

POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE
Thursday, 23 March 2023

Minutes of the meeting of the Policy and Resources Committee held at Committee Rooms, 2nd Floor, West Wing, Guildhall on Thursday, 23 March 2023 at 1.45 pm

Present

Members:

Deputy Christopher Hayward (Chairman)
Deputy Keith Bottomley (Deputy Chairman)
Tijs Broeke (Vice-Chair)
Mary Durcan (Vice-Chair)
Deputy Randall Anderson (Ex-Officio Member)
Deputy Rehana Ameer
Deputy Marianne Fredericks
Alderman Timothy Hailes
Deputy Edward Lord
Alderman Ian David Luder
Catherine McGuinness
Wendy Mead
Deputy Andrien Meyers
Deputy Alastair Moss (Ex-Officio Member)
Alderman Sir William Russell
Ruby Sayed (Ex-Officio Member)
Deputy Sir Michael Snyder
Deputy Philip Woodhouse
Wendy Hyde (Ex-Officio Member)
Deputy Simon Duckworth (Chief Commoner) (Ex-Officio Member)
Alderman Professor Michael Mainelli

In attendance (observing online)

Deputy James Thomson
Benjamin Murphy
Deputy Mark Bostock
Caroline Haines
Paul Martinelli

In attendance (in Guildhall)

Madush Gupta
Ann Holmes

Officers:

| | |
|---------------------|---|
| Michael Cogher | - Comptroller and City Solicitor and Deputy Chief Executive |
| Paul Double | - City Remembrancer |
| Polly Dunn, Clerk | - Town Clerk's Department |
| Caroline Al-Beyerty | - Chamberlain |
| Damian Nussbaum | - Director of Innovation & Growth |

| | |
|-------------------|--|
| Bob Roberts | - Deputy Town Clerk |
| Gregory Moore | - Assistant Town Clerk and Executive Director, Governance & Member Services |
| Ian Thomas | - Town Clerk and Chief Executive |
| Jen Beckermann | - Executive Director and Private Secretary to the Chairman of Policy and Resources Committee |
| Ben Dixon | - Town Clerk's Department |
| Chris Rumbles | - Town Clerk's Department |
| Paul Wright | - Deputy Remembrancer |
| Luciana Magliocco | - Innovation and Growth Department |
| Simon Latham | - City Bridge Trust |
| Emma Moore | - Chief Strategy Officer |
| Genine Whitehorn | - Chief Strategy Officer's Department |
| Angela McLaren | - Commissioner, City of London Police |
| Philip Saunders | - Town Clerk's Department |
| Nick Gill | - City Surveyor's Department |
| Robert Murphy | - City Surveyor's Department |
| John Cater | - Chief Operating Officer's Department |
| Claire Giraud | - Senior Public Health Practitioner |
| Claire Spencer | - Chief Executive Officer, Barbican Centre |
| Mathew Cooper | - Town Clerk's Department |
| Dionne Corradine | - Chief Strategy Officer |
| Bruce Hunt | - Remembrancer's Office |
| Abdul Ishtiaq | - City Surveyor's Department |
| Jouini Abdellatif | - Innovation and Growth Department |
| Dylan McKay | - Town Clerk's Department |
| Fiona McKeith | - City Surveyor's Department |
| Jacqueline Ryan | - Town Clerk's Department |
| Mathew Stickley | - Town Clerk's Department |

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from The Rt Hon The Lord Mayor, Deputy Brian Mooney, Deputy Shravan Joshi and Deputy Henry Colthurst.

2. MEMBERS DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

There were none.

3. MINUTES

- a) The public minutes of the Policy and Resources Committee meeting on 23 February 2023 were approved.

- b) The public minutes of the inquorate Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Sub-Committee meeting on 12 December 2022 were noted.
- c) The public minutes of the Capital Buildings Board meeting on 18 January 2023 were noted.
- d) The public minutes of the Joint Resource Allocation and Efficiency and Performance Working Party meeting on 20 January 2023 were noted.
- e) The public summary of the Competitiveness Advisory Board meeting on 30 January 2023 were noted.
- f) The draft public minutes of the Civic Affairs Sub-Committee meeting on 7 February 2023 were noted.

The Town Clerk drew Members' attention to item 4 within the Civic Affairs Sub-Committee minutes and an update relating to 'Members Workspace Requirements and a shortfall in funding of £20,000 to secure Innovation and Growth's move to the Irish Chambers. Civic Affairs Sub-Committee had resolved to submit a bid to the Policy and Resources Committee Contingency Fund to secure the additional £20k required. Members were now being asked to consider and approve this proposal.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Approved £20,000 from Policy and Resources Committee's Contingency Fund in support of Innovation and Growth's move to the Irish Chambers.
- g) The public minutes of the Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee meeting on 13 February 2023 were noted.
- h) The public minutes of the Resource Allocation Sub-Committee meeting on 13 February 2023 were noted.

4. **LIGHT TOUCH GOVERNANCE REVIEW**

The Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk presenting options in response to a Light Touch Governance Review commissioned by Members following implementation of recommendations arising from the Lord Lisvane's Governance Review in 2022.

The Chairman introduced the item and reminded Members of the background to the report and how it was intended to present a light touch rather than wholesale review. The Chairman confirmed his intention to consider the recommendations out of sequence to group themes or where they were related. Members proceeded to consider recommendations as follows: -

Recommendation i) concerning the Property Investment Board and Financial Investment Board

The Chairman referred to a recommendation of the City Surveyor that the terms of reference be updated through deletion of explicit reference to Leadenhall Market given it was a requirement covered within the Investment Strategies, approved by Policy and Resources Committee, in any event.

Subject to this proposed amendment, Members were in agreement with the recommendation.

Recommendation viii concerning reporting of benefits in kind and the constitution of Efficiency and Performance Sub-Committee

The Chairman referred to matters relating to Efficiency and Performance Working Party being purely to tighten up the existing terms of reference.

Members were in agreement with the recommendation as presented.

Recommendation ii) relating to the Equality Diversity and Inclusion Sub-Committee

A Member expressed their surprise at a proposal to move Equality and Inclusion Sub-Committee to a single reporting line of Policy and Resources Committee, with the Member suggesting this would be a fundamental change rather than a light touch proposal.

During the discussion that followed, the importance of equality and diversity was recognised, with Members agreeing on the importance of staffing issues in relation to EDI, but with this element effectively being delegated to Corporate Services Committee, and with the majority of responsibility relating to EDI sitting with Policy and Resources Committee and a single reporting line being considered appropriate.

Members offered their endorsement of the recommendation as presented. Edward Lord asked that their name be recorded as having voted against the proposal.

Recommendations vi) and vii) concerning Culture Heritage and Libraries and Education

The Chairman referred to Members' views in these two areas, particularly at Informal Court, and confirmed his personal view that they were two areas that would require revisiting more seriously in the medium term, with proper consultation with relevant Members, officers and other stakeholders.

There was a question raised regarding agreeing a date for reporting back on these two areas, with the Chairman responding and highlighting capacity issues within the Governance and Members' Services Team and of it being wrong to try and pin them down today on a date for reporting back. A Member proposed a backstop that any proposed changes arising from the review be implemented in time for the next civic year in 2024/25, which the Chairman agreed was a reasonable request.

Members were in agreement with the recommendations as presented.

Recommendation iv) and v) concerning Capital Buildings Board and Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee

The Chairman acknowledged that there were a range of views relating to Capital Buildings Board. The Chairman referred to an ongoing independent review of project governance. This included both corporate and major projects, with Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee awaiting proposals on how to better manage the operational estate and with funding all aspirations and priorities a constant theme in Finance Committee and here at Policy and Resources Committee, but with Committee or Member governance not currently included as part of the review.

The Chairman proposed amending the scope of the project governance review and updating its terms of reference to include Committee and Member governance, which was currently split between Capital Buildings Board and Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee. The Chairman added how it was important that the review considered other associated committees e.g., Markets Board and that all relevant areas were captured.

The Chairman proposed an alternative recommendation, which was seconded by Mary Durcan, asking Members to:

- Reject recommendations iv) and v) presented in the report regarding Capital Buildings Board and Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee.
- Agree the revised scope of the Project Governance Review to include a review of Member Governance including (but not limited to) Capital Buildings Board, Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee, Markets Board and other associated Committees.
- Delegate agreement of the exact wording of the new Project Governance Review terms of Reference to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of Policy and Resources Committee, Capital Buildings Board, Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee and Markets Board.

The Chairman confirmed the intention being to allow for a full independent review between now and June before bringing back further proposals.

There was endorsement of the Chairman's proposal and a recognition that it would be the right approach to undertake an independent review rather than carrying out project governance changes through an ad hoc approach.

There was unanimous agreement to the Chairman's revised recommendation.

Recommendation iii) concerning Civic Affairs Sub-Committee

The Chairman remarked on a number of comments relating to Civic Affairs Sub-Committee having been received, but with no single coherent alternative

proposal emerging through discussions to date. The Chairman confirmed his personal view that it would be appropriate to marry Members' Learning and Development and Standards into a new sub-committee, to be Chaired by the Chief Commoner.

Members were supportive of the Chairman's proposal to separate out Members' Learning and Development and Standards into a new Sub-Committee. The importance of an ongoing role for the Chief Commoner was highlighted and of a need for a clear area of responsibility in the role.

Marianne Fredericks put forward a motion to amend to the recommendation, seconded by Catherine McGuinness, as follows:

To appoint the Chief Commoner as the Chair of the Civic Affairs sub-committee; with the immediate past Chief Commoner (moving to the Chief Commoner elect in October) and a nominated individual by the Policy and Resources Committee, acting as co-deputy chairs.

In response to this proposal, a number of Members spoke in support of the current working arrangements of Civic Affairs Sub-Committee.

A vote followed, with four Members supporting the proposed amendment, there being one abstention, and with the remaining Members voting against the amendment. As such, the motion was not carried.

In conclusion, the Chairman put forward a further motion, seconded by Keith Bottomley, that Civic Affairs Sub-Committee be relieved of Members' Learning and Development and Standards as part of its terms of reference, with this receiving the agreement of Members and there being one abstention.

Recommendation ix) concerning Policy and Resources Committee

The Chairman referred to a need to reflect any changes to Policy and Resources Committee's terms of reference based on debate relating to matters discharged by the Sub-Committees. The changes proposed being purely to reflect decisions taken elsewhere today or to correct historic errors such as reference to Establishment Committee which was now Corporate Services Committee.

A Member commented on the earlier discussion regarding the merging of Property Investment Board and Financial Investment Board into a single Grand Committee and proposed that an Ex Officio place on Policy and Resources Committee should be given to the Chair of the new Investment Committee, with this receiving the support of Members.

Recommendation x) concerning Standing Orders

The Chairman referred to discussion at callover during which it had been proposed Standing Order 13 relating to questions be tweaked slightly, to include a word limit of 250 words, this being approximately two minutes.

A discussion followed with a number of areas considered including attendance at Licensing Hearings, the Chief Commoner's ability to Chair committees, the role and appointment of a Chair and Deputy Chair of a Sub-Committee and the current ad-hoc arrangement.

Members offered their endorsement of the recommendation relating to Standing Orders and the Chairman's proposal relating to a word limit for questions.

Resolved: That Members: -

- i) Agreed to merge the **Property Investment Board and Financial Investment Board** into a new Investment Committee, answerable directly to the Court of Common Council, and agree the revised Terms of Reference as set out in Appendix A on this basis, including:-
 - a) To recommend that the existing FIB and PIB membership be directly appointed to the Investment Committee, with names to be drawn by ballot to determine how the term lengths will be staggered to ensure the usual gradual turnover in vacancies;
 - b) Terms of reference of Investment Committee to be updated through deletion of explicit reference to Leadenhall Market.
 - c) To note that the Standing Orders and Scheme of Delegations are to be reviewed with the intention of revising the financial thresholds for reporting to Finance Committee on certain property related matters (SOs 55-59).
- ii) Supported a change to the (currently joint) reporting lines of **Equality Diversity and Inclusion Sub**, such that it becomes a sub-committee of Policy & Resources Committee only, with clearer direction within its terms of reference on what matters are to be agreed in consultation with the Corporate Services Committee; and agree the revised terms of reference as set out in Appendix B to reflect this change.

Edward Lord voted against the recommendation.

- iii) Provided feedback on the **Civic Affairs Sub-Committee** terms of reference as set out at Appendix C and tasked Officers to bring back revised proposals in agreed terms to the next Policy & Resources Committee meeting;

Agreed that Civic Affairs Sub-Committee be relieved of Members' Learning and Development and Standards as part of its terms of reference moving forward.

Capital Buildings Board (recommendation iv) and Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee (recommendation v)

- Rejected recommendations iv) and v) presented in the report regarding Capital Buildings Board and Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee.
 - Agreed to a revised scope of the Project Governance Review to include a review of Member Governance including (but not limited to) Capital Buildings Board, Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee, Markets Board and other associated Committees.
 - Delegated agreement of the exact wording of the new Project Governance Review terms of Reference to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of Policy and Resources Committee, Capital Buildings Board, Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee and Markets Board.
- vi) Tasked officers to explore suitable alternative arrangements for a **Culture** Forum and Masterplan and present back to the Committee within six to twelve months.
- vii) Support that no changes be made to the **Education Board** and **Independent School Boards**' terms of reference at this time, but commission officers to work on greater guidance for Members and Officers on the governance arrangements surrounding the City Corporation's Family of Schools.
- viii) Agreed to refer concerns relating to the reporting of benefits in kind, and on the constitution of the Efficiency and Performance Working Party, to the **Finance Committee** for initial consideration.
- ix) Agreed to update the **Policy & Resources Committee** Terms of Reference (Appendix F) in line with other decisions taken in response to this report;
With the inclusion of Investment Committee Chairman as an Ex Officio appointment to Policy and Resources Committee.
- x) Considered the proposed changes set out in summary form at **appendix G**, and detailed within **appendix H**, provided comment and agreed these for onward submission to the Court of Common Council in April 2023;
Agreed to inclusion of word limit of 250 words for questions as part of Standing Order 13.
- xi) Delegated Authority to the Town Clerk in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of this committee, to revise the Terms of Reference of all the appended Committees and Sub-Committees, for consideration by the Court of Common Council and/or the relevant Grant Committee.
- xii) Authorised the Town Clerk to make amendments to the Standing Orders and Committee Terms of Reference that arise directly from decisions taken today (e.g., the renaming of committee(s) and reflecting that in all governance documents) including the introduction of any explanatory footnotes.

5. TERMS OF REFERENCE

The Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk presenting an annual review of changes to Committee Terms of Reference for onward consideration at the Court of Common Council.

Members noted that a change would be needed to Corporate Services Committee's terms of reference to reflect changes agreed earlier in the agenda relating to equality and inclusion. Finance Committee terms of reference would also need updating to reflect changes to Property Investment Board and Financial Investment Board.

Culture Heritage and Libraries Committee terms of reference were to be agreed with the inclusion of the Police Museum. No new Committee home had been identified for the Police Museum, therefore it was proposed that it should remain with Culture, Heritage and Libraries Committee until an alternative option had been identified and agreed amongst the relevant Chief Officers and Committee(s). Members noted that there was currently no resources to support the Police Museum through Culture, Heritage and Libraries Committee, but with Police Authority Board considering it premature to remove reference at this point whilst a new location was being identified. Officers would be asked to review alternative funding options with the aim of reopening the Museum.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

Considered and approved revised terms of reference for the following Committees:

- Board of Governors of Guildhall School of Music and Drama
- Corporate Services Committee
- Finance Committee
- City of London Police Authority Board
- Crime and Disorder Scrutiny Committee
- Local Government Pensions Board
- Barbican Centre Board
- Audit and Risk Management Committee.
- Culture Heritage and Libraries Committee
- Opens Spaces and City Gardens Committee
- Health and Social Care Scrutiny Committee

- Noted that a resolution of Markets Board, had already been resolved earlier in the agenda through agreement to undertake a wider review of project governance.

- Delegated Authority to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman, to consider and approve any subsequent changes to Committee Terms of Reference required ahead of the April 2023 Court meeting, including the Board of Governors of the three Independent schools; and

- Authorised the Town Clerk to make factual amendments to Terms of Reference (e.g. to reflect the changes to names of Committees) required ahead of presentation to the April 2023 Court meeting.

6. **CAPITAL FUNDING UPDATE**

The Committee considered a report of the Chamberlain presenting information relating to the annual capital bids and seeking approval of release of funding.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- (i) Reviewed the schemes summarised in Table 2 and, particularly in the context of the current financial climate, to confirm their continued essential priority for release of funding at this time and accordingly:
- (ii) Agreed to the release of up to £0.910m for the schemes progressing to the next Gateway (pre-Gateway 5) in Table 2 from the reserves of City Fund (£0.075m) and City's Cash (£0.829m) and BHE (£0.006m) as appropriate, subject to the required gateway approvals.
- (iii) Agreed to the release of up to £1.374m for the schemes progressing to implementation (post-Gateway 5) in Table 2 from the reserves of City Fund (£0.737m) and City's Cash (£0.621m) and BHE (£0.016m) as appropriate, subject to the required gateway approvals.

7. **GUILDHALL COMPLEX REFURBISHMENT: MEMBER ENGAGEMENT**

The Committee considered a report of the City Surveyor relating to a project concerning prospective options for the refurbishment of the North and West Wings and seeking authority for the Town Clerk and City Surveyor to engage with Members as detailed.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Authorised the Town Clerk and City Surveyor to engage with Members as shown in paragraph 10 of the report for the purpose of developing the vision of the future Guildhall Complex and respective Member business requirements;
- Note that any formal proposals presenting options around the redevelopment or refurbishment of Guildhall would be presented to Committee in due course in 2023.

8. **POLICY INITIATIVES FUND AND COMMITTEE CONTINGENCY**

The Committee considered a report of the Chamberlain providing a schedule of projects and activities which have received funding from the Policy Initiatives Fund (PIF), the Policy and Resources Committee's Contingency Fund, Committee's Project Reserve and Covid19 Contingency Fund for 2022/23 and future years with details of expenditure in 2022/23.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Note the report and contents of the schedules.

- Approved the 2022/23 unallocated balances on your Committee's PIF and Contingency Fund being carried forward into 2023/24.
- Approved the 2022/23 COVID Contingency Fund unallocated balances were not carried forward as it was not anticipated that this Contingency would be required in 2023/24.

9. **MEMBERSHIPS AND SUBSCRIPTIONS**

The Committee received a joint report of the Deputy Town Clerk, Executive Director of Innovation and Growth and the Remembrancer providing information on current memberships and subscriptions as part of the City Corporation's external engagement.

RECEIVED

10. **TARGET OPERATING MODEL - INTERIM UPDATE REPORT**

The Committee received a report of the Chief Strategy Officer updating on implementation of the Target Operating Model at the City Corporation.

RECEIVED

11. **QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

The Chairman referred to notice of a question received from Shravan Joshi relating to Member training for Resource Allocation Sub-Committee, Planning and Transportation Committee and other Committees that were required to better understand the use of and restrictions for various funds such as Community Infrastructure Levy and On Street Parking Reserves.

The Chairman confirmed that the matter had been raised with the Chamberlain, following which a provisional training session had been scheduled to take place on Thursday 4th May 11.30am, and with relevant Members to be invited and a recording being made available for any Member interested in reviewing the session.

12. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT**

At this point in the meeting the Chairman took the opportunity to highlight that it would be Nick Gill's last meeting of Policy and Resources Committee before his retirement on 31st March. The Chairman added how Nick had done a sterling job during his time at the City Corporation in delivering sparkling returns on the investment portfolio. The Chairman thanked Nick for all his efforts on behalf of the City Corporation and wished him well for the future.

13. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

RESOLVED: That under Section 100(A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of the Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

14. NON-PUBLIC MINUTES

- a) The non-public minutes of the Policy and Resources Committee meeting on 23 February 2023 were approved.
- b) The non-public minutes of the Capital Buildings Board meeting on 18 January 2023 were noted.
- c) The non-public minutes of the Joint Resource Allocation Sub-Committee and Efficiency Performance Working Party meeting on 20 January 2023 were noted.
- d) The draft non-public minutes of the Civic Affairs Sub-Committee meeting on 7 February 2023 were noted.
- e) The draft non-public minutes of the Freedom Applications Sub-Committee meeting on Thursday 9 February were noted.
- f) The non-public minutes of the Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee meeting on 13 February 2023 were noted.
- g) The non-public minutes of the Resource Allocation Sub-Committee meeting on 13 February 2023 were noted.

15. DESTINATION CITY - GROWTH BID REPROFILE

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Innovation and Growth relating to a Destination City Growth Bid Reprofile.

=====
At this point in the meeting, in accordance with Standing Order 40, Members agreed to extend the meeting beyond two hours.
=====

16. FINAL DESIGNS & TEXTS: BECKFORD & CASS STATUES INTERPRETATION PROJECT

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Innovation and Growth relating to final designs and texts for the Beckford and Cass Statues Interpretation Project.

17. CITY OF LONDON PUBLIC PROTECTION STUDY

a) Findings and Recommendations from the City of London Public Protection Study

This item was withdrawn.

b) Resolution of Bridge House Estates Board

The Committee received a resolution of Bridge House Estates Board.

18. MAJOR PROGRAMMES OFFICE - MONTHLY DASHBOARD REPORT

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Operating Officer providing a Major Programmes Office Monthly Dashboard report.

19. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

There was a question regarding CCTV in the City.

20. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREE SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED.

a) Museum of London Relocation Programme: Further Update

The Committee considered a report of the City Surveyor relating to the Museum of London Relocation Programme.

=====
At this point in the meeting, in accordance with Standing Order 16, Members agreed to extend the meeting beyond three hours.
=====

Part 3 Confidential Agenda

21. MINUTES

- a) The confidential minutes of the Capital Buildings Board meeting held on 18 January 2023 were noted.
- b) The draft confidential minutes of the Civic Affairs Sub-Committee meeting held on 7 February 2023 were noted.
- c) The confidential minutes of the Freedom Applications Sub-Committee meeting held on Thursday 9 February 2023 were noted.
- d) The confidential minutes of the Resource Allocation Sub-Committee meeting held on 13 February 2023 were noted.

22. SECURITY UPDATE

The Committee considered a report of the Managing Director of Bridge House Estates providing a security update.

The meeting ended at 4.48pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Polly Dunn
polly.dunn@cityoflondon.gov.uk