

Committees: Corporate Projects Board – <i>[for decision]</i> Epping Forest & Commons Committee <i>[for decision]</i> Operational Property and Projects Sub <i>[for decision]</i>	Dates: 06 October 2021 19 November 2021 21 June 2022
Subject: Provision of Staff Welfare Facilities at Chingford Golf Course Epping. (SEF 53/21) Unique Project Identifier: 12060	Gateway 6: Outcome Report Light
Report of: Director of Open Spaces Report Author: Jo Hurst Business Manager Epping Forest	For Decision
PUBLIC	

Summary

1. Status update	Project Description: Project to construct welfare facilities. RAG Status: Green (Green at last report) Risk Status: Low (low at last report) Costed Risk Provision Utilised: £0 (of which £0 was drawn down at the last report to Committee). Final Outturn Cost: £64,520.67
2. Next steps and requested decisions	Requested Decisions: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Note the report and lessons learned 2. Approve closure of this project
3. Key conclusions	<i>Permission was granted to construct standalone welfare facilities for the Chingford Golf Course Groundskeeping team, at a total estimated cost of £156,000</i> <i>During the early planning stages for the standalone unit, a tenant occupying a building on site (Orion Harriers) confirmed their request to construct an extension to their own facilities on the same site. The opportunity was taken to include our own requirements into this build as a small addition to their extension,</i>

	<p><i>with the construction project for managed by Orion Harriers. This greatly reduced CoL planning, management, and construction costs.</i></p> <p><i>Although construction was slowed significantly by COVID-19 restrictions and adverse weather conditions, construct and fit was completed in Spring 2021 at less than half of the original estimated figure.</i></p> <p><i>Project was completed approximately one year later than estimated, but at less than half estimated budget.</i></p>
--	---

Main Report

Design & Delivery Review

<p>4. Design into delivery</p>	<p><i>Original design was for a standalone welfare and administration building adjacent to the existing workshop building.</i></p> <p><i>Prior to planning application, the opportunity to work in partnership with Orion Harriers was approved by Epping Forest and Commons Committee and allowed for the welfare unit aspects of the build to be incorporated into the Orion Harriers extension project.</i></p> <p><i>Plans and full tender applications were managed by Orion Harriers and overseen by Epping Forest staff and City Surveyors, with contract award being approved by CSD and Procurement. Costs to CoL were agreed at a proportion split equal to the ground area ratio of the Orion Harriers / CoL plan.</i></p> <p><i>Epping Forest staff were involved throughout and monitored planning and construction for all parts of the build, including layout and fit of the City of London section.</i></p> <p><i>The Chingford Golf Course staff welfare facility is now complete, adjoined to the Orion Harriers running club extension, but accessed separately with its own door opening towards the golf course yard.</i></p>
<p>5. Options appraisal</p>	<p><i>Original project options were:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>1. Previous architect plans were for very high spec and high-cost solution at approximately £200K. A lower, but satisfactory specification can be achieved for £100K - £150K. This option is recommended</i> <i>2. A lower budget option of up to £20K, using a container-style static ready-made unit has been explored, but denied necessary long-term planning permission, therefore this option is not recommended.</i>

	<p>3. <i>Retaining the team in neighbouring lodge is unsatisfactory, as well as contrary to planning classification, therefore this option is not recommended.</i></p> <p><i>However, the opportunity to work with Orion Harriers as part of their planned build delivered all the requirements of Option 1, but at significantly reduced cost and resource. This route was approved by the Epping Forest and Commons Committee in September 2019</i></p>
6. Procurement route	<p><i>All tender processes were carried out by Orion Harriers as third-party project managers. This was overseen by Epping Forest and City Surveyors staff and authorised through Procurement. As management of contractors was through Orion Harriers, not direct, this did lead to some frustration and delay to communication, including quality of materials for example, but all issues were resolved and overall did not outweigh the financial and time savings.</i></p>
7. Skills base	<p><i>In house staff at Epping Forest and City Surveyors were sufficient to meet demand for this project.</i></p>
8. Stakeholders	<p><i>Stakeholders were Chingford Golf Course Greenkeeping Team, through to all layers of Epping Forest management and governance. Sufficient updates were provided considering the comparatively low risk and value of the project.</i></p>

Variation Review

9. Assessment of project against key milestones	<p><i>As the project was agreed to be delivered through partnership with Orion Harriers, and CoL therefore had less influence on timescales, original project target completion was March 2020. In reality, moving to partner timescales as well as Covid-19 restrictions and adverse weather conditions as delayed the delivery Spring 2021. Staff requirements for washing and toilet facilities were met during this time first by delaying vacation of Jubilee Retreat flat, then by provision of mobile toilet unit.</i></p> <p><i>Original project cost estimate was £156,000. This was revised to £80,000 when the partnership with Orion Harriers was agreed. Final actual costs were £64,520.67</i></p> <p><i>Benchmark measures of success included in original project brief were:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>1. Fit for purpose office and welfare facilities. These have been delivered in full.</i> <i>2. Office connectivity provided improving management of critical information such as H&S risk assessments and financial records. Office facilities have relocated to inside workshop, including improved connectivity.</i>
--	--

	<i>3. Jubilee Retreat flat 1 vacated. Both flats 1 and 2 are vacant and undergoing refurbishment prior to occupation.</i>
10. Assessment of project against Scope	<i>The original scope of construction of a self-contained unit providing toilet washing and catering facilities for the Chingford Golf Course Greenkeeping team was instead delivered through a third-party construction project on the same site, delivering kitchen, shower, and toilet facilities. Office function was improved through contained subdivision of workshop space. All project deliverables complete.</i>
11. Risks and issues	<p><i>Pandemic risk was unidentified and slowed delivery.</i></p> <p><i>Adverse weather conditions also slowed construction. Contract was at fixed price, so delay did not increase costs.</i></p> <p><i>On site communication between Golf staff, Orion Harriers and contractors was generally good, with separation of construction site and golf operational areas well respected. Logistical conflict of CoL and contractor staff and vehicles was minimised with no reported incidents.</i></p> <p><i>Tendering was overseen and approved by City Surveyors, and contract was subsequently managed by Orion Harriers.</i></p>
12. Transition to BAU	<i>Temporary toilet facilities have been removed from site and staff have transferred to new welfare facility.</i>

Value Review

13. Budget	<table border="1"> <tr> <td><i>Estimated</i></td> <td>£156,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td><i>Outturn Cost (G2)</i></td> <td>£64,520.67</td> </tr> </table>		<i>Estimated</i>	£156,000	<i>Outturn Cost (G2)</i>	£64,520.67
	<i>Estimated</i>	£156,000				
	<i>Outturn Cost (G2)</i>	£64,520.67				
		<i>At Authority to Start work (G5)</i>	<i>Final Outturn Cost</i>			
	<i>Fees</i>	£5000	£0			
	<i>Staff Costs</i>	£1000	£0			
	<i>Works</i>	£150,000	£64,520.67			
	<i>Purchases</i>	£	£			
	<i>Other Capital Expend</i>	£	£			
	<i>Costed Risk Provision</i>	£	£			
<i>Recharges</i>	£	£				
<i>Other*</i>	£	£				
<i>Total</i>	£156,000	£64,520.67				

	<p><i>Please ensure that the Authority to Start Work (G5) column reflects the budget approved for the initial Gateway report submitted at this stage (prior to any later budget increases/issues reports).</i></p> <p><i>*If ‘Other’ provide a brief note on the contents</i></p> <p>Please confirm whether or not the Final Account for this project has been verified.*</p> <p><i>*Please note that the Chamberlain’s department Financial Services division will need to verify Final Accounts relating to medium and high-risk projects valued between £250k and £5m and all projects valued in excess of £5m. All Final accounts which exceed £50,000 in value will be subject to an independent verification check, undertaken by a suitably experienced officer within the relevant implementing department, regardless of whether the overall risk of the project has been assessed at some point as low, medium, or high risk,</i></p> <p><i>In addition, final accounts of £2,000,000 and above will also be subject to final account verification by the Chamberlain’s Financial Services Division (FSD) where (i) the value is £2,000,000 to £10,000,000 and the overall risk of the project has been assessed at some point as “Medium” or “High”, and (ii) the value exceeds £10,000,000 regardless of the risk assessment.</i></p> <p>£10K of works in 2019/20 were transferred to Epping Forest Fund (restricted Capital Account). The remainder of outlay in 2020/21 was absorbed by the better-than-budgeted income from golf play, directly due to national Covid-19 restrictions in this year.</p>
<p>14. Investment</p>	<p><i>Not an invest to save project, other than the potential to free up domestic lodges at Jubilee Retreat which may eventually be let to generate income to Epping Forest (outside the scope of this project)</i></p> <p><i>Key driver for project was Health and Safety welfare provision to staff which has been delivered in full.</i></p>
<p>15. Assessment of project against SMART objectives</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <i>To provide toilet and washing facilities and office space for the Chingford Golf Course Greenkeeping team by 31st March 2020. The project was severely delayed but has now delivered this objective in full.</i> 2. <i>To vacate Flat 1 Jubilee Retreat by the same date in order to refurbish for domestic occupation/rental. The flat was</i>

	<p><i>vacated and temporary toilet facilities were provided on site.</i></p> <p>3. To improve connectivity to IT systems to Greenkeepers through provision of desk space and computer terminal. <i>Provided through internal modifications to workshop space.</i></p>
16. Key benefits realised	<p>1. <i>Chingford Golf Course Greenkeeping team now have a fit for purpose welfare facility, providing toilet and kitchen facilities and respite from adverse weather. The Workplace (Health, Safety & Welfare) Regulations 1992 oblige employers to provide welfare facilities for the wellbeing of staff.</i></p> <p>2. <i>Jubilee Retreat Flats 1 & 2 have been vacated and are undergoing refurbishment, with the intention to be let and income returning to Epping Forest.</i></p> <p>3. <i>Relationship with tenants Orion Harriers is good, and their facilities have been expanded, in turn benefitting runners in London and Essex.</i></p>

Lessons Learned and Recommendations

17. Positive reflections	<i>The opportunity to complete construction through a third party seeking to extend their own premises on site saved significantly on management and construction costs, as well as avoiding potential logistical difficulties of having two construction firms on site at the same time.</i>
18. Improvement reflections	<i>Management was difficult through Covid-19 and would have ideally had more site inspections from CoL. Agreed costs were for delivered build and unaffected by delays due to weather or Covid-19 restrictions. Orion Harriers provided day-to-day management of contractors, to CoL specifications. This did make some elements of communication slower, but the cost savings by far outweighed these minor issues.</i>
19. Sharing best practice	<i>This is a small value, low risk project, but Epping Forest and Commons Committee have been informed of outturn. Open Spaces Lodge Board continue to be kept aware of this and similar projects.</i>
20. AOB	<i>None</i>

Contact

Report Author	Jo Hurst, Business Manager Epping Forest
Email Address	Jo.hurst@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	020 8532 5317