

Committees: Corporate Projects Board <i>[for decision]</i> Streets & Walkways Sub <i>[for decision]</i> Projects Sub <i>[for decision]</i> Open Spaces and City Gardens <i>[for information]</i>	Dates: 11 November 2020 01 December 2020 17 December 2020 01 December 2020
Subject: St Alphage Gardens Enhancement Unique Project Identifier: 10855	Gateway 6: Outcome Report Regular
Report of: Director of the Built Environment Report Author: Andrea Moravicova	For Decision

Summary

1. Status update	Project Description: <p>The project has delivered public realm enhancements to the gardens and a newly created space surrounding the London Wall Place development. The upper garden features a significantly increased amount of seating, new lighting and additional planting, while access to the lower garden has been improved through the construction of a new staircase. Connections have also been made to the privately-owned public spaces in Salter's Hall Gardens and London Wall Place.</p> <p>Construction works were substantially completed in May 2019, with snagging works taking place between June and December 2019.</p> <p>RAG Status: Green (same at last Gateway) Risk Status: Low (same at last Gateway) Costed Risk Provision Utilised: N/A Final Outturn Cost: £1,172,778</p>
2. Next steps and requested decisions	Requested Decisions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • approve the content of this outcome report, and • agree to close this project.
3. Key conclusions	<p>The project was completed within budget but experienced delays which affected the completion date (more detail in section 9 below). The project has delivered on its main objectives as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Access to both the upper and lower gardens was enhanced. A significant increase in the use of the area has been observed since the area opened to public.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The improvements, including extension of the upper garden and provision of larger seating area and space to accommodate wheelchair users, complement the publicly accessible landscaped spaces of the London Wall Place development. • New feature lighting, a paving design that incorporates the footprint of the former Church of St Alphage, and interpretation panels with information about the history of London Wall and the Church, all improve the setting of the Scheduled Ancient Monument. <p>Key learning and recommendations for future projects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Close co-ordination and engagement with stakeholders and project teams enables smooth project delivery. • Working within a Scheduled Ancient Monument area and / or in conservation area requires programme / timescales to account for potential materialisation of risks. • Early engagement with implementation and Business As Usual (BAU) teams reduces the risk of issues arising during and after construction.
--	--

Main Report

Design & Delivery Review

4. Design into delivery	<p>The design was developed to tie in seamlessly with the privately-owned public spaces around the London Wall Place development. A number of complex elements required specialist design elements, including working around a Scheduled Ancient Monument and replacing structural features. External advice was obtained to assist with the design and delivery of these elements; whilst this reduced the associated risk it did not eliminate it and a number of issues arose during the construction phase which could have been avoided. More discussion on this aspect is contained in section 15 below.</p>
5. Options appraisal	<p>Two design options were considered at Gateway 4. The chosen option met the objectives of the project. The open design and extension of the gardens into the redundant carriageway in St Alphage Garden (street) provides functional spaces with the historic London Wall as the backdrop and contributes to a better pedestrian connectivity in the area.</p> <p>A number of minor changes were made to the design during implementation. These mainly related to practical measures on site and did not materially affect the scope of the project, although in some cases did add time to the programme. The main such change was to the design of the structural staircase connecting the lower garden which needed to be amended after uncovering the Roman House foundations.</p>

<p>6. Procurement route</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultancy services were acquired through a competitive tender process to: progress a landscape design and lighting strategy; undertake a structural assessment and proposal for a new staircase and wall to the lower garden area; and to establish the most likely location and form of the former Church of St Alphage. • The construction package was prepared inhouse by the Highway Engineer and work on site undertaken by the City's term contractor. A specialist contractor was appointed to construct the structural staircase – the staircase was successfully installed but the methodology was more complex than anticipated, requiring amendments to be made on site during installation. • All soft landscaping was delivered by the City's Open Spaces team.
<p>7. Skills base</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project team has the skills, knowledge and experience to manage delivery of this and similar future projects. • Specialist archaeological and landscape consultants were appointed to progress designs sympathetic to and enhancing the historically important features within the gardens, including incorporation of references to churchyard and showcasing the remains of the Roman Wall, thereby adding value to the finished project. • Structural engineers were also engaged in the process.
<p>8. Stakeholders</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project was delivered in close liaison with the developer and stakeholders to ensure the proposals meet their needs. • Comments from the public consultation were considered during the development and delivery of the project. • Regular updates were provided to all interested parties throughout the project.

Variation Review

<p>9. Assessment of project against key milestones</p>	<p>The construction programme was affected by risks that have materialised, including delayed site release from the developer and additional archaeological monitoring required when working in Upper Garden.</p> <p>Gateway 5 – February 2017, with construction proposed to start in May 2017 and to complete in January 2018.</p> <p>Construction works start – February 2018 (slippage of approximately eight months due to late handover of the site from the developer)</p> <p>Construction works complete – May 2019 (further slippage of approximately six months due to additional archaeological remains being discovered, complexities with the structural staircase, constrained working areas and incorrect materials supplied to site)</p>
---	--

<p>10. Assessment of project against Scope</p>	<p>The project's scope remained unchanged and is summarised below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Servicing requirements for 2 London Wall Place and maintenance access were accommodated within the design. • Pedestrian connections between the garden and the surrounding publicly accessible areas were improved, with part of the carriageway redesigned to accommodate additional seating. • A new staircase to the lower garden was constructed to improve access. • The areas in and around the gardens remain sympathetic to the setting of the ancient monument. • The quality of the gardens is consistent with the high-quality landscape of the development.
<p>11. Risks and issues</p>	<p>Several identified risks materialised during the construction phase affecting the overall programme:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Delay in the handover of the site at the start of the programme, causing slippage of approximately eight months. • Changes to the structural design of the steps required after uncovering the Roman House foundations. • Additional archaeological monitoring on-site and the associated planning permissions to approve treatment of found archaeology were required, before proceeding with the works.

Value Review

<p>12. Budget</p>	<p>The cost estimate for Gateway 2 was not defined as it originally fell within a wider programme associated with the London Wall Place development. These works were formally incorporated as a separate project at Gateway 4.</p> <p>The project was funded in its entirety through the Section 106 Agreement associated with the London Wall Place development.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="491 1563 1366 1648"> <tr> <td><i>Estimated Outturn Cost (G5)</i></td> <td>Estimated cost (excluding risk): £1,202,744</td> </tr> </table> <table border="1" data-bbox="491 1682 1382 1989"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th><i>At Authority to Start work (G5)</i></th> <th><i>Final Outturn Cost</i></th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td><i>Fees</i></td> <td>£122,981</td> <td>£120,180</td> </tr> <tr> <td><i>Staff Costs</i></td> <td>£270,850</td> <td>£269,557</td> </tr> <tr> <td><i>Works</i></td> <td>£783,913</td> <td>£758,041</td> </tr> <tr> <td><i>Commuted maintenance</i></td> <td>£25,000</td> <td>£25,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td><i>Total</i></td> <td>£1,202,744</td> <td>£1,172,778</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>The final account for this project has been verified.</p>	<i>Estimated Outturn Cost (G5)</i>	Estimated cost (excluding risk): £1,202,744		<i>At Authority to Start work (G5)</i>	<i>Final Outturn Cost</i>	<i>Fees</i>	£122,981	£120,180	<i>Staff Costs</i>	£270,850	£269,557	<i>Works</i>	£783,913	£758,041	<i>Commuted maintenance</i>	£25,000	£25,000	<i>Total</i>	£1,202,744	£1,172,778
<i>Estimated Outturn Cost (G5)</i>	Estimated cost (excluding risk): £1,202,744																				
	<i>At Authority to Start work (G5)</i>	<i>Final Outturn Cost</i>																			
<i>Fees</i>	£122,981	£120,180																			
<i>Staff Costs</i>	£270,850	£269,557																			
<i>Works</i>	£783,913	£758,041																			
<i>Commuted maintenance</i>	£25,000	£25,000																			
<i>Total</i>	£1,202,744	£1,172,778																			

13. Key benefits realised	The enhancements to the area of St Alphage Gardens improved pedestrian amenity and provided a functional open space for people to enjoy, whilst accommodating the servicing requirements of the London Wall Place development.
----------------------------------	--

Lessons Learned and Recommendations

14. Positive reflections	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong co-ordination and engagement with key stakeholders were key to developing designs and delivering this project. • Early engagement with the City’s historic environment team, Historic England and the Church allowed the project team to develop designs that complement the scheduled ancient monument. • Smooth transition to Business as Usual (BAU) as the representatives of departments, responsible for BAU activities were included within the project team.
15. Improvement reflections	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More thorough contribution from specialists / technical staff, including highway engineer and open spaces team, will be sought when preparing consultants briefs in future to ensure the brief is as accurate as possible. • Preliminary archaeological investigation of the area during the design stage can pre-empt the need for archaeological watching brief and enables inclusion of the time needed within programming.
16. Sharing best practice	Information will be disseminated through team and project staff briefings.

Appendices

Appendix 1	Plan
Appendix 2	Before and after photos

Contact

Report Author	Andrea Moravicova
Email Address	andrea.moravicova@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	020 7332 3925