

**STREETS AND WALKWAYS SUB (PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION)
COMMITTEE
Tuesday, 1 December 2020**

Minutes of the virtual meeting of the Streets and Walkways Sub (Planning and Transportation) Committee held on Tuesday, 1 December 2020 at 11.00 am

Present

Members:

Oliver Sells QC (Chairman)
Graham Packham (Deputy Chairman)
Randall Anderson
Peter Bennett
Deputy Keith Bottomley
Marianne Fredericks
Sheriff Christopher Hayward
Shravan Joshi
Deputy Alastair Moss
Alderman Alison Gowman (Ex-Officio Member)
Christopher Hill (Ex-Officio Member)
Paul Martinelli (Ex-Officio Member)
Barbara Newman (Ex-Officio Member)

Officers:

Ian Hughes	- Department of the Built Environment
Olumayowa Obisesan	- Chamberlain's Department
Aqib Hussain	- Chamberlain's Department
Leah Coburn	- Department of the Built Environment
Shani Annand-Baron	- Town Clerk's Department
Clarisse Tavin	- Department of the Built Environment
Tom Noble	- Department of the Built Environment
Kay English	- Department of the Built Environment
Nina Houghton-Worsfold	- City of London Police
Ola Obadara	- City Surveyor's Department
Maria Curro	- Department of the Built Environment
Simon Glynn	- Department of the Built Environment
Helen Kearney	- Department of the Built Environment
Katie Adnams	- Department of the Built Environment
Caroline O'Donoghue	- Department of the Built Environment
Clive Whittle	- Department of the Built Environment
Andrew Shorten	- City Surveyor's Department
Joseph Anstee	- Town Clerk's Department

At the start of the meeting, the Chairman welcomed Members and those watching the live broadcast of the meeting via YouTube, before reminding Members of the guidance circulated for the conducting of remote meetings.

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies.

2. **MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**

Deputy Alastair Moss declared a professional interest in Item 10 – City Streets: Transportation Response to Support Covid-19 Recovery: Charterhouse School Street and advised that he would withdraw from the discussion and consideration of this item.

3. **MINUTES**

With regards to the decisions in respect of the Beech Street Transportation and Public Realm Project, the Sub Committee noted that two of the four requested modifications to the experimental scheme had not been recommended at that stage and were not agreed, and suggested the minutes be amended to make this explicit.

A Member advised that they had since followed up on the points raised about crime in the area and ensuring appropriate connections between the Department of the Built Environment and the City of London Police were in place.

RESOLVED – That, pending the above amendment, the public minutes and non-public summary of the meeting held on 15 October 2020 be agreed as a correct record.

4. **FLEET STREET AND TEMPLE HEALTHY STREETS PLAN**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment regarding the Fleet Street and Temple Healthy Streets Plan. The Director of the Built Environment introduced the report and drew Members' attention to the key points.

In response to a question from a Member regarding previous plans for Fleet Street, the Director of the Built Environment advised that the project would take account of proposals for other developments in the area. The Director of the Built Environment also confirmed that officers were working with the Climate Action team to ensure that the project was aligned with the Climate Action Strategy.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee:

1. Agree that a budget of £87,200 is approved to reach the next Gateway;
2. Note the total estimated cost of the project at £255,006.20 (excluding risk); and
3. Approve the eastern extension of the Healthy Streets Plan boundary to align with the Fleet Street Partnership area boundary.

5. **WEST SMITHFIELD AREA PUBLIC REALM AND TRANSPORTATION PROJECT**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment concerning the public realm and transportation project for the West Smithfield area. The Chairman introduced the item and advised that there had been two recent Member engagement sessions on the project.

A Member commented that whilst they supported the scheme, they had reservations on aspects of the recommended decisions, including the delegation of funding and endorsement of the attached RIBA Stage 2 draft Concept Design and vision statement, which were now out of date. The Member also suggested adding a timeline for design development of Area 2. The Sub Committee noted that there were a number of unknowns which limited the ability to impose a timeline, but that 2022 had been given as an indicative timescale. The Director of the Built Environment advised that the RIBA Stage 2 draft Concept Design was a guide for the future and was not a commitment to detail at this stage but would inform understanding of support for the project.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee:

1. Endorse the attached RIBA Stage 2 draft Concept Design and vision statement for the West Smithfield area;
2. Agree to progress the Developed Design (to RIBA Stage 3) for Area 1, engagement and supporting work as set out in the report;
3. Agree to further develop Options 1-3 presented in this report, associated with transport and public realm changes in Area 1, for Member decision on a preferred option at Gateway 4;
4. Agree that the Museum of London S278 works be incorporated into the design and delivery of Area 1;
5. Agree that additional budget of £565,014 is approved to reach the next Gateway;
6. Agree that £134,986 underspent from the current budget allocation is carried forward to be used on this next stage of the project;
7. Note that a report to initiate a developed design for Area 2 will be brought to Committee once greater certainty is available on uses and timing of the redevelopment of the Central Markets buildings;
8. Note the revised project budget of £1,280,014 (excluding risk); and
9. Note the total estimated cost of the project at £12m (excluding risk).

6. **LUDGATE CIRCUS - OBJECTIONS TO THE EXPERIMENTAL BANNED LEFT TURN FROM LUDGATE HILL INTO NEW BRIDGE STREET**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment presenting responses to the Experimental Traffic Order (ETO) that introduced a 'no left turn' restriction on all traffic turning left from Ludgate Hill into New Bridge Street in December 2019, with Members asked to consider the responses and decide whether or not the experiment should be made permanent.

The Sub Committee considered the objections to the experiment, noting that under the scheme cyclists needed to take a more circuitous route in order to travel in the direction of Blackfriars. Whilst Members acknowledged that objections on these grounds carried weight, it was felt overall objection to the experiment had been modest, and that the benefits of the scheme outweighed concerns, principally as the scheme had proven beneficial for pedestrians, who were the main user group at the junction. Members felt the experiment had been successful and were supportive of making the scheme permanent.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee:

1. Agree to the making of a Traffic Order under section 6 of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984 to make the experimental banned left turn for all vehicles permanent; and
2. That the objectors and TfL be informed of the decision accordingly.

7. **MOOR LANE ENVIRONMENTAL ENHANCEMENTS, EC2Y 9SS**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment regarding the Moor Lane Environmental Enhancements project. The Director of the Built Environment introduced the report, and in response to a question from a Member, advised that the principles of the Climate Action Strategy would be embedded in the scheme as it progressed.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee:

1. Approve a total budget of **£230,382** to reach the next Gateway and proceed with the design review of Moor Lane, subject to the funds being received. This is to be funded by both the existing Moor Lane budget and the 21 Moorfields Section 278 as outlined below;
2. Approve a budget allocation of **£128,566** from the existing approved implementation budget of **£1,133,610** for the review and modification of the Moor Lane design to reach the next Gateway;
3. Approve the initiation of the Section 278 design, evaluation and the negotiation, drafting and completion of a Section 278 agreement in respect of 21 Moorfields relating to Moor Lane, at an estimated cost of **£101,816** to reach the next Gateway and subject to the receipt of funds; and

4. Note the total estimated cost of the project at **£1.7M- £2.2M** (excluding risk).

8. **ST ALPHAGE GARDENS ENHANCEMENT**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment concerning the St. Alphage Gardens Enhancement, a project to deliver public realm enhancements to the gardens and a newly created space surrounding the London Wall Place development.

In response to a question from a Member regarding London Wall Walk and Plaque 12, the Director of the Built Environment advised the plaque had been removed following damage prior to the development and replaced with interpretational panels. However, this would be followed up with the Historic Environment team with further details to follow. The Director of the Built Environment further advised that the Planning Policy team were looking at the issue of vacant units nearby and considering opportunities to fill them.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee approve the content of this outcome report and agree to close this project.

9. **SPECIAL EVENTS ON THE HIGHWAY**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment outlining the major special events planned for 2021 and provides Members the opportunity to consider & comment on the appropriateness of those events, taking into account their nature, scale, impact and benefits. The Director of the Built Environment introduced the report and drew Members' attention to the key points, particularly regarding COVID-19 and the impact the pandemic has had on events in 2020, and its likely effect going forward into 2021.

In response to a question from a Member, the Director of the Built Environment advised that events were only listed where they had an impact on the highway, and confirmed that proposals to hold the Cart Marking ceremonial event on a Saturday were under consideration. A Member suggested that moving the event to late July or August be considered as an alternative to facilitate attendance by both workers and the local community.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee agree to support the proposed events outlined in this report, subject to the appropriate constraints and guidance related to COVID-19.

10. **CITY STREETS: TRANSPORTATION RESPONSE TO SUPPORT COVID-19 RECOVERY: CHARTERHOUSE SCHOOL STREET**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment concerning a proposal for a project to implement a "school street" outside Charterhouse School. The Director of the Built Environment introduced the report and explained the background behind the proposal, also advising that the school was supportive of the scheme.

A Member voiced reservations about the proposals, on the basis that parents would continue to commute in by car due to their geographic spread, and that

the current pick-up/drop-off system worked well, so a new scheme may create disbenefit, particularly during rush hour. Members also asked for clarification on engagement undertaken with the school, and with Islington if necessary.

The Director of the Built Environment advised that officers had engaged with the school and considered feedback from parents. The experimental order, if agreed, would be monitored and feedback gathered to inform any further proposals that were forthcoming. The school would also sign up to TfL's STARS project which would generate further engagement. The Director confirmed that as the scheme involved a boundary street the scheme would require Islington's agreement, and they had indicated support. Physical changes were not proposed at this stage but could be considered if the scheme were to be made permanent.

In response to further points raised by Members, the Director of the Built Environment advised that officers would seek clarification on any planning obligations attached to recent consent to expand the school, and that a return to a one-way system with a widened pavement had been considered. The experimental scheme had funding in place, but if the experiment were successful contributions to funding physical enhancements could be sought.

The Chairman then advised he had asked the Comptroller and City Solicitor's Department to draft a legal checklist to provide in support of schemes to ensure full compliance and that all obligations were discharged. The Chairman added that whilst closures were a sensitive matter, the proposed route was appropriate, and the temporary experiment would allow for consultation and data collection before any further decisions.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee:

1. Approve the implementation of the Charterhouse School Street using an ETO, at a total estimated cost of £60,000, subject to agreement from LBI and no objections from statutory consultees;
2. Following the implementation of the ETO, any objections received during the statutory consultation period (up to 6 months from the implementation date) will be reported back to Members when making a final decision whether or not to make the scheme permanent or whether a public enquiry into any objections is required; and
3. Note that approval to use the £60,000 funding has been granted from the City's Central Fund.

11. REVIEW AND PRIORITISATION OF RING-FENCED S106 DEPOSITS

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment seeking approval for a further allocation of ring-fenced S106 funds, consistent with previous Member approvals and corporate priorities. The Director of the Built Environment introduced the report, gave Members an overview of the review so far and drew attention to the key points.

The Sub Committee then discussed the report, noting the complexities of allocating these funds and the impact of new priorities such as the Climate Action Strategy, and requesting further detail on unspent funds. The Director of the Built Environment advised that there were between £2 and £4 million in unspent S106 deposits, with some allocated and some the subject of negotiation with developers. Spends were often restricted according to geographic area or purpose, but officers had tried to reallocate funds where there was flexibility. Further reporting would be brought to Committee regarding unallocated funding.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee:

- i. Authorise the allocation of £1.48M in ring-fenced S106 funding outlined in the report; and
- ii. Note that a further report is planned in 2021 with information on the remaining unallocated S106 deposits.

12. **CITY PLACEMAKING AND PUBLIC SPACE REVIEW**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment setting out plans to carry out a review and update of design guidance and technical information in relation to public space and placemaking. The Director of the Built Environment introduced the report and drew Members' attention to the key points.

In response to points raised by Members, the Director of the Built Environment advised that the work would be aligned with the COVID-19 Recovery Taskforce and review of the Transport Strategy with a view to complementing various other pieces of ongoing work. The Director of the Built Environment added that design decisions would be addressed off the back of strategic work. With regards to cost, the scope of the project was wider than originally anticipated and provided the opportunity to explore the option of newer techniques. However, officers would look to deliver the project efficiently and providing value for money.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee:

- a) Agree the programme start up and next steps;
- b) Agree the allocation of £52,495 from the S106 deposits detailed in the report to commence Phase 1;
- c) Note that a progress report will be provided in early 2021 with a detailed brief to deliver the Public Space and Placemaking Vision and Outcomes and to seek approval to commence Phase 2; and
- d) Note that £102,495 from the S106 deposits detailed in the report have been ear-marked for the City Placemaking and Public Space Review.

13. **COMBINED PRE-GATEWAY 5 PROJECT CLOSURES**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk setting out a number of projects that had not yet reached Gateway 5 of the City's Project Procedure and that were no longer being progressed. It was therefore recommended that Members approve that the projects be closed.

The Sub Committee expressed concern that the Department of the Built Environment project spends totalled £550,000, with limited output, and expressed some reluctance to effectively agree financial losses on this scale without a certain degree of guidance and scrutiny. Members queried whether the processes around early project closures should be reviewed.

A Member, in his capacity as Chairman of the Projects Sub Committee, advised that this type of closure was initiated principally where projects were no longer needed, or where they were no longer funded. The Member advised that the Projects Sub Committee would examine the closures in detail and provide an appropriate level of scrutiny, as Members were right to suggest that projects should not be closed without sufficient and appropriate reasoning. The Sub Committee agreed that the recommendations should be agreed, subject to the agreement of the Projects Sub Committee.

RESOLVED – That the Streets & Walkways Sub Committee approve the eleven projects submitted by the Department of the Built Environment for closure, subject to the agreement of the Projects Sub Committee.

14. **52-54 LIME STREET SECTION 278 WORKS AND 10 FENCHURCH AVENUE SECTION 278 WORKS**

The Sub Committee received a report of the Director of the Built Environment updating Members on the completion of the second phase of the Section 278 highway works associated with developments at 52-54 Lime Street and 10 Fenchurch Avenue which were deferred in 2018.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted.

15. **OUTSTANDING REFERENCES**

The Sub Committee received a list of outstanding references.

Dockless Vehicles

A Member commented that the anticipated e-scooter trial was taking longer than expected and expressed their hope that a decision on how to proceed could be considered before Spring 2021. The Director of the Built Environment advised that a report was due to be considered before the beginning of the trial and explained the provisional parameters of the trial. Some wider issues had been uncovered during preparation but it was hoped a report would be submitted for consideration in February 2021.

RESOLVED – That the outstanding references list be noted.

16. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

A Member queried whether the Sub Committee was responsible for signage within the Barbican Estate where it was on City of London public highway, as a sign had been recently installed that seemed to be incongruous and ineffective. Another Member added that they were aware of the example raised and advised that the sign's map was single-level, and consequently confusing on the Barbican Highwalk.

The Director of the Built Environment responded that the sign was part of the Legible London initiative, which had been considered by the Sub Committee and Planning & Transportation Committee previously, but had also been considered elsewhere for the Barbican Estate, where multiple options for delivery had been considered. The Director of the Built Environment asked that specific concerns be reported so that further information could be provided.

17. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

RESOLVED - That under Section 100(A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of the Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

Item No.	Paragraph(s) in Schedule 12A
18 – 20	3
21	-

18. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**

RESOLVED – That the non-public minutes of the meeting held on 15 October 2020 be agreed as a correct record.

19. **PUBLIC REALM SECURITY PROGRAMME**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment.

20. **ALDGATE (PORTSOKEN) PAVILION**

The Sub Committee considered a report of the City Surveyor.

21. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS WHICH THE SUB COMMITTEE AGREES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**

There was one item of other business.

The meeting ended at 12.58 pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Joseph Anstee
tel. no.: 020 7332 1480
Joseph.Anstee@cityoflondon.gov.uk