to achieve a reasonable return from its assets having regard to market levels and any net surplus generated benefits the City Fund. The next review of car park charging in December 2016 will need to be carried out in conjunction with the Service Based Review and the City audit of the car park account.

Background Papers:

Car Park Strategy Stage One report 2009

Barbican Estate Car Park Efficiency Strategy Working Party report 2011

Car Park Charging Policy report 2014

Revenue and Capital Budgets – Latest Approved Budget 2013/14 and Original Budget 2014/15.

Service Based Review Proposals – Department of Community & Children’s Services 2014 and 2016

Ade Adetosoye

Director of Community & Children’s Services

Contact:

Barry Ashton – Car Park and Security Manager

020 7029 7920 - barry.ashton@cityoflondon.gov.uk

Appendix 1.

**CAR PARK OCCUPANCY
AS AT NOVEMBER 2015**

CAR PARK	ANDREWES	BRETON	BUNYAN	CROMWELL	DEFOE	SPEED	LAUDERDALE	THOMAS MORE	01 WILLOUGHBY	03 WILLOUGHBY	TOTALS	PREVIOUS TOTALS (JULY 2015)
SOLD	16	2	1	10	34	114	20	13	5	79	294	296
RESIDENTIAL	95	75	69	57	102	33	72	90	84	5	682	682
COMMERCIAL	0	24	4	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	34	57
VACANT	24	138	135	25	24	8	13	47	59	25	498	473
TOTALS	135	239	209	92	160	155	105	150	154	109	1508	1508

FORMER CAR BAYS	2	30	45	9	5	21	29	26	18	21	206
-----------------	---	----	----	---	---	----	----	----	----	----	-----

Former Car Bays - Reasons why no longer used as car bays:

- BAGGAGE STORES / TRANSPORTABLE BAGGAGE STORES
- BAYS TOO SMALL / AWKWARD TO PARK
- BICYCLE LOCKERS / RACKS / CAGES / MOBILITY SCOOTERS
- CAR PARKING OFFICES
- ENTRANCES / EXITS TO BLOCKS
- FIRE EXITS/FIRE HOSE REEL STORAGE
- LOW CEILING HEIGHTS/OPEN TO ELEMENTS/PILLARS

164 Former Bays removed from the system in 2008

In addition to the original 100 transportable baggage stores located in Breton, Bunyan, 03 Willoughby and Lauderdale car parks, utilising 41 former car parking bays

Visitors Bays

With the exception of Thomas More Car Park which has twelve designated visitor's bays (not included in figures) all the other car parks utilise the vacant bays.

Heron Tower Development

July/August 2013 - 184 sold bays Heron - 03 Willoughby (76 bays) and Speed (108 bays) car parks

24 temporary commercial bays at Breton House car park is for 1 contract

Appendix 2.

HISTORY OF BARBICAN ESTATE CAR PARKING BAY USAGE NOVEMBER 2015

Date	Residential Let Bays	Residential Let Bays +/-	Commercial Let Bays	Sold Bays	Total Usage	Total	Occupancy %	Comments
Mar-04	843	-	19	123	985	1,769	55.7	
Apr-05	869	3%	11	125	1,005	1,769	56.8	
Jun-06	863	-1%	20	134	1,017	1,702	59.8	67 Car Parking Bays reduced due to Milton Court
Dec-07	848	-2%	35	117	1,000	1,702	58.8	
Oct-08	820	-3%	46	169	1,035	1,538	67.3	Deutsche Bank started taking commercial bays. 164 Former Bays removed from system.
Oct-09	777	-5%	65	121	963	1,497	64.3	
Oct-10	752	-3%	77	118	947	1,497	63.3	20 Additional Residential for Frobisher Crescent
Oct-11	744	-1%	69	155	968	1,497	64.7	
Oct-12	737	-1%	89	153	979	1,508	64.9	
Nov-13	718	-3%	54	297	1,069	1,508	70.8	December 2012 - 38 Deutsche Bank commercial bays transferred from Speed - Breton car park (20 Surrendered) December 2012 - 19 City of London Police bays surrendered - Breton car park July/August 2013 - 184 sold bays Heron - 03 Willoughby (78 bays) and Speed (106 bays) car parks
Nov-14	691	-4%	51	295	1,037	1,508	68.8	
Nov-15	682	-1%	34	294	1,010	1,508	67	

History of Barbican Estate charges from 2004 to Date	Price change implemented											
	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
Residential Car Parking Per Annum	£990	£990	£990	£990	£990	£1,038	£1,038	£1,070	£1,126	£1,155	£1,183	£1,210
Commercial Car Parking Per Annum including VAT	£4,250	£4,250	£4,250	£4,250	£4,250	£4,460	£4,460	£4,700	£4,945	£5,073	£5,195	£5,314
Temporary Car Parking - (Over 5 hours in any 24 hour period)	£8.00	£8.00	£8.00	£8.00	£8.00	£8.50	£8.50	£8.75	£9.20	£9.44	£9.67	£9.89

Appendix 3. ANNUAL CAR PARKING CHARGES COMPARISONS NOVEMBER 2015

City of London, Corporation Car Parks	Annual Charges	Spaces	Manned	CCTV	Comments
Golden Lane Estate	£768.50	24	x	✓	Patrols not dedicated staff
Middlesex Street	£1,050.92	98	x	✓	Patrols not dedicated staff
London Wall Car Park	£740.00	218	✓	✓	Bays allocated on a first come first served basis
Barbican Estate	£1,210.00	1508	✓	✓	Manned 24/7

Car Parks in or adjacent to the city	Annual Charges	Spaces	Manned	CCTV	Comments
Charterhouse Square, EC1M	£3,400.00	-	x	✓	Gated Car Park beneath block of Luxury Apartments.
Christina Street, EC2A	£1,524.00	-	x	✓	Gated Car Park beneath block of Luxury Apartments.
Lever Street, EC1V	£2,544.00	-	x	✓	Gated Car Park beneath block of Luxury Apartments.
Cobalt Building, EC2Y	£3,000 to £4,000	-	x	✓	Gated Car Park beneath block of Luxury Apartments.
Goswell Road, EC1	£2,100.00	-	x	✓	Gated Car Park beneath block of Luxury Apartments.
Bartholomew Close, EC1A	£3,720.00	-	x	✓	Gated Car Park beneath block of Luxury Apartments.
NCP, Beech Street & Silk Street	£2,300.00	400	✓	✓	
NCP, Aldersgate Street, Saffron Hill, Finsbury Square & Thames Exchange	£3,000.00	670	x	✓	

Temporary Car Parking	5 Hours	24 Hours	Comments
Street Parking	£24	£115	£1.20 every 15 minutes
NCP, Aldersgate Street	£25.00	£35.00	
NCP, Beech Street & Silk Street	£15	£34	
NCP, Saffron Hill, EC1N 8XA	£22.50	£22.50	
NCP, Finsbury Square, EC2A 1AD	£42.00	£45.00	
NCP, Thames Exchange, EC4R 3TB	£36.00	£36.00	
Islington	£13.40	£13.40	
Barbican Estate	Free	£9.89	£9.44 After 5 hrs then covers for 24 hrs

This page is intentionally left blank

BARBICAN ESTATE RESIDENTS CONSULTATION COMMITTEE (RCC) **Monday, 29 February 2016**

Minutes of the meeting of the Barbican Estate Residents Consultation Committee held in Guildhall on Monday, 29 February 2016 at 7.00 pm

Present

Members:

Graham Wallace - Chairman
Robert Barker - Deputy Chairman
Mark Bostock - Frobisher Crescent
Gordon Griffiths - Bunyan Court
Jane Smith - Barbican Association
Janet Wells - John Trundle House
Prof. Michael Swash - Willoughby House
Robin Gough - Defoe House
Fred Rodgers - Breton House
David Graves - Seddon House
Richard Dykes - Gilbert House
Christopher Makim - Speed House
Monique Long - Mountjoy House
Natalie Robinson - Andrewes House

In attendance:

Ann Holmes – Deputy Chairman, Barbican Residential Committee (BRC)
Randall Anderson – Barbican Residential Committee

Officers:

Michael Bennett - Community and Children's Services
Paul Murtagh - Community and Children's Services
Anne Mason - Community and Children's Services
Mike Saunders - Community and Children's Services
Barry Ashton - Community and Children's Services
Julie Mayer - Town Clerk's

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from Fiona Lean, John Taysum, Averil Baldwin, Ted Reilly and Gary Moore, Chairman of the BRC.

2. DECLARATIONS BY MEMBERS IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

There were no declarations.

3. MINUTES

- The minutes of the meeting held on 30th November 2015 were approved.
- The draft minutes of the Annual General Meeting held on 8th February 2016 were received.

Before commencing the business on the agenda, the Chairman welcomed and introduced Mr Paul Murtagh the new Assistant Director (Barbican and Property Services). Mr Murtagh set out his career background to date and looked forward to working with Officers and Members. Those present were then invited to introduce themselves.

4. **SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT (SLA) REVIEW**

The Committee received a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services which updated Members on the review of the estate-wide implementation of Service Level Agreements and Key Performance Measures for the quarter October – December 2015.

Members noted that the first 11 of 12 pre-committee questions, which had been circulated on Friday 26th February, related to various service areas and would be incorporated into the SLA action plans.

In response to a question about the Frobisher Crescent works having been delayed due to the supply of doors, officers explained that it had not been possible to order these in advance of letting the contract. Officers were fully aware of residents' frustrations in this matter and were taking steps to ensure more efficient contract management in the future.

Members were asked to note a drafting error on this report in respect of KPIs; % overall resident satisfaction of completed major works projects, progress against target should show as a 'non-smiley face'. The surveys related to Frobisher Crescent external redecorations and three out of four respondents were satisfied with the works.

5. **'YOU SAID: WE DID' - ACTIONS UPDATE**

Members received the Committee's Outstanding Actions update and noted the following update, since the agenda had been printed and published:

Repairs & maintenance works for Andrewes and Ben Jonson House roof/balconies 2014/15 following water ingress – were these not claimable under the guarantees?

All works orders to Ben Jonson House and Andrewes House are currently being investigated. In 2014/15 there were 30 orders relating to Andrewes House (10 flats) and 37 orders relating to Ben Jonson House (21 flats). Many of the orders are for investigation works and in some cases resulted in works not related to the roof works. Where remedial works could be covered under the existing roof guarantee, officers are dealing with the insurance company to reclaim the costs.

In response to supplementary questions, the following matters were raised/noted:

- There would be confirmation by the next meeting as to whether the works would be covered under the guarantees and, if so, there would be a credit to the residents of Ben Jonson and Andrewes Houses. Officers

advised that the terms of the guarantees often differed between blocks and others were being investigated as part of this work.

- In respect of the electric vehicle charging points, residents suggested that the electrical points should be installed before residents purchased electric cars and therefore the survey should be extended. Officers advised that this was a Department of the Built Environment project and, whilst the survey results so far had been helpful, it was too early to provide further detail. Members noted that they would receive an update in the next 'You Said; We Did; update.
- In respect of the timings on the Beech Gardens fountains; Members noted that the survey had received 61 responses and would close later this week. Officers agreed to investigate the excessive white foam coming off the fountain as it was becoming unsightly.

6. SERVICE BASED REVIEW - GENERATING INCOME FOR CAR PARKING AND BAGGAGE STORES FOR 2017/18

The Committee received a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services in respect of the Service Based Review; specifically in relation to generating income from car parking and baggage stores.

During the discussion, the following matters were raised, specifically for the attention of the Barbican Residential Committee when it meets on 14th March 2016:

Would Breton House's car park be considered for commercial use and would there be any disturbance resulting from the use of the car parks as commercial ventures? A Member pointed out that there is a City policy that requires deliveries in residential areas to be restricted to between 7 am and 11pm and that might affect the option for delivery consolidation.

- The possibility of losing staff was a concern - Will the car park attendants' overheads be reviewed and will there be changes to their shift patterns?
- The report now before Members set out a series of 6 options, with options 5 and 6 recommended for further consideration, should options 1 – 4 prove unfeasible.
- The Car Park Account is in deficit due to the City's own Capital Charges. Could the Estate Office undertake a short survey on the use of work rooms and studios, given that a lot of Barbican residents work in creative arts and such units are in short supply.
- When storage company use had been considered some years ago there had been some concerns raised about security.

7. CAR PARK CHARGING

Members received a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services, which sought to extend the current charging policy for car parking on the Estate for a further nine months, from June 2016 to March 2017. Members noted that this report had been presented to the Barbican Residential Committee at its last meeting and subsequently deferred. Therefore, officers had presented this report again, along with the Service Based Review report, at the previous item on this agenda.

The Deputy Chairman of the Barbican Residential Committee (BRC) advised that, at its last meeting, Members had deferred this report as they felt there was no logical reason behind a proposed 5% increase and had asked for a set of options. Furthermore, there had been no pre-determination by Members of the BRC as to whether or not residents would be prepared to accept a 5% increase. One resident member suggested that a 5% increase be taken forward to the BRC.

8. PROGRESS OF SALES AND LETTINGS

Members received a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services which set out the surrenders of tenancies and the sale and letting of flats in accordance with Standing Orders 77a and 77b.

9. UPDATE REPORT

The Committee received the Director of Community and Children's Services regular update report and during the discussion, the following matters were raised/noted:

- Potentially, Asser keys could be retro-fitted to Blake Tower, as had been the case with Frobisher Crescent.
- In respect of pre-Committee question (11) – appended to these minutes - Members noted that an automated barrier on St Giles Terrace would require planning consent and they were advised to canvass their ward members of the Planning and Transportation Committee.

10. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

In response to further questions, the following matters were noted:

- Frobisher Crescent Leaseholders' relationship with the Barbican Centre would be considered at the SLA Working Party at its next meeting in April. Mr Bostock would be invited to this meeting as a guest.
- The control system for the underfloor heating would need to be replaced by September 2016, when the current contract expires. There was not the same urgency on the other works.

11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT

- Members noted that a Member had raised a pre-committee question in respect of the Aldersgate Turret, which was outside the remit of this Committee. Members noted that a consultant has been appointed to ascertain the feasibility of converting the disused space into residential use and an application for a pre-planning meeting had been lodged by the consultant. Once there was anything more substantial to report, the RCC/BRC would receive an update for information only.

- Members agreed to put the start time of meetings back to 6.30 pm

The meeting ended at 8.00 pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Julie Mayer
tel.no.: 020 7332 1410
Julie.Mayer@cityoflondon.gov.uk

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2, 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2, 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank