

Appendix 4 Guildhall Scoring Matrix

Criteria	Health, Safety & Security	COL Reputational	Sustainability & Equality	Asset performance	Client Feedback	
Criteria weighting	5	4	5	5	2	
Description	<p>1 To what extent is the COL exposed to risk if project not undertaken in this programme</p> <p>2 Is the project required to meet a statutory compliance standard (e.g. Reservoir Act)</p> <p>3 Is the project required to meet the equivalent of a highways agency standard (structural integrity)</p>	<p>1 To what extent is the COL reputation tarnished or risked if the project is not undertaken in this programme</p> <p>2 How does the proposed work maintain or protect the heritage of the property or its local standing</p>	<p>To what extent does the specific project contribute towards Sustainability and Equality in accordance with the Climate Action Strategy and Equalities Act</p>	<p>What impact will sudden unexpected failure of the asset have on the COL to deliver its front line services</p>	<p>1 Is the project of sufficient importance to the occupying department that they consider it meritorious from a front line service delivery perspective</p> <p>2 Is their Member or committee or other interests that have not been taken into account</p>	
Note	<p>Any immediate high risk should be dealt with using LR budgets</p> <p>Although technically a whole building is protected under a listing - there are key features or attributes that led to its listing status</p> <p>Reference made to the Climate Action Strategy and Equalities, Inclusion and Diversity Policies</p> <p>1 The evidence should be demonstrable not hearsay. NB its not sufficient to indicate a broad support for all projects</p> <p>2 Client feedback may in some cases result in the project being deleted or deferred</p>					
RATING SCALE	0					
	1	No H&S implications	<p>1 No reputational impact</p> <p>2 Non public support space, temporary use, underutilised or</p> <p>3 Not listed, General operational building, staff welfare or</p> <p>4 Listed (any grade) but project not relevant to listing status</p>	<p>1 No impact on Sustainability</p> <p>2 No impact on Equality</p>	<p>Failure will have little or no impact on front line service delivery</p>	The occupying department has not identified this project as a priority
	3	<p>1 Where works are considered industry best practice</p> <p>2 Where works have been recommended in a Fire Risk Assessment</p>	Isolated service user /stakeholder complaints contained within business unit	<p>1 Where the project will improve Energy Efficiency and Sustainability</p> <p>2 Where works are required to cover provision of welfare facilities for Members of the public generally</p>	<p>1 Failure will have minor impact on service delivery, typically up to 1 day</p> <p>2 unexpected failure unaffordable against local risk budget</p>	<p>1 The Head of Service has identified this project as key to their service delivery</p> <p>2 There were other relevant factors that were not available to the evaluation team</p>
	5	There is deemed to be a valid and current health and safety risk and that risk is likely to increase disproportionately if works are not undertaken within a reasonable time frame (say within 18 months).	Adverse local media coverage, multiple service user & stakeholder complaints but with careful handling it can be managed	<p>1 Where the project will significantly improve energy efficiency and sustainability</p> <p>2 Where works are needed to facilities that are relied upon by a protected group in a general purpose building such as public car park</p>	<p>1 Service disruption 2-5 days</p> <p>2 Repeated failure of the asset - repairs proved unsuccessful.</p> <p>3 Beyond economic repair</p> <p>4 There is no viable long term workaround solution</p>	<p>1 A Consultative Committee has expressed its wish that the project be considered of more importance than others</p> <p>2 A Chief Officer has expressed a wish that the project be considered as more important than others</p>
	7	<p>1 Where failure to provide might negate insurance cover</p> <p>2 Required to maintain to the equivalent of a highways agency standard</p>	<p>1 Adverse national media coverage 1-3 days</p> <p>2 Grade 2 or 2*, Conservation area or of national importance</p>	<p>1 Project will assist with delivering the Climate Action Strategy</p> <p>2 Where works are needed to facilities that are specifically provided for a protected group such as primary school, medical centre and Children's Library</p>	Service Disruption > 1week to 4 weeks	A Member or Service Committee has expressed a wish that the project be given priority over others
	9	<p>1 Required to provide to comply with statutory requirements</p> <p>2 Where failure to provide could have effect on wider populous</p>	<p>1 National publicity more than 3 days . Possible resignation of A Member or chief Officer</p> <p>2 Scheduled Ancient Monument, Grade 1, National Importance</p> <p>3 Required as a result of Court case</p>	<p>1 Project is mandated by Law</p> <p>2 Where failure to provide could have effect on wider populous</p>	Service disruption > 4 weeks.	<p>1 CASC has expressed their wish that the project be included as a priority list project (above the line)</p> <p>2 A Senior Grand Committee has expressed a wish that the project be included a priority list project (above the line)</p>

Appendix 4 Guildhall Scoring Matrix

			Criteria	Health, Safety & Security	COL Reputational	Sustainability & Equality	Asset performance	Client Feedback		
			Criteria weighting	5	4	5	5	2		
			Health, Safety & Security*	COL Reputational	Sustainability & Equality	Asset performance	Client Feedback			
Property	Project Title	Budget cost	Score	Score	Score	Score	Score	Total	Cumulative	
General	FABRIC CONDITION SURVEY FOR FORWARD MAINTENANCE PLANS	50,000	7	5	5	5	1	107	£50,000	
General	GANTRY PLATFORMS REPLACEMENT (PLANT ROOMS)	75,000	7	3	3	5	1	89	£125,000	
General	HEALTH AND SAFETY PAVING WORKS	25,000	7	5	1	5	1	87	£150,000	
North Wing	LIFT No. 1 REFURBISHMENT (FIRE FIGHTING)	120,000	7	5	1	5	1	87	£270,000	
North Wing	LIFT No. 2 REFURBISHMENT (FIRE FIGHTING)	120,000	7	5	1	5	1	87	£390,000	
East Wing	LIFT No. 40 REFURBISHMENT (GOODS)	100,000	7	3	1	5	1	79	£490,000	
North Wing	LIFT No. 8 REFURBISHMENT (KITCHEN)	25,000	7	3	1	5	1	79	£515,000	
West Wing	LIFT No. 23 REFURBISHMENT (PASSENGER)	170,000	7	3	1	5	1	79	£685,000	
General	Lift #25 REFURBISHMENT	120,000	7	3	1	5	1	79	£805,000	
West Wing	MCP ELECTRIC CAR CHARGERS SAFETY WORKS	40,000	6	5	7	5	1	107	£845,000	
North Wing	MOTORISED DAMPERS & BMS CONTROLS INSTALLATION	220,000	6	3	7	5	1	99	£1,065,000	
General	CCTV CAMERAS REPLACEMENT (PART)	45,000	6	5	1	5	1	91	£1,110,000	
General	SPECIAL STRUCTURES INSPECTIONS	50,000	6	5	1	5	1	82	£1,160,000	
West Wing	BAGGAGE SCANNING EQUIPMENT REPLACEMENT	100,000	6	3	3	3	1	74	£1,260,000	
General	FWT REMEDIALS	50,000	4	1	7	5	1	86		
General	FLOODING - FABRIC WORKS TO REMEDIATE PROBLEM	240,000	4	5	1	5	1	72		
Crypts	EMERGENCY LIGHTING REPLACEMENT	15,000	4	3	1	5	1	64		
General	DIRECT EXCHANGE UNITS REPLACEMENT (COOLING)	100,000	3	5	7	5	1	97		
General	ROOF H&V DUCT LAGGING AND HEATING PUMP REPLACEMENT (6 No.)	100,000	3	3	7	5	1	89		
General	FILTERED WATER UNITS REPLACEMENT (HOT/COLD WATER)	70,000	3	5	3	5	1	77		
Great Hall	EXTERNAL STONEMWORK INSPECTION	65,000	3	7	1	5	1	75		
Old Library	STONEMWORK (EXTERNAL) SURVEY & REMEDIAL WORK	60,000	3	7	1	5	1	75		
Dance Porch, North and South Ambulatory, West Entrance Area	ROOF SURVEY	15,000	3	1	3	7	1	71		
East Wing	STONEMWORK EXTERNAL SURVEY AND REMEDIAL WORK	60,000	3	5	1	5	1	67		
Crypts	MORTAR RECONSOLIDATION (PHENE NEALE ROOM)	25,000	3	7	1	3	1	65		
Crypts	STONE OVERHAUL	25,000	3	7	1	3	1	65		
General	SOLID DIVERTERS/SUMP PUMPS REPLACEMENT	30,000	3	3	1	5	1	59		
East Wing	EMERGENCY LIGHTING BATTERIES REPLACEMENT	30,000	3	3	1	5	1	59		
Dance Porch, North and South Ambulatory, West Entrance Area	EXTERNAL WALLS SURVEY	15,000	3	5	1	1	1	47		
City Centre	HEATING CONTROLS REPLACEMENT	60,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
East Wing	DHWS - CONTROLS REPLACEMENT	60,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
East Wing	HEAT SOURCE - CONTROLS REPLACEMENT	130,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
East Wing	SPACE HEATING - CLEANING	120,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
North Wing	BMS SERVER REPLACEMENT	40,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
North Wing	CHILLER PRESSURE RELEASE VALVE REPLACEMENT	40,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
North Wing	REMEDIAL WORKS TO PREVENT COLD SPOTS	60,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
West Wing	BMS CONTROLS UPGRADE	50,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
West Wing	SPACE HEATING - AHU CARBON FILTERS REPLACEMENT	25,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
West Wing	SPACE HEATING - AHU OVERHAUL	75,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
West Wing	SURVEY AND WORKS TO REINSTATE HVAC SERVICES	100,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
West Wing Members Areas	HVAC SYSTEM REPLACEMENT (BEDROOMS AND FLATS)	250,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
Old Library	EVENT SPACE HVAC WORKS	165,000	1	3	7	5	1	79		
North Wing	NORTH WING RECEPTION TOILETS REFURBISHMENT	30,000	1	5	5	5	1	77		
Print Room, Chief Commoner's Parlour, Ante Room Areas	STAIRS, BANNISTERS, HANDRAILS OVERHAUL	15,000	1	3	7	3	1	69		
Great Hall	JOINERY RESTORATION - MINSTREL'S BALCONY OVERHAUL	40,000	1	7	1	5	1	65		
City Centre	REVOLVING DOOR REPLACEMENT	75,000	1	3	3	5	1	59		
North Wing	STAFF KITCHEN EQUIPMENT REPLACEMENT	35,000	1	3	1	7	1	59		
Print Room, Chief Commoner's Parlour, Ante Room Areas	STAINED GLASS AND GLASS WINDOWS OVERHAUL	20,000	1	3	5	3	1	59		
Old Library	RAINWATER GOODS REPLACEMENT	60,000	1	3	1	5	1	49		
West Wing	METAL CEILING GENERAL REPLACEMENT-TILES ONLY	25,000	1	3	3	3	1	49		
Print Room, Chief Commoner's Parlour, Ante Room Areas	CEILINGS SURVEY	60,000	1	3	1	3	1	39		
Print Room, Chief Commoner's Parlour, Ante Room Areas	EXTERNAL & INTERNAL WALLS SURVEY	15,000	1	3	1	3	1	39		
West Wing Members Areas	2ND FLOOR COMMITTEE RECEPTION & WAITING AREA REFURBISHMENT	60,000	1	3	1	3	1	39		
General	INTERNAL DECORATIONS	45,000	1	5	1	1	1	37		
1 Guildhall Yard	INTERNAL DECORATIONS	30,000	1	3	1	1	1	29		
East Wing	WINDOW BLINDS REPLACEMENT	15,000	1	3	1	1	1	29		
Old Library	PICTURE RAILS OVERHAUL	15,000	1	3	1	1	1	29		

Appendix 4 Guildhall Scoring Matrix

		Criteria	Health, Safety & Security	COL Reputational	Sustainability & Equality	Asset performance	Client Feedback	
		Criteria weighting	5	4	5	5	2	
Print Room, Chief Commoner's Parlour, Ante Room Areas	STONE FLOORS SURVEY	20,000	1	3	1	1	1	29
West Wing Members Areas	2ND FLOOR COMMITTEE ROOMS BLINDS REPLACEMENT	60,000	1	3	1	1	1	29
West Wing Members Areas	3RD FLOOR FEMALE TOILET REFURBISHMENT	30,000	1	3	1	1	1	29
East Wing	CEILING CLEANING	20,000	1	1	1	1	1	21
East Wing	INTERNAL DECORATIONS	15,000	1	1	1	1	1	21
West Wing	CEILING, LIGHTING & DECORATION (BASEMENT LOBBY AREA)	25,000	1	1	1	1	1	21
West Wing Members Areas	4TH FLOOR CHIEF COMMONER'S FLAT REFURBISHMENT	15,000	1	1	1	1	1	21
Total		£4,060,000						