

POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE
Thursday, 6 July 2023

Minutes of the meeting of the Policy and Resources Committee held at Committee Rooms, 2nd Floor, West Wing, Guildhall on Thursday, 6 July 2023 at 1.45 pm

Present

Members:

Deputy Christopher Hayward (Chairman)
Deputy Keith Bottomley (Deputy Chairman)
Tijs Broeke (Vice-Chair)
Caroline Haines (Vice-Chair)
Munsur Ali
Deputy Randall Anderson (Ex-Officio Member)
Deputy Henry Colthurst (Ex-Officio Member)
Mary Durcan (Ex-Officio Member)
Helen Fentimen
Deputy Marianne Fredericks
Alderman Timothy Hailes
Deputy Ann Holmes (Chief Commoner) (Ex-Officio Member)
Alderman Ian David Luder
Paul Martinelli
Catherine McGuinness
Deputy Andrien Meyers
Deputy Brian Mooney
Deputy Alastair Moss (Ex-Officio Member)
Alderman Sir William Russell
Ruby Sayed (Ex-Officio Member)
Tom Sleigh
Deputy Sir Michael Snyder

In Attendance (Guildhall)

Deputy Henry Pollard
Oliver Sells

In Attendance (observing online)

Deputy Rehana Ameer
Deputy Mark Bostock

Officers:

Ian Thomas, CBE	- Town Clerk and Chief Executive
Bob Roberts	- Deputy Town Clerk
Gregory Moore	- Assistant Town Clerk and Executive Director, Governance and Members Services
Jen Beckermann	- Executive Director and Private Secretary to the Chairman of Policy and Resources Committee
Polly Dunn, Clerk	- Town Clerk's Department

Benjamin Dixon	- Town Clerk's Department
David Mendoza Wolfson	- Town Clerk's Department
Chris Rumbles	- Town Clerk's Department
Michael Cogher	- Comptroller and City Solicitor and Deputy Chief Executive
Caroline Al-Beyerty	- Chamberlain
Sonia Virdee	- Chamberlain's Department
Paul Double	- City Remembrancer
Paul Wright	- Deputy Remembrancer
Emma Moore	- Chief Operating Officer
Genine Whitehorn	- Chief Operating Officer's Department
Paul Martin (For Item 5a)	- Consultant
Emily Tofield	- Executive Director of Corporate Communications and External Affairs
Damian Nussbaum	- Executive Director of Innovation and Growth
Ola Obadara	- City Surveyor's Department
Peter Young	- City Surveyor's Department
Robert Murphy	- City Surveyor's Department
Rob McNicol	- Environment Department
Jack Joslin	- Bridge House Estates
Barbara Hook	- Strategy Planning Intelligence and Performance

The Chairman took the opportunity to place on record his thanks to Alderman Luder at this, his last Policy and Resources Committee, before he steps down from the Court. The Chairman, on behalf of Policy and Resources Committee, wished Alderman Luder all the very best for his retirement and thanked him for his many years of service not only to this Committee but to the wider City Corporation, to London and the nation.

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from The Rt Hon The Lord Mayor Nicholas Lyons, Jason Groves, Michael Mainelli, Shravan Joshi, Philip Woodhouse and James Tumbridge.

2. MEMBERS DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

Alderman Timothy Hailes and Tijs Broeke declared an interest in respect of matters concerning St Lawrence Jewry Church.

3. MINUTES

- a) The public minutes of the Policy and Resources Committee meeting on 8 June 2023 were approved as an accurate record.
- b) The public minutes of the Capital Buildings Board meeting on 20 April 2023 were noted.

- c) The draft public minutes of the Capital Buildings Board meeting on 10 May 2023 were noted.

4. **MEMBER DEVELOPMENT AND STANDARDS SUB-COMMITTEE**

The Chairman referred to having previously held over his nomination as Deputy Chair of Member Development and Standards Sub-Committee, to allow for all Committees to have completed their appointments and for the full composition to be known.

The Chairman confirmed that, with the Membership now largely known, he would like to nominate Helen Fentimen as Deputy Chair, which he hoped Members would support.

RESOLVED: That Members:-

- Approved the Chairman's nomination of Helen Fentimen as Chair of Member Development and Standards Sub-Committee.

5. **PROJECT GOVERNANCE REVIEW**

a) **Independent review of Project-related Member Governance**

The Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk and Chief Executive providing an update on findings from an independent review of project governance arrangements at the City Corporation and seeking approval to a number of recommendations in this regard.

The Chairman introduced the item and provided background to the Project Governance Review commissioned by Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee to consider the City's project portfolio and an agreed revised scope of this review to include a review of Member Governance that would include, but was not limited to, Capital Buildings Board, Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee, Markets Board and any other associated Committee, and with the outcome before Members today for their consideration.

Paul Martin thanked Members of Policy and Resources Committee for inviting him to undertake the review, which he hoped would offer a helpful contribution towards Members' thinking as part of a driver for change for political governance and oversight of projects at the City Corporation.

Alderman Tim Hailes proposed a motion to amend a number of recommendations within the report, with this being seconded by Sir Michael Snyder, and which had been provided to Members in a separately circulated pack for their consideration. Alderman Hailes thanked officers for all the work that had gone into the project governance process, the vast majority of which he supported. The Alderman referred to the overwhelming workload of Operational Property and Projects Sub-Committee providing the rationale for the proposed amendments, which would allow for oversight of project management and procurement to sit under Finance Committee, with decision making relating to operational assets and disposals being placed under the responsibility of Resource Allocation Sub-Committee with these being corporate assets.

Sir Michael Snyder spoke in support of the proposed amendments confirming they were clarification amendments that were looking to ensure that resources were sitting under an appropriate body.

A number of Members spoke in support of the proposed amendments, which would look to make use of existing structures at the City Corporation, provide clarity on reporting lines and allow for strategic alignment across key areas.

The motion and proposed amendments were unanimously supported by Members. The motion was carried.

A discussion continued, during which there was concern raised at the proposed abolition of Markets Board, the potential downgrading of the importance of the markets to the City Corporation and any damage this could present to the Markets Bill going through Parliament. Caution was expressed at the proposed abolition of Markets Board.

Brian Mooney, proposed a motion, seconded by Catherine McGuinness, that recommendation 7 relating to dissolution of Markets Board and recommendation 9 relating to the continuation of Barking Reach Group and a proposed amendment to its terms of reference should both be removed. Catherine McGuinness added her support to the proposed amendment suggesting the recommendations as presented would be the wrong step at the wrong moment.

The Chairman responded confirming that he had taken soundings from the Remembrancer who had advised that abolition of Markets Board would not impact on progress of the Markets Bill through Parliament. The Chairman refuted any suggestion of a downgrading of the importance of the Markets to the City Corporation, with there having been a commitment to spend over £600m on a brand-new combined markets site in Dagenham.

A discussion followed on the proposed amendment, with it being stressed that there was an important distinction between relocation and operation of the Markets, with two independent reviews having now come to the same view relating to Markets Board. It was now time to accept the outcome of a further review and accept the abolition of Markets Board.

A Member remarked on there being logic in moving Markets Board into Port Health and Environmental Services Committee (PHESC), with there being the option of including Markets in the name of the committee moving forward. Markets Board was too focussed on operational matters, with the role of Members being to provide strategic oversight.

A Member made a statement on behalf of the Market Tenants, remarking on how Markets Board was not intended to form part of the Member Project Governance Review, with no evidence having been sought from Market Tenants on its proposed abolition. The Member suggested that the City Corporation needed to maintain an expert Markets Board and, as such, offered their support for the proposed amendment to the recommendations.

A Member, also Chair of Port Health and Environmental Services Committee, expressed surprise at the suggestion that the decision to abolish Markets Board was not evidenced based, with this now being the third occasion on which the proposal has been presented for consideration. The Member added how they could see no issue with the transfer of responsibility of the markets into PHESC, with the committee already involved in work on parts of the markets and it being able to absorb this addition to its areas of responsibilities.

There was a suggestion that more time was needed to consider the recommendations and arguments being put forward by Markets Board. The proposal deserved greater consideration given its transformative impact. The City Corporation has a duty of care to the Markets and traders, with consultation needed before any decision was taken.

A number of Members spoke in support of the recommendations as presented, with the proposals appearing to present a logical conclusion. A number of Committees have consultative committees with their users e.g., Open Spaces and the Chairman of PHESC could consider how best to convene consultative committees on operational matters on the markets.

At the conclusion of the discussion, Brian Mooney responded to the debate remarking on how he hoped the report would come forward to Court of Common Council as more balanced. The Remembrancer's advice was welcomed that no damage would be done to the Markets Bill, but there was still likely to be complaints from the Markets through any abolition of Markets Board. Rather than PHESC taking over Markets Board, it should be a merger with Markets Board and with markets to be included in the title of the Committee moving forward to create a sense of continuity.

The Chairman proposed moving to a decision on the motion and proposed amendment before Members. A vote followed with 3 Members in favour of the amendment, 16 Members being against and there being 2 abstentions. The motion was defeated.

Tijs Broeke put forward a motion, seconded by Andrien Meyers that the name of Port Health and Environmental Services Committee should be amended to include a markets element e.g., Port Health, Environmental Services and Markets Committee.

The Deputy Chairman expressed concern at renaming a Committee on the hoof without allowing for a proper level of consideration. A Member endorsed the Deputy Chairman's view, whilst adding how it was important that a paper goes forward to Court of Common Council with a firm proposal from this Committee.

During the discussion that followed, Members were supportive of the proposal to include Markets in the name of the Port Health and Environmental Services Committee, whilst agreeing a need for proper consideration of the proposal.

The Deputy Chairman added how all Members had understood the spirit of what had been proposed in wanting to include Markets in the name of Port Health and Environmental Services Committee. The Deputy Chairman proposed delegated authority be granted to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman, and to include consultation with Members of Port Health and Environmental Services Committee.

Tijs Broeke, seconded by Andrien Meyers, confirmed their withdrawal of the motion to amend the name of Port Health and Environmental Services Committee.

Sir Michael Snyder, seconded by Randall Anderson, proposed a motion to add a recommendation that delegated authority be granted to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman, and to consult with Members of the Port Health and Environmental Services Committee to consider and approve the renaming of Port Health and Environmental Services Committee to include Markets.

A vote followed on the motion, with 1 Member voting to the contrary, there being 1 abstention and with all other Members offering the support for the motion. The motion was carried.

The Chairman concluded the item and thanked Members for the debate. With the views of Policy and Resources Committee now being known it was hoped the item can now go forward to Court of Common Council to take a final decision. The Chairman proposed moving to a vote on the amended substantive motion as presented by Alderman Hailes.

A vote followed, with 17 Members voting in support of the recommendations and there being 2 abstentions. The recommendations, as amended by Alderman Tim Hailes, were carried.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Note the findings of independent review into project-related Member governance set out in Appendix 1.
- Approve the following recommendations:
 1. Service committees are recognised as the sponsoring body for projects and responsible for taking decisions about the delivery of individual projects with the exception of projects over £100m which fall under the authority of the Capital Buildings Board.
 2. The existing capital projects over £100m will remain the remit of the Capital Buildings Board supported by any sub-Group it may establish.
 3. The Museum of London new museum project is not a Corporation project and as such oversight remains with the New Museum Board and any funding issues managed through the tri-partite meetings.

4. Changes to the terms of reference for Operational, Property and Projects Sub-Committee (OPPSC), including a revised name, as set out in the revised sub-Appendix A to establish it as the oversight body for the new portfolio management approach.
5. Reporting line for OPPSC should be to a single grand committee namely, the Finance Committee, and subsequent changes to the to the terms of reference for Policy & Resources Committee (sub-Appendix B) and Finance Committee (sub-Appendix F).
6. Changes to the CBB terms of reference as set out in the revised sub-Appendix C.
7. The dissolution of the Markets Board and the transfer of its responsibilities to the Port Health and Environmental Services Committee (PHESC) and the subsequent changes to the PHESC terms of reference as set out in sub-Appendix D.
8. To delegate authority to the Town Clerk to consider the renaming of the Port Health and Environmental Services Committee, to include 'Markets', in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of Policy & Resources Committee, and to consult with Members of the Port Health and Environmental Services Committee.
9. Changes to the terms of reference of the Resource Allocation Sub-Committee to grant it responsibility for Operational Property, as set out in sub-Appendix E.
10. The continuation of the Barking Reach Group with an amendment to its terms of reference to include two Members with relevant experience and expertise, to be co-opted annually by the Barking Reach Group.

b) **Project Governance Review - key findings and proposals for new approach**

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Operating Officer responding to the findings of the Project Governance Review and seeking approval of a proposal to introduce a portfolio management approach that would look to provide a greater level of assurance to Members regarding the delivery of strategic objectives, allocation of resources and management of strategic risks and issues.

A Member, also Chairman of Finance Committee, suggested the delegation proposed in relation to the Project Procedure should include the Chairman of Finance Committee given the single line of reporting moving forward, with the Deputy Chairman offering his endorsement of this proposal.

A Member remarked on finding the report difficult to follow, with there being a huge amount of information and that moving forward of there being a need to present information more clearly. There was a risk of Members getting too close to operational matters and stressed their role being to provide strategic oversight and scrutiny, not getting involved in operational matters and spending too much time looking into the detail.

Henry Colthurst proposed a motion, seconded by Alderman Tim Hailes, that the recommendation that delegated authority be granted to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of Policy and Resources Committee, to amend the project procedure, should include the Chairman of Finance Committee.

The motion received the unanimous support of Members. The motion was carried. The Chairman confirmed moving to the substantive recommendations, as amended by Henry Colthurst.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Note the findings of the externally led Project Governance Review set out in this report and in Appendix 1.
- Note proposals for the creation of an Enterprise Portfolio Management Office as part of an integrated Commercial, Change and Portfolio Delivery directorate and the subsequent merger of the existing Commercial Director role with the Project Governance Director role, which has been covered by the Commercial Director since the TOM changes (01/04/2022).
- Approve option 4B of this report for the development of a portfolio management framework including the new definition of projects and programmes (as set out in paragraph 19).
- Note the current Project Procedure will be retained for a period of 3-6 months whilst detailed design work is undertaken, and the final version of the new Project Procedure will be presented to Members for decision.
- Delegate authority to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of Policy and Resources and Chairman of Finance Committee, to amend the current project procedure to incorporate the temporary measures previously approved by the Operational Property and Projects sub-Committee, namely delegation to (approved and trained) Officers to approve project-related decisions up to £1m for corporate projects and to descope routine procurements from the Project Procedure
- Note the implementation plan set out in Appendix 3.

6. **NOMINATING SUBSTITUTE MEMBERS FOR OUTSIDE BODIES ON WHICH THE CHAIR SERVES (DELEGATIONS FROM THE POLICY CHAIRMAN)**

The Committee considered a report of the Deputy Town Clerk seeking approval to the Chairman nominating a Member to be their designated replacement on different outside bodies.

A Member offered their support for the proposal, whilst adding how any final decision should be that of the Chairman rather than through a delegated decision each time. The Town Clerk clarified the position confirming that certain outside body appointments seek a formal nomination from Policy and Resources Committee and with a recommendation included that can deal with these nominations as necessary.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Endorse the proposal to allow for the Chair of Policy and Resources to nominate specific Members to either replace them on an outside body or act as their substitute, as set out in Annex 1.
- Agreed to delegate authority to the Town Clerk in consultation with the Chair and Deputy Chair of Policy and Resources to nominate replacements if any of the nominated individuals were no longer able to fulfil their role due to personal or professional commitments, as well as to make similar appointments to other outside bodies as and if identified throughout the civic year.

7. **ALLOCATING SAFER CITY PARTNERSHIP PROCEEDS OF CRIME ACT FUNDING**

The Committee considered a report of the Executive Director of Community and Children's Services seeking approval of arrangements relating to the allocation of Proceeds of Crime Act funding.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Endorse the Safer City Partnership's decision to utilise the Central Grants Unit to administer and manage Safer City Partnership Proceeds of Crime Act grants including making grant recommendations to the Safer City Partnership.
- Approve the Executive Director of Community and Children's Services (or other chief officer nominated by the Town Clerk) to formally authorise the payment of POCA grants approved by the Safer City Partnership.

8. **PROMOTION OF THE CONSIDERATE LIGHTING CHARTER**

The Committee received a report of the Executive Director of Environment in relation to a proposal to engage a consultant to undertake targeted stakeholder promotion and encourage the adoption of the Considerate Lighting Charter with City building owners, managers and occupiers.

The Chairman confirmed that the Lighting Policy had received a lot of positive media coverage when it originally went out for public consultation. It was felt that at this stage, when it was about to be endorsed by the Planning & Transportation Committee, that a strong media campaign would help get early adoption of the voluntary element of the policy, related to the Charter for existing buildings.

On reflection, however, the market interest had been positive and there was enough organic interest in this policy, which should lead to good, early adopters coming forward and building momentum amongst the property operators.

As such, Policy Initiatives Funding would no longer be needed to commission a specialist stakeholder consultant. The item was being withdrawn on this basis.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Note the withdrawal of this item.

9. **APPROACH TO THE NEXT CORPORATE PLAN**

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Strategy Officer seeking approval for a revised approach to delivering the next Corporate Plan.

A Member questioned at what point the success of outcomes included in the Corporate Plan would be reviewed to look at their impact and taking this into account as part of the consideration for any new plan. The Deputy Chairman acknowledged the importance of the City Corporation holding itself to account over delivery on Corporation Plan outcomes and key City Corporation strategies.

A Member added how they considered the previous Corporate Plan to be too light on detail and, as such, it being difficult to measure success.

The Town Clerk confirmed the intention to seek a strategic steer from Members on a new Corporate Plan and outcomes included within it, with key performance indicators being built in and ensuring alignment to the People Strategy. It would be brought forward to Members at an appropriate point to review progress and achievements.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Agreed that the next Corporate Plan be produced to cover April 2024 - March 2029, commencing on 1st April 2024.
- Agreed to the Corporate Plan 2018-23 being extended (without any additions) to end on 31st March 2024 and this recommendation being proposed for agreement at the Court of Common Council on 20th July.

10. **TARGET OPERATING MODEL - FINAL REPORT**

The Committee received a report of the Chief Strategy Officer providing an update on the Target Operating Model programme.

The Chairman confirmed this report follows the interim Target Operating Model report received by Policy and Resources Committee in February. The Chairman confirmed his decision to withdraw this item after it had been brought to his attention that the timing of this report may, albeit wholly unintentionally, send a negative and potentially insensitive message to those who were currently going through Target Operating Model implementation. A decision would be taken in consultation with the Town Clerk as to when this paper should return to Policy and Resources Committee.

A Member remarked on it being an important report, with lessons to be learned and in ensuring these were going to be embedded at the City Corporation moving forward. The Member added how the morale of staff was at rock bottom, with this report referring to roles and jobs that were currently at risk. Caution was expressed at rolling out a staff survey due to staff fatigue, with staff feeling as though they were not being heard. There was a need to think of the health and wellbeing of staff, with staff being the City Corporation's greatest asset but not

currently feeling it. The Member confirmed that they would like to see a report come back for detailed discussion. The Member stressed how names should not be put into the public domain when reporting.

The Chairman remarked on the intention of the report being to bring an end to the constant reporting on the Target Operating Model, but whilst noting that certain departments had been badly impacted by and were still working through implementation it had been considered appropriate to allow the report and its conclusions to go through all relevant forums before coming back to this committee at its conclusion.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Note the withdrawal of this item.

11. POLICY LEADS QUARTERLY REPORT OF ACTIVITIES

The Committee received a report of the Deputy Town Clerk providing a quarterly update and setting out the activities undertaken by Policy Leads during the previous quarter.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Receive the report and note its content.

12. POLICY AND RESOURCES CONTINGENCY / DISCRETIONARY FUNDS

The Committee received a report of the Chamberlain providing a schedule of projects and activities which have received funding from the Policy Initiatives Fund (PIF), the Policy and Resources Committee's Contingency Fund and Committee's Project Reserve for 2023/24 and future years with details of expenditure in 2023/24.

RESOLVED: That Members: -

- Receive the report and note its content.

13. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

There were no questions.

14. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT

The Chairman was very sorry to have to report to the Committee the very sad news of the death of a City of London Academy Islington pupil on Friday night.

The Chairman added how he knew that all Members of the Committee would wish to join him in sending their thoughts to the family and friends of those involved as well as to the wider school community.

The Chairman confirmed that he was not able to say more at this time.

15. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED: That under Section 100(A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of the Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

16. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**

- a) The non-public minutes of the Capital Buildings Board meeting on 20 April 2023 were noted.
- b) The draft non-public minutes of the Capital Buildings Board meeting on 10 May 2023 were noted.
- c) To consider the non-public minutes of the informal meeting of Members of Resource Allocation Sub-Committee on Thursday 22 June and Friday 23 June 2023.

17. **PROPOSAL TO TRANSFER THE BARKING REACH SITE FROM BARKING POWER LIMITED TO CITY OF LONDON CORPORATION**

The Committee considered a report of the Chamberlain relating to a proposal to transfer the Barking Reach Site from Barking Power Ltd to City of London Corporation.

18. **BASTION HOUSE/MUSEUM OF LONDON SITE - 140-150 LONDON WALL - STRIP OUT WORKS AND APPLICATION FOR NEW CERTIFICATE OF IMMUNITY FROM LISTING (CITY FUND)**

The Committee considered a report of the City Surveyor relating to Bastion House/Museum of London Site – 140-150 London Wall - Strip out works and application for new certificate of immunity from listing.

19. **ST LAWRENCE JEWRY CHURCH - EXTENSION TO MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING**

The Committee considered a report of the City Surveyor relating to St Lawrence Jewry Church Extension of Memorandum of Understanding.

20. **FINANCE FOR GROWTH: A ROADMAP**

The Committee received a report of the Director of Innovation and Growth providing an update on Finance for Growth: A Roadmap.

21. **MAJOR PROJECTS - HIGH LEVEL FORECASTS AND CASH FLOW**

The Committee received a joint report of the Chamberlain and Chief Operating Officer providing an update on Major Projects – High Level Forecasts and Cash Flow.

22. **DECISIONS TAKEN UNDER DELEGATED AUTHORITY OR URGENCY POWERS.**

The Committee received a report of the Deputy Town Clerk advising Members of action taken by the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman, in accordance with Standing Order Nos. 41(a) and 41(b) since the last meeting.

23. **QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

There were none.

24. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREE SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED.**

The Chairman provided an update on a City of London Police related matter.

The meeting ended at 3.40pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Polly Dunn
polly.dunn@cityoflondon.gov.uk