

Committee(s):	Date(s):
Markets Committee	30 November 2016
Streets & Walkways Sub-Committee	For Decision 6 December 2016
Subject: North – South Cycle Superhighway Phase 2: The City’s response	Public
Report of: Director of the Built Environment	For Information

Report Author: Sam Lee

Summary

TfL, on behalf of the Mayor of London, carried out a public consultation exercise on proposals to extend their North – South Cycle Superhighway to Kings Cross in early 2016. A number of major concerns were expressed by the City. However, since then, TfL has worked with City officers to improve the proposals. The current layout, which is under further consultation, addresses most of the City’s concerns but a few minor issues remain.

Officers consider that the revised proposals offer substantial safety benefits, good and safer cycling route connectivity between the Cycle Quietways and the Cycle Superhighway and provide for the much needed pedestrian crossing facilities at the Farringdon Street/West Smithfield and the Farringdon Road/Charterhouse Street junctions. However, the SMTA and the Markets and Consumer Protection Department have all expressed concern with the proposed banned left turn into West Smithfield and have met with TfL and requested that they permit this left turn during the main hours of market operation.

Officers are also concerned at the cycle lane separation as proposed at Stonecutter Street where the southbound cycle lane is proposed to become bi-directional, running alongside the northbound carriageway.

On balance, officers recommend that the City supports the proposals but also that Members agree that officers should carry out further work with TfL to establish if a timed removal of the left turn ban should be permitted during key market hours and whether the cycle lane separation could be improved at Stonecutter Street .

Recommendation(s)

Members are asked to:

- Support the Mayor’s proposals, as set out in this report and Appendix 3;
- Direct officers to continue to work with TfL to establish if a timed suspension of the banned left turn is practicable during key market operating times, and also to consider how the cycle lane separation at Stonecutter Street might be improved;
- Agree that officers work with TfL to facilitate introducing the proposals using the

powers and authority, including entering into any relevant legal agreements, available to the City Corporation.

Main Report

Background

1. In March 2016, Members were informed of TfL's consultation on proposals to extend the North – South Cycle Superhighway from Stonecutter Street to Kings Cross. Appendix 1 provides a plan of these proposals in the City.
2. The City Corporation expressed some fundamental local concerns over these proposals. The main issues were:-
 - a. the proposals did not address the existing danger which results in a high number of pedal cycle collisions;
 - b. poor provision for cyclists interchanging with the Cycle Quietways;
 - c. the lack of appreciation of lorry movements associated with Smithfield Market;
 - d. the lack of appropriate pedestrian facilities;
 - e. concerns regarding the arrangement at Stonecutter Street
3. Members therefore agreed that officers should continue to engage with TfL to ensure that the best possible outcome could be achieved for the City.
4. Since then TfL and City officers have been working together to develop and improve the proposals. As part of this, further engagements with key City stakeholders such as the Smithfield Market Traders Association, Market Superintendent and the Museum of London, have also taken place to ensure that their needs are captured and accommodated where ever possible.

Current Position

5. On 2nd November 2016, TfL, on behalf of the Mayor, launched a further consultation on revised proposals for the Farringdon Street/West Smithfield junction. A copy of the consultation is provided in Appendix 2. The response deadline is 13th December 2016.
6. Officers consider that TfL's revised proposals have significantly improved over those previously presented and addressed many of your officer's concerns, particularly around safety and cycle connectivity. However, a few concerns

remain, particularly the diversionary routes for traffic seeking to access a small number of businesses located in the south-western corner of the market or Snow Hill.

TfL's Proposals

7. TfL's current proposals for the Farringdon Street junction with West Smithfield are shown in Appendix 3 and include:-
 - a. Signalisation of the junction, but also include a banned left turn into West Smithfield for motor vehicles.
 - b. A new pedestrian "green man" crossing over Farringdon Street and a raised "uncontrolled" pedestrian crossing over West Smithfield/Snow Hill.
 - c. Mostly segregated cycle lanes on each side of Farringdon Street including bus stop by-passes and amendments to the bridge protection measures under Holborn Viaduct to maximise the carriageway space.
8. Other measures which are proposed and relevant to the City include:-
 - a. A full pedestrian "green man" crossing facility at the Farringdon Road/Charterhouse Street junction.
 - b. A banned right turn into Charterhouse Street (west) for southbound traffic.
 - c. Retaining the split of the bi-directional cycle track at the Stonecutter Street junction.
9. Detailed concept plans of the proposals are shown in Appendix 3. The impact of the revised proposals have also been traffic modelled by TfL and they claim that there are virtually no adverse impacts on traffic, buses and cycling journey times and that there is a significant improvement for pedestrians through the provisions of five signalled crossings. This assessment is also shown in the table in Appendix 2.
10. A road safety audit of the March 2016 scheme has been carried out and a copy of this is shown provided in Appendix 4. A further audit of the revised proposals at the West Smithfield junction is currently being carried out and will be made available to the City once completed.

Key Benefits and Issues

11. The revised proposals provide many positive benefits but also raise some concerns. The benefits include:-
 - a. The signalisation of the West Smithfield junction will control all conflicting movements and provide a much better and safer cycling interchange between the Cycle Superhighway and the Cycle Quietway.
 - b. In the last 3 years (to March 2016), there have been 17 injury collisions which have resulted in 19 casualties at the West Smithfield junction. Six of these were serious. TfL has estimated that 15 of these collisions

would have been avoided with the revised proposals. Appendix 5 provides further details of the collision assessment at this junction.

- c. At the Farringdon Road/Charterhouse Street junction, there have been 15 collisions (resulting in 18 injuries) in the last 3 years (to March 2016). Two of these were serious. TfL's accident analysis suggests that the current proposals would have avoided three of these collisions and with a further 9 having a greater chance of being avoided. See Appendix 6 (TfL's accident analysis of the Charterhouse Street junction) for further details of this assessment.
 - d. Farringdon Street by West Smithfield is currently very wide (about 16 metres) and being a major highway, is very highly trafficked. It is also on a pedestrian desire line. The pedestrian "green man" crossing facility over Farringdon Street will therefore provide significant improvement for pedestrians, especially those with mobility or sight impairments.
 - e. The signalisation of the West Smithfield junction will provide gaps in the traffic flow and, together with the pedestrian island, will provide pedestrians with better opportunities to cross over West Smithfield. The raised carriageway will provide further benefits for those with mobility impairments and reduce approaching traffic speeds.
 - f. The current Farringdon Road/Charterhouse junction has no formal pedestrian facilities. Pedestrians have been asking for a better facility for a long time. The analysis also identified five pedestrian injury collisions. The proposal to provide "green man" crossing on all arms of the junction would therefore be a very valuable benefit.
 - g. The proposal for the Cycle Superhighway is very much in line with the Museum of London's aspirations to make the museum the most accessible museum for all modes of transport but particularly for pedestrians and cyclists. The pedestrian crossings and cycling proposals would therefore substantially deliver this aspiration for the Museum.
12. The main concerns relate to the two banned turns and the retention of the cycle lane separation at Stonecutter Street.
- a. The banned left turn (for motor vehicles) into West Smithfield for southbound traffic.

TfL consider this is necessary to enable the signalisation of the junction to work effectively and safely. Although not an existing collision problem, it will remove the risk of the common "left hook" collision between motor vehicles and pedal cyclists. To accommodate the left turn, the introduction of either, an additional traffic lane, traffic light sequence or omission of a bus stop by-pass would be required. However, in this layout, there is insufficient width to accommodate another traffic lane and an additional traffic light sequence is likely to add to considerable and unacceptable delays on the network for TfL. Removing the bus stop by-pass would offer no cycling improvements which is not consistent with TfL's overall scheme objectives.

- b. The banned right turn at the Farringdon Road into Charterhouse Street (west).

This is necessary for safety and capacity reasons. It removes the risk of conflict with some traffic including cyclists.

13. To assess the traffic impacts of the ban turns, traffic surveys at locations agreed with the SMTA and the Market Superintendent have been carried out. A summary of the assessment is provided in Appendix 7 and 8. This shows traffic turning left at West Smithfield to be very low compared to the flows on the other arms. The average weekday left turn is 465 vehicles over 24 hours (lower during the weekend) and during the main market operating hours (midnight to 8am), the average total number of left turning vehicles is 201 over 8 hours or 25 vehicles per hour.
14. The SMTA and the Markets and Consumer Protection Department have both expressed concern with the banned left turn, as this would send more traffic to travel around the market. Their concerns are that this would add further congestion to an already congested network, safety implications and would result in a much longer diversion for some traders. An ability to enable the left turn during peak market activities (e.g. between 9pm – 5am) has been suggested but currently not supported by TfL because they consider this will introduce additional road danger.
15. The level of southbound right turning traffic into Charterhouse Street (west) is also low when compared to the other movements. The average daily (24hrs) weekday flow is 1,820 vehicles. A summary of the traffic flows around the Market are shown in Appendix 8. A full set of traffic count data can be supplied to Members on request.
16. The nearest and simplest diversionary routes for both banned turns would be to turn left into Charterhouse Street (east) and to proceed around the market. Alternatively, traffic can continue down Farringdon Street and then turn left or right at Ludgate Circus and then use other City streets to reach their destination. There are also other good diversionary routes available further north, such as using Rosebury Avenue, the Inner Ring Road, and other streets. These routes would be more appropriate for some of the diverted traffic. Appendix 9 provides a map of the diversionary routes.
17. At the Stonecutter Street junction, the bi-directional cycle track separates to enable the cycle lanes to be on each side of the street. See Appendix 3 for details. However, some local concerns regarding the safety and convenience of this layout, particularly for pedestrians crossing still remain.

Corporate & Strategic Implications

18. The proposals accord fully with many of the City's strategic and corporate policy objectives. The proposals should also lead to a reduction in casualties within the City.

Implications

19. TfL are the strategic and traffic authority for London and Farringdon Street. Therefore, they will be exercising their powers in relation to most of the proposals. However, they may also request the City to exercise some its highway and traffic powers. For example, the making of Traffic Regulation Orders, and in these circumstances, the City will retain its right to determine the outcome of any objections based on their merit.
20. There will also be a need to enter into relevant legal agreements or amendments of existing agreements, for example, under s.8 of the Highways Act 1980 (providing for agreements between local authorities in relation to certain highway works).
21. There are no financial implications for the City as TfL has agreed to cover all of our costs.

Conclusion

22. Since earlier this year, TfL has been actively engaging with the City Corporation to improve their North-South Cycle Superhighway proposals.
23. The current proposals offer substantial safety benefits, good and safer cycle route connectivity between the Cycle Quietways and Cycle Superhighway, and provide much needed pedestrian crossing facilities. There are some access concerns relating to the banned turns and the separation of the cycle lane at Stonecutter Street. Overall officers believe that the reduced road danger and other benefits outweigh the concerns as set out above.
24. It is therefore recommended that the City supports the Mayor's proposals. However, directs officers to continue to work with TfL to establish if a timed suspension of the banned left turn is practicable during key market operating times, and establish if it is possible to improve the cycle lane separation at Stonecutter Street.

Appendices

- Appendix 1 – Original March 2016 proposals
- Appendix 2 – TfL's November 2016 consultation material
- Appendix 3 – Detailed concept plans
- Appendix 4 – Road Safety Audit
- Appendix 5 - TfL's injury collision assessment at the Farringdon Street/West Smithfield junction.
- Appendix 6 - TfL's injury collision assessment at the Farringdon Road/Charterhouse Street junction.
- Appendix 7 – TfL's traffic count assessment
- Appendix 8 – Plan of traffic flows around the market.

- Appendix 9 – Map of diversionary routes

Background Papers:

- Report and minutes of the Director of the Built Environment on TfL's consultation on proposals to extend the North – South Cycle Superhighway from Stonecutter Street to Kings Cross. March 2016

Sam Lee

Acting Group Manager, Network Performance
Department of the Built Environment

T: 020 7332 1921

E: sam.lee@cityoflondon.gov.uk