

Committees: Corporate Projects Board - for decision Project Sub Committee – for decision Planning and Transportation Committee - for decision	Dates: Delegated Authority 23 February 2021 24 February 2021
Subject: Car Parks – Fire Remedial Works (CS Ref – 044/21) Unique Project Identifier: <i>PV ID: 12260</i>	Gateway 2: Project Proposal Regular
Report of: City Surveyor Report Author: Jessica Lees	For Decision
<h1>PUBLIC</h1>	

Recommendations

1. Next steps and requested decisions	<p>Project Description: <i>This project will carry out essential fire door replacements at Baynard House and London Wall Car Park, and ventilation replacement at Tower Hill.</i></p> <p>Next Gateway: Gateway 3/4 - Options Appraisal (Regular)</p> <p>Next Steps: <i>To get a detailed survey to provide options at gateway 3/4</i></p> <p>Funding Source: City Fund Reserve</p> <p>'In principle' funding of up to £1,032,000 was approved by Resource Allocation Sub and Policy and Resources Committees in December 2019 as part of the 2020/21 annual capital bid round of which £669,000 has been utilised for the Baynard House Car Park – Ventilation and Smoke Clearance Project (Project ID – 12195)</p> <p>Requested Decisions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. That a budget of £30,000 is approved to carry out detailed surveys to reach next gateway. 2. To note the total estimated cost of the project of £300,000 (excluding risk).
--	---

	<p>3. To note that there is a Costed Risk of £60,000 (post-mitigation).</p> <p>4. To note that the total estimated cost of the project of £360,000 (including risk).</p> <p>5. To note that 'in principle' central funding from City Fund reserves was agreed as part of the 2020/21 annual capital bids, with draw down subject to the further approval of the Resource Allocation Sub and Policy and Resources Committees.</p>																												
<p>2. Resource requirements to reach next Gateway</p>	<table border="1" data-bbox="528 555 1402 1561"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="528 555 761 701">Item</th> <th data-bbox="761 555 1023 701">Reason</th> <th data-bbox="1023 555 1249 701">Funds/ Source Funding</th> <th data-bbox="1249 555 1402 701">of Cost (£)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="528 701 761 842">Consultant services engineer</td> <td data-bbox="761 701 1023 842">To carry out surveys</td> <td data-bbox="1023 701 1249 842">City Fund Reserves</td> <td data-bbox="1249 701 1402 842">£15,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="528 842 761 985">Fire consultant</td> <td data-bbox="761 842 1023 985">To carry out fire compartment/ fire door survey</td> <td data-bbox="1023 842 1249 985">City Fund Reserves</td> <td data-bbox="1249 842 1402 985">£5,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="528 985 761 1276">R&D asbestos survey</td> <td data-bbox="761 985 1023 1276">Survey to locate and identify all asbestos-containing materials (ACMs)</td> <td data-bbox="1023 985 1249 1276">City Fund Reserves</td> <td data-bbox="1249 985 1402 1276">£3,500</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="528 1276 761 1384">Other</td> <td data-bbox="761 1276 1023 1384">Planning/ building control</td> <td data-bbox="1023 1276 1249 1384">City Fund Reserve</td> <td data-bbox="1249 1276 1402 1384">£3,500</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="528 1384 761 1491">Staff costs</td> <td data-bbox="761 1384 1023 1491">Project management</td> <td data-bbox="1023 1384 1249 1491">City Fund Reserve</td> <td data-bbox="1249 1384 1402 1491">£3,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="528 1491 761 1561">Total</td> <td data-bbox="761 1491 1023 1561"></td> <td data-bbox="1023 1491 1249 1561"></td> <td data-bbox="1249 1491 1402 1561">£30,000</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Item	Reason	Funds/ Source Funding	of Cost (£)	Consultant services engineer	To carry out surveys	City Fund Reserves	£15,000	Fire consultant	To carry out fire compartment/ fire door survey	City Fund Reserves	£5,000	R&D asbestos survey	Survey to locate and identify all asbestos-containing materials (ACMs)	City Fund Reserves	£3,500	Other	Planning/ building control	City Fund Reserve	£3,500	Staff costs	Project management	City Fund Reserve	£3,000	Total			£30,000
Item	Reason	Funds/ Source Funding	of Cost (£)																										
Consultant services engineer	To carry out surveys	City Fund Reserves	£15,000																										
Fire consultant	To carry out fire compartment/ fire door survey	City Fund Reserves	£5,000																										
R&D asbestos survey	Survey to locate and identify all asbestos-containing materials (ACMs)	City Fund Reserves	£3,500																										
Other	Planning/ building control	City Fund Reserve	£3,500																										
Staff costs	Project management	City Fund Reserve	£3,000																										
Total			£30,000																										
<p>3. Governance arrangements</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planning and Transportation • Senior Responsible Officer - Ian Hughes, Deputy Director, Transportation and Public Realm • Project Manager to be allocated once the gateway 2 report has been approved • A project board is not required as this is a regular project and works are not considered complex or to impact on a high number of stakeholders 																												

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project will be progressed by the City Surveyor's Department (CSD) in conjunction with the Department of Built Environment.
--	---

Project Summary

<p>4. Context</p>	<p>4.1 Most recent fire risk assessments for Tower Hill, London Wall and Baynard House car parks have identified several fire risks where fabric and mechanical and electrical remedial actions are required to be carried out.</p> <p>4.2 Each car park contains several electrical vehicle charge points, which are deemed higher risk with recent guidance on installation of fast, rapid and super vehicle charging units it is essential that fire actions are addressed to ensure the safety of each car park.</p> <p>4.3 The work identified is in line with the forward maintenance plan for the property.</p> <p>4.4 If the work is not carried out then the car parks are at risk of closure.</p>
<p>5. Brief description of project</p>	<p>5.1 The project will replace fire doors where required at both Baynard House and London Wall Car Parks. These works are currently not covered by existing projects.</p> <p>5.2 The project will also replace the ventilation at Tower Hill Car Park which is near the end of its economic repair.</p>
<p>6. Consequences if project not approved</p>	<p>6.1 If deferred, sites will continue to be an increased risk that a fire would have significant consequences. Given the public awareness of the Grenfell Tower fire as well as the King's Dock car park fire next to the Echo Arena in Liverpool in 2017, there is a public expectation that local authorities are doing all they can to mitigate fire risk in their buildings</p> <p>6.2 The current installations have been identified as actions on the car park risk assessments which links into the car parks life care plans.</p> <p>6.3 Current H&S issues identified would remain including poor ventilation at Tower Hill Car Park exposing the City to the risk of legal challenges by not providing a safe environment.</p> <p>6.4 Local authorities are required to ensure their premises are fundamentally safe and fit for purpose. The review of the</p>

	<p>Echo Arena fire highlighted the implications of a fire spreading rapidly from vehicle to vehicle & floor to floor, accelerated by the failure of plastic fuel tanks. This re-emphasised the need for effective sprinkler systems, ventilation and fire management procedures to underpin an integrated risk management plan.</p> <p>6.5 If the car parks were closed due to not meeting the required standards identified, the City could lose a projected £1,920,000 per annum based upon 2021/22 budgeted income.</p>
7. SMART project objectives	<p><i>What is the project required to achieve? Highlight a few objectives. These may be derived from your measures of success as described in your Project Briefing.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>To ensure that there is a compliant ventilation system, fit for purpose with acceptable levels of carbon monoxide and other pollutants present</i> - <i>This project aligns to two key themes within DBE's Business Plan, namely:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Creating a welcoming seven-day City that is inclusive, safe, clean and easy to move around</i> • <i>Improving the quality and safety of the environment for businesses, workers, residents and visitors</i> <p><i>Safe off-street facilities, whether for public parking, consolidation or other uses, remain a key element of the Transport Strategy</i></p>
8. Key benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>To reduce maintenance charges incurred</i> - <i>To provide a compliant building and removal of risk from risk registers</i> - <i>To provide a safe environment for staff, contractors and the general public.</i>
9. Project category	1. Health and safety
10. Project priority	A. Essential
11. Notable exclusions	<p>11.1 <i>Baynard House and London Wall ventilation, fire alarm and sprinklers which are covered by other capital projects already within the gateway process.</i></p> <p>11.2 <i>Minories Car Park has been excluded from the scope at gateway 2 due to funding however we are exploring ways to carry out the necessary assessment of Minories which may lead to a further capital bid this year.</i></p>

Options Appraisal

<p>12. Overview of options</p>	<p><u>Numbered list format</u></p> <p><i>Option 1 – Closure of the car park due to not meeting the required standards identified and high risk to the public</i></p> <p><i>Option 2 Refurbishment of the existing ventilation, replace and repair fire doors where applicable</i></p> <p><i>Option 3 – Replace the ventilation system in its entirety and replace all fire doors that require repair as well as replacement</i></p>
---------------------------------------	--

Project Planning

<p>13. Delivery period and key dates</p>	<p>Overall project: <i>Six months from start work on site/ estimated completion date October 2022.</i></p> <p>The project briefing previously estimated a completion date of between June and August 2021, this was on the basis that the project would start on site between May – July 2020. Due to Covid-19 and a review of project scope as other projects have superseded some of the works identified in the original project brief, the start on site date is now estimated May 2022 with an estimated completion date of October 2022.</p> <p>Key dates:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="528 1178 1431 2018"> <tr> <td>Gateway 2 approval</td> <td>March 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Produce brief for the survey works</td> <td>April 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tender consultancy service</td> <td>May 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Appoint consultant for survey and design</td> <td>June 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Undertake asbestos R&D survey</td> <td>June 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gateway 3 - 4 report for approval</td> <td>September 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Finalise tender documents</td> <td>October 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tender project</td> <td>November 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tender return</td> <td>December 2021</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gateway 5 report for approval</td> <td>February 2022</td> </tr> </table>	Gateway 2 approval	March 2021	Produce brief for the survey works	April 2021	Tender consultancy service	May 2021	Appoint consultant for survey and design	June 2021	Undertake asbestos R&D survey	June 2021	Gateway 3 - 4 report for approval	September 2021	Finalise tender documents	October 2021	Tender project	November 2021	Tender return	December 2021	Gateway 5 report for approval	February 2022
Gateway 2 approval	March 2021																				
Produce brief for the survey works	April 2021																				
Tender consultancy service	May 2021																				
Appoint consultant for survey and design	June 2021																				
Undertake asbestos R&D survey	June 2021																				
Gateway 3 - 4 report for approval	September 2021																				
Finalise tender documents	October 2021																				
Tender project	November 2021																				
Tender return	December 2021																				
Gateway 5 report for approval	February 2022																				

	Place order with contractor	March 2022
	Start work on site	May 2022
	Project completion	October 2022
	Gateway 6 outcome report for approval	April 2023
<p>Other works dates to coordinate: <i>these works are likely to coincide with the London Wall Car Park ventilation, electrical and fire alarm project. We do not envisage works to impact upon one another.</i></p>		
14. Risk implications	<p>Overall project risk: Low</p> <p><i>Project risk is low as at early stages of the gateway process.</i></p> <p>The overall project risk may change once detailed surveys are carried out as part of the gateway 2.</p> <p>Please note the current total costed risk (post-mitigation) for the project of £60,000</p> <p>Further information available within the Risk Register (Appendix 2).</p> <p>We are closely monitoring the state of these facilities to ensure the delay to the intended programme does not materially affect their safety and risk to the public.</p>	
15. Stakeholders and consultees	<p>15.1 Department of Built Environment (DBE) – Highways</p> <p>15.2 DBE District Surveyors –Gordon Roy</p> <p>15.3 Terence Short – Fire Officer, CSD</p> <p>15.4 DBE parking contractor – SABA</p>	

Resource Implications

16. Total estimated cost	<p>Likely cost range (excluding risk): £280,000 - £300,000</p> <p>Likely cost range (including risk): £340,000 - £363,000</p>	
17. Funding strategy	<p>Choose 1:</p> <p>All funding fully guaranteed</p>	<p>Choose 1:</p> <p>Internal - Funded wholly by City's own resource</p>

	Funds/Sources of Funding	Cost (£)
	City Fund Reserves*	£363,000
	Total	
	<p><i>*'In principle' funding of £1.032m was approved by Resource Allocation Sub and Policy and Resources Committees in December 2019 as part of the 2020/21 annual capital bid round. Of this sum, £669,000 has already been allocated for the Baynard House Car Park works agreed under a separate gateway report, leaving £363,000 for this scheme to be funded from the On-Street Parking Reserve.</i></p>	
18. Investment appraisal	Annual loss of income if the Car Parks were to close is £1,920,000 (based on 2021/22 budgeted income)	
19. Procurement strategy/route to market	<p><i>The procurement of the Consultants will be run in line with the City of London's procurement code and liaising with the City Procurement Team if necessary.</i></p> <p><i>The works for this project proposed at the next gateway, will at this time be run via the Intermediate Works Framework as a competition to all parties through City Procurement.</i></p>	
20. Legal implications	<i>We have a legal duty of care to ensure that the car parks are safely managed and maintained from a fire risk perspective.</i>	
21. Corporate property implications	<i>This project aligns with the Corporate Property Asset Management Strategy 2020-2025 to ensure that operational assets are maintained in good, safe and statutory compliant condition.</i>	
22. Traffic implications	<i>Parking bays will need to temporarily be closed off to enable plant replacement above</i>	
23. Sustainability and energy implications	None	
24. IS implications	None	
25. Equality Impact Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>An equality impact assessment will not be undertaken</i> 	
26. Data Protection Impact Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The risk to personal data is less than high or non-applicable and a data protection impact assessment will not be undertaken</i> 	

Appendices

Appendix 1	Project Briefing – Fire Safety in Public Car Parks
Appendix 2	Risk Register

Contact

Report Author	Jessica Lees
Email Address	jessica.lees@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	07872114059